



# STAFF REPORT

## Historic Preservation Commission

June 2, 2021

HPCA-21-00040

---

**Agenda Item:** VI.D.2.

**Case Number:** HPCA-21-00040

**Property Address:** 524 NW 16th Street

**District:** Mesta Park Historic District

**Owner:** Garrett Moore  
524 NW 16th Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73103

### A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

2. Construct garage (elective).

### B. BACKGROUND

#### 1. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 16<sup>th</sup> Street, between Walker and Dewey.

#### 2. Site History

*Date of Construction:* 1910

*Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark:* 1994

*National Register Listing:* 1983

*Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:*

None.

*Additional Information:*

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 2-story frame dwelling with 1-story front porch extending the entire length of the front (north) façade and a 2-story, inset porch at the back at the southwest corner. A 1-story frame “autohouse” is indicated near the westernmost property line with the front face back nearly 2/3 of the property depth from the front property line. All structures have shingle roofs, typically wood, other than the back porch which is composition. No changes are indicated on subsequent editions of the maps.

County records indicate a remodel circa 1984 which may date the enclosure of the back porch and the addition of the attached garage at the southeast corner of the structure.

#### 3. Existing Conditions

The existing garage appeared consistent with the historic garage and was approved for demolition in April 2021 due to deterioration. The structure was 18 by 20 feet for a total

footprint of 360 square feet. The garage was a single-story structure. A second, non-historic, attached garage is located on the east side of the dwelling with the overhead doors facing the back yard (south).

#### **4. Previous Actions**

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

<b>Case Number</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>Owner</b>	<b>Decision</b>
HPCA-14-00115	06/05/2014	Eric & Stephanie Schroeder	Approved
Replace roof at house and garage.			
HPCA-19-00011	02/11/2019	Stephanie Schroeder	Approved
Replace driveway in kind.			
HPCA-21-00040	04/22/2021	Garrett Moore	Approved
Demolish garage.			
HPCA-21-00040	04/22/2021	Garrett Moore	Approved
Widen driveway and install driveway gate.			

Other actions, such as variances, other approvals, citations could also be described here.

#### **C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE**

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2010.\**

None.

#### **D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS**

*This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2010\* as referenced below:*

##### **1. Item 2 Construct garage (elective).**

- a. Description: The applicant proposes construction of a replacement garage on the location of the 360 square foot historic garage previously approved for demolition. The proposed garage has an approximate footprint of 680 square feet and is 2 stories tall. The dimensions are 25 by 27 by 24 feet tall.

Proposed materials include architectural grade shingle, coated aluminum gutters and downspouts, smooth HardiePlank lap siding and soffits and trim, aluminum clad windows, a wood pedestrian door, and a double wide, wood panel overhead door. Coach lights are proposed at overhead door and pedestrian door. The design

components of the overhead door include the wide framed, recessed panels with glass in the upper row. As a double door, the panels are 4 by 8. No fenestration is proposed on the west or south due to pools in the abutting yards.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

#### 4.1 General Requirements for New Construction and Additions

**Policy:** New construction and additions should not destroy historic materials or general features that characterize a historic building, property or district. New work should be differentiated from existing, historic structures and protect the historic integrity of the property and the historic district. Additions to historic structures should be done so that the historic character of the structure is retained and, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original structure and site would be unimpaired.

**Design Justification:** New construction and its integration with an existing building, property or district should be compatible with surrounding existing historic architecture. Compatibility may include the size, shape, massing and materials of new construction. The relationship of new construction form to the historic context in which it is located is critical for maintaining visual character of a historic building, property or district.

**Sustainability Justification:** Effective resource conservation includes consideration of the renewability of resources, the manufacturing processes used to create the materials and the recycled construction materials, energy costs associated in the manufacture and shipping of construction materials, and the ways selected materials can help make the new building, as a whole, energy efficient.

- 4.1.1: Over the next decade it is expected that 25% of new commercial and institutional buildings and 20% of new residences will qualify as "green." Green buildings may be certified under the Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) program, a trademarked system under which buildings are awarded points in five categories: 1) sustainable sites, 2) water efficiency, 3) energy and atmosphere, 4) indoor environmental quality, and 5) innovation and design process.
- 4.1.2: New construction, which may include a new, stand-alone primary or accessory building, a new garage, an addition to an existing building or a substantial renovation to an existing building, should be designed to take the five LEED categories into consideration.
- 4.1.3: Significant alteration of the topography of a property through extensive grading, removal or alteration of rolled terraces and similar character-defining features, filling or excavating, is not permitted.
- 4.1.4: Refer to Chapter 3, "Alterations to Building Fabric and Components of Historic Building," for items, components, features or materials planned for new construction or additions that may not be addressed by this Chapter.

#### 4.4 Garages

**Policy:** The retention of existing, historic garages is encouraged. A historic garage should be refurbished and modified instead of demolished or replaced to accommodate contemporary lifestyle requirements. New garages are permitted where a house does not have a garage or where a new garage is necessary. As with other accessory buildings, garages should have their own form and should generally appear as secondary structures and not visually overwhelm or compete with the other historic buildings of the property or district.

