



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

June 2, 2021

HPCA-21-00055

Agenda Item: VI. D. 4.
Case Number: HPCA-21-00055
Property Address: 706 NW 24th Street
District: Paseo Historic District
Owner: Brent Bowles
706 NW 24th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73103

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

2. Replace bathroom window (elective);
4. Replace front door (elective); and
6. Replace front porch railing (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 24th between Lee and N Guernsey Avenues.

2. Site History

Date of Construction: 1918

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1998

National Register Listing: 2004

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:

706 Northwest 24th, 1919. This one-story Bungalow/Craftsman style residence has a cross-gable roof and a porch roof supported by three battered wood columns on stone slabs on brick piers. Two sets of triplet windows on façade.

Additional Information:

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 1-story frame dwelling with 1-story front porch extending the entire length of the front (north) façade. A 1-story frame "autohouse" is indicated near the easternmost property line with the front face back nearly $\frac{3}{4}$ of the property depth from the front property line. All structures have shingle roofs. The 1955 edition illustration composition shingles at all structures.

3. Existing Conditions

This work has been done but must be reviewed as if it had not. The Commission reviewed this application previously and continued it for additional information.

4. Previous Actions

None.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

1. Item 4, Replace front door (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes replacement of a non-historic wood panel door with a Craftsman style, fiberglass door to fit the existing opening.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.5 Doors and Entries

Policy: Doors and entrances are important aspects of the architectural character of a building. Historic doors and entries should be retained and preserved.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, pattern and size of doors contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the style and period of the building.

- 3.5.4: The design of replacement doors shall be based on historic documentation, if available, and shall reflect the style and period of the building. Replacement doors shall be compatible with historic doors in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.
 - 3.5.5: Preserve existing historic door openings, do not enlarge or diminish to fit stock door sizes.
 - 3.5.6: Unless documentation is provided to demonstrate other materials were historically used on a building, primary (usually the front door) entrance doors shall be wood.
- c. Considerations: The design of the proposed door is compatible with the structure but does not meet relevant Guidelines for materials. Front doors are required to be wood unless another material was used historically.
 - d. Recommended Specific Findings:
 1. That the existing door is non-historic;
 2. That the historic door is no longer extant;
 3. That the proposed door design is compatible with the historic character of the dwelling;
 4. That wood primary entrance doors are required.

1. Item 2, Replace bathroom window (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes sash replacement at the bathroom window. The proposed window is wood and fits the existing opening. The applicant proposes to remove the glass, install clear glass, and apply an opaque film to the interior of the glass.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

- 3.6.5: Original or historic windows more than 50% DETERIORATED BEYOND REPAIR may be replaced in kind.
 - 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
 - 3.6.9: If original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile.
 - 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.
 - 3.6.17: Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass are not permitted in windows, except that special glass, for example, patterned, leaded or colored glass, can be used in transoms and sidelights when appropriate as established by the architectural style and the specific history of the building for which the special glass is proposed.
 - 3.6.4: The application of ultraviolet (UV) film to window glazing is the least costly option for reducing heat gain from sunlight and may be an acceptable addition to window glass. UV filters can have a service life of ten or more years; when replacement of the film is required, great care must be taken not damage to historic glass and framing.
 - 3.6.18: A new window may have a low emissivity coating applied to clear glass provided that the visible light transmittance is not less than .74 and the overall reflectance is not more than 17%.
- c. Considerations: Clear glass is required when replacing windows deteriorated beyond repair. UV film must provide a visible light transmittance no less than .74 and limit overall reflectance to not more than 17%. The Guidelines do not appear to provide for opaque glass and does not provide an etched glass appearance.
- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That wood windows matching the historic window and fitting the historic opening are appropriate when a window is deteriorated beyond repair;
 2. That clear glass is required.

2. Item 6, Replace porch railing (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to recreate a railing at the front porch that is very similar to the previously existing condition.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

Porch Elements – Columns & Railings, Ceiling & Flooring, Stairs

- 3.3.11: If more than 50% of a material or component is deteriorated beyond repair, replacement may be required. When new materials may be introduced, there are likely sustainability considerations.
 - 3.3.12: New or replacement columns should be of materials appropriate to the style and design of the building including the porch. Replacement columns should match the original or historic columns in size, design, scale, massing, materials and details.
 - 3.3.13: The dimensions and proportions of replacement balusters must match the historic porch. The spacing and height of railing balusters is important to the character of the historic building with typically closely spaced balusters and relatively low railings (30” or less in height). Although this height may not conform with current codes, existing historic railings are permitted to remain until they are too deteriorated to be retained and repaired, therefore it is critical to retain the historic porch balustrade and railings.
 - 3.3.14: The use of alternative materials for porch columns on primary facades such as fiberglass may be approved by the Commission if the finished appearance will be indistinguishable from the appearance, design, and texture of the original or historic columns.
 - 3.3.15: Porch columns of vinyl or hollow core aluminum, or wrought iron are not appropriate unless historic documentation demonstrates otherwise.
- c. Considerations: The proposed railing appears very similar to the historic railing. Replacement railings must be wood and must be painted.
- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That dimensions and proportions of replacement balusters must match the historic porch;
 2. That spacing and height of the railing is important to the character of the building;
 3. That the proposed railing appears very similar to the previously existing railing.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2010 as referenced below:*

E. HPCA-21-00055 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve Item 6, replace porch rail**, with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That dimensions and proportions of replacement balusters must match the historic porch;
 2. That spacing and height of the railing is important to the character of the building;
 3. That the proposed railing appears very similar to the previously existing railing.
2. **Approve Item 4, replace front door**, with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the existing door is non-historic;
 2. That the historic door is no longer extant;
 3. That the proposed door design is compatible with the historic character of the dwelling;
 4. That wood primary entrance doors are required.
3. **Approve Item 2, replace bathroom window, with the following conditions**, with the specific findings that the proposed work, with the **agreed-upon conditions**, will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; the items comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That wood windows matching the historic window and fitting the historic opening are appropriate when a window is deteriorated beyond repair;
2. That clear glass is required;
3. That the application of a film that simulates an etched appearance may not be appropriate;
4. That the proposed film has not been documented.

Conditions:

- 1) That the clear glass must be installed in the wood window.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.
ady