



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

June 2, 2021

HPCA-21-00053

Agenda Item: VI. C. 1.

Case Number: HPCA-21-00053

Property Address: 820 NW 39th Street

District: Crown Heights Historic District

Applicant: Classic Contracting
Jim Olivas
217 NE 36th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73105

Owner: Cynthia Brundige
820 NW 39th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73118

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

3. Replace window (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 39th Street, mid-block between Shartel and Western.

2. Site History

Date of Construction: 1934

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: CH 1977

National Register Listing: CH 1995

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:

820 Northwest 39th, C. 1937. This two-story, brick and half-timber Tudor Revival residence has a steeply pitched, hipped roof with cross-gables, and slightly overhanging, open eaves. The shingles are wood. The asymmetrical façade features double-hung windows of various sizes and a wood plank door. A porte-cochere is incorporated on the east end. The entrance is accented by an elaborate brick pattern. A brick chimney is located on the façade and the garage is detached.

Additional Information:

The 1950 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 2-story, brick veneered dwelling with a 1-story side porch on the east that extends approximately $\frac{3}{4}$ the depth of

the dwelling. A 1-story, frame, “autohouse” is illustrated approximately 2/3 the depth of the property back from the front property line. All structures are indicated with wood roofs. No changes are indicated in the 1955 edition.

The county records illustrate an addition to the west side of the garage. Date of construction is not indicated. The feature appears to serve the pool in the back yard, also date unknown.

3. Existing Conditions

The proposed location for the window on the west side of the garage is currently occupied by a 2’ by 3’ opening with window. The window appears to be a fairly early edition of aluminum windows.

4. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-21-00053	04/05/2021	Cynthia Brundige	Approved
1) Replace French doors and sidelites in kind (elective);2) Replace garage door (elective).			

Other actions, such as variances, other approvals, citations could also be described here.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2010.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2010 as referenced below:*

1. Item 3, Replace window (elective).

- Description:** The applicant proposes the replacement of an existing window on the west side of the garage addition. The proposed window is a thermal pane wood window with 6/6 simulated divided lite. The window has interior and exterior, permanently attached grills with spacer bars between the glass. Glass is clear.
- References:** *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

Policy: Windows and shutters are important character-defining features of a building and originals should be retained and kept in good repair. Awnings may be an intended permanent character defining feature such as wood framed and

finished with roof shingles to match the rest of the building or temporary such as contemporary fabric awnings with aluminum frames.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, positioning, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the architectural style and period of the building. Their design, details and craftsmanship make them worthy of preservation. The presence or absence of shutters and awnings are significant to the visual character of a building.

Sustainability Justification: Many buildings in historic districts retain old-growth wood windows which can last indefinitely if they are properly maintained, unlike new-growth wood or vinyl windows. In most cases, windows account for less than one-fourth of a home's heat loss. Insulating the attic, walls and basement is a more economical approach to reducing energy costs than replacing historic windows. Proper maintenance and sealing of windows, along with adding storm windows, keeps windows out of landfills and enhances a building's energy efficiency year round.

- 3.6.5: Original or historic windows more than 50% DETERIORATED BEYOND REPAIR may be replaced in kind.
- 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
- 3.6.9: If original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile.
- 3.6.10: New windows made of aluminum clad wood with enameled finish may be appropriate as replacements for historic wood windows since these may have acceptable sustainable qualities and closely resemble a painted finish.
- 3.6.11: Vinyl is not an environmentally sustainable material, and the installation of vinyl-clad wood windows or entirely vinyl framed windows is not appropriate and will not be approved for the historic districts.
- 3.6.12: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glazing) windows are acceptable as replacement windows when the historic windows in a building have been previously removed. When used, thermal pane windows must have true divided lites.
- 3.6.13: A thermal pane window may be appropriate for replacement of a historic wood or metal window when the existing window frame and sash parts are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair. To replace a historic window with a new unit a window survey including a photograph of the interior and exterior of the unit must be provided to substantiate the condition of the window. Historic windows visible from the public-right-of-way must be retained and repaired or replaced in kind, including replication of muntins

pattern and profile.

- 3.6.15: Muntins sandwiched between layers of glass, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins are not appropriate and shall not be used.
- 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.
- 3.6.17: Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass are not permitted in windows, except that special glass, for example, patterned, leaded or colored glass, can be used in transoms and sidelights when appropriate as established by the architectural style and the specific history of the building for which the special glass is proposed.
- 3.6.18: A new window may have a low emissivity coating applied to clear glass provided that the visible light transmittance is not less than .74 and the overall reflectance is not more than 17%.

c. Considerations: The proposed window appearance may be consistent with the age and style of the primary dwelling. As the window is located within an addition, the proposed window is consistent with materials for new construction, but simulated divided lite is not considered appropriate within historic structures. The age of the addition to the garage is not known. The existing window may be indicative of the age of the addition. As the addition is not visible from the public rights of way, it is not likely that the addition or the window have gained historic significance.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the window in the addition to the garage is not visible from the public right of way;
2. That the existing window has not gained historic significance though it may be indicative of the age of the addition to the garage;
3. That the proposed window would meet criteria for windows in new construction as a wood window with insulated, clear glass, and all components of acceptable simulated divided lite windows;
4. That the window opening will not change.

E. HPCA-21-00053 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve Item 3, Replace window (elective), with Unique Circumstances** with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; that the following **unique circumstances** exist; that the items do not strictly comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines or are not addressed by them, but are nonetheless consistent with the spirit and intent of the Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the window in the addition to the garage is not visible from the public right of

way;

2. That the existing window has not gained historic significance though it may be indicative of the age of the addition to the garage;
3. That the proposed window would meet criteria for windows in new construction as a wood window with insulated, clear glass, and all 3 components of acceptable simulated divided lite windows;
4. That the window opening will not change.

Unique Circumstances:

- 1) That the window replacement takes place within the confines of a non-historic addition to the secondary garage structure that is not visible from the public rights of way;
- 2) That the addition to the garage and its components have gained no historic significance.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2010 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

ady