**Design Justification:** The way in which a new garage relates to other historic buildings of a property is important in historic districts. A new garage directly affects the integrity of the property as a whole. For this reason, a new garage should not detract from the historic character of the property.

**Sustainability Justification:** New garage construction should adhere to principles of sustainability in materials, design, and energy efficiency.

- 4.4.3: Construction of a new or replacement garage should follow the historic setback for a garage on the property or setback patterns of other garages in the streetscape or historic district.
- 4.4.4: Historic garages in Oklahoma City's historic districts are predominantly detached, and attached garages are not appropriate unless documentation demonstrates their previous historic existence at the property.
- 4.4.5: Construction of a replacement garage shall approximate the original configuration, form, massing, style, placement and detail of the former garage as described by photographic or other documentation.
- 4.4.6: Construction of a replacement garage may reasonably expand beyond the footprint of a historic one- or two- car garage, up to a total footprint of 450 square feet or 5% of the lot, whichever is greater, in order to accommodate a standard size parking space for up to two vehicles. Additional factors including the level of visibility of a new garage and the size and massing of surrounding structures may be considered.
- 4.4.7: Design a new garage to be secondary to that of a property's main historic building.
- 4.4.8: When no photographic or other documentation of a previous garage is available, a new garage should be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to the primary building and should relate to similar garages within the historic district, as appropriate.
- 4.4.9: Materials used for a new garage should reflect the property's historical development and the use and function of the garage. Materials used for the exterior facades of a garage were often different (and less costly) than those used for the primary building.
- 4.4.10: A garage may be of 'modest' or 'high-style' design to complement a

property's historical development. Often, a new garage should be modest with a simple rectangular plan and form and a low-pitched, gabled or hipped roof. Doors and windows may have little or no ornamentation.

- 4.4.11: When no photographic or other documentation is available, A new one-story garage should be similar in height to other similar, historic one-story garages in the streetscape and historic district. A new two-story garage should be similar in height to the historic two-story garages of adjacent properties, in the streetscape and of the historic district.
- 4.4.12: When no photographic or other documentation of a previous historic garage is available, a replacement garage may be two-stories tall when the original or historic garage was two-stories, or if located in a block where two-story or one and a half story garages are dominant or occur on abutting property. New garages in blocks that contain only one-story garages shall be one-story.
- 4.4.13: In locations where two-story garages are not allowed, a garage may be one and a half stories as defined in the Municipal Code so long as its design and height approximate the massing of a previous historic garage at the property, or adjacent one-story garages if no documentation of a previous historic garage is available.

#### **Garage Doors, Openings, and Doors**

- 4.4.14: Spacing and size of window and door openings in a new garage should be consistent with the historical development of the property and similar to their historic counterparts within the streetscape or historic district, as should the proportion of window to wall space.
- 4.4.17: New garage pedestrian doors in all other districts may be solid wood with wood frames or alternate door and door frame materials such as composite wood or aluminum clad wood for locations that are not visible from the public right-of-way. Otherwise pedestrian doors and frames shall be solid wood.
- 4.4.18: New garage vehicle doors in all other districts may be solid wood, wood veneer with a concealed metal frame, or composite materials including fiberglass or wood fiber (85% minimum wood fiber content). Doors should first match the historic design. When the historic design is unknown then the doors should match the design of other historic garage doors used in the respective district. A paneled design may be appropriate.
- 4.4.20: Metal garage vehicle doors with a paneled design are acceptable in the Heritage Hills East, Putnam Heights, and Shepherd districts. These doors can be used at garages that are modest in style, located at the back of the lot, and minimally visible from the street or public right-of-way. Garage vehicle doors that are highly visible from a public street including the side street of a corner lot should not be metal.

- 4.4.21: At double garages, two single garage vehicle doors should be used instead of one larger, double door. This will maintain the scale and rhythm of older structures, making a two-car garage seem smaller and more compatible with the primary building and the district.
- 4.4.22: If a historic garage is to be demolished to allow the construction of a new garage, it is encouraged that the historic doors be salvaged and re-used at the new garage, or if this is not possible, that the historic garage doors be replicated in the new garage design.
- 4.4.23: Doors at new high style garages should complement the garage in design and materials. The use of paneled wood garage doors or custom garage doors is encouraged at these locations.

#### 4.6 Exterior Materials at New Construction

**Policy:** Materials used in the construction of new buildings, additions, garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible in appearance and design with common building materials in the district, or typical of structures of the proposed style, type, age and location.

**Design Justification:** The form, materials and details of exterior walls and embellishments, as well as their scale, texture and variety, contribute to the overall character of the historic district.

**Sustainability Justification:** Materials for new exterior wall construction should be as sustainable as possible. Appropriate siding materials may include stucco, wood, brick, or cementitious siding. Vinyl and metal siding materials are not sustainable and should not be used.

##### Wall Materials

- 4.6.2: Materials for new construction should be consistent with those at other buildings within the property, block and historic district. Consideration should be given to the pattern of development of the specific property and lot.
- 4.6.3: Wood siding may be tongue and groove, shiplap, novelty or other compatible type. Board and batten may also be appropriate for use on accessory buildings; it is rarely used on primary buildings.
- 4.6.6: Cementitious siding (smooth finish) of an appropriate profile may be used at new construction of stand-alone primary buildings, garages and other accessory buildings. It may also be used for additions to historic structures.

##### Windows

- 4.6.10: Windows in additions to existing buildings must match or complement the proportion, shape, pattern, size, details and profile of the windows in the historic building. If the historic or existing windows are wood, the windows of the addition may be wood, vinyl-clad wood or aluminum-clad wood. If the historic windows or existing are steel, the windows of the addition should be steel or other compatible metal. All windows in new

additions should be of a profile similar to the windows in the historic building.

- 4.6.11: Windows in new stand-alone construction must be similar to their counterparts within the property, block or historic district. These windows may be wood, vinyl clad wood, metal clad wood, or metal with a profile similar to the windows of other buildings on the property. For new infill construction the profile must be similar to the windows used on other properties in the block or historic district.
- 4.6.12: New windows may have a simpler window pane pattern than their historic counterparts; for example, if the historic windows are 6/1 (read “six over one”), then 1/1 windows of the same overall size may be used.
- 4.6.13: Windows constructed entirely of aluminum or vinyl are not permitted, and aluminum surfaces cannot have a clear, mill or anodized finish unless supported by historic documentation for a specific property or structure.
- 4.6.14: Clear glass must be used in all windows. Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass in windows is generally not appropriate. Patterned, leaded or colored glass can be used in transoms and sidelights when established by the architectural style of the building or when supported by historical documentation for a specific property or structure.
- 4.6.15: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glass) windows are acceptable for additions or new construction. When muntins are proposed for a divided light appearance they should be “true divided lights” meaning that the thin wood framing (called ‘muntins’) completely frames and separates each piece of glass from the others.
- 4.6.16: Simulated muntins sandwiched between layers of glass in thermal windows, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins may not be used except when internal muntins are used in conjunction with permanently fixed surface-applied muntins on the interior and the exterior of the glass.

### **Doors**

- 4.6.19: Recommendations and requirements for garage type doors are described in the “Garage” section of this chapter.
- 4.6.20: Recommendations and requirements for primary entrance doors, screen doors and storm doors, and doors that are visible from the public right-of-way are the same as described for the “Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.
- 4.6.21: Swinging (French) or sliding patio doors used for new construction in the back of a new infill primary building, or new garages, accessory buildings, or new additions in the back yard and used in conjunction with sidelights may use the recommendations and requirements associated with the previous subsection of this section, “Windows,” provided that the patio doors and sidelights will match.

- 4.6.22: Pedestrian doors that are not visible from the public right-of-way may be made of alternate materials including aluminum clad wood, composite wood, and fiberglass. Doors in Heritage Hills must be of solid wood.

#### **Roof and Roofing Materials**

- 4.6.23: Wood shingles, composition shingles, slate tiles, terra cotta or clay tiles are permitted for use on roofs. Recommendations and requirements for these materials are found in the “Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.
- 4.6.26: Composition roofs should be of higher quality and are often referred to as Architectural Grade or Dimensional Grade. These shingles are usually rated as 30-, 40-, or 50-year shingles and have a thicker profile.
- 4.6.28: Multi-colored asphalt shingles and synthetic wood shingles should not be used on sloped roofs.
- 4.6.29: Historic eaves, copings, cornices, dormers and roof trim should be retained and preserved.

- c. Considerations: The proposed materials of the garage are consistent with the criteria and compatible with surrounding structures. The design components are modest and do not compete with similar historic accessory structures. The design does include a double wide garage door where the criteria suggest two single overhead doors to address scale and proportions similar to historic structures. The criteria indicates that double garages should utilize two single vehicle doors instead of one larger, double door.

The lack of windows on the south and east on wall of this size may not be appropriate. The inclusion of windows at the first floor would be only partially visible from abutting properties but would break up the walls while maintaining privacy for the abutting property owners with pools. The spacing and size of window and door openings should be similar to other historic garages within the block or district as should the proportion of window to wall space. Based on the criteria to provide compatible structures, the presence of non-historic pools may not be relevant.

The criteria for replacement garages indicate that a new garage may reasonably expand beyond the historic footprint of a garage to a total of 450 square feet or 5% of the lot, whichever is greater, to accommodate a standard size parking space for up to two vehicles. The dimensions of this site suggest that 680 is the maximum appropriate size.

The criteria further indicate that when no photographic or other documentation is available a two-story garage may be appropriate if a two-story garage abuts the property or if the site is located in a block where two-story garages are dominant. Two-story garages should be similar in height to historic two-story garage of adjacent properties in the streetscape or district. The historic garage was one story and has been documented. A two-story garage does abut the property. The proposed garage height has not been compared to similar, historic, two-story garages.

- d. Recommended Specific Findings:



1. That the historic garage was approved for demolition in April 2021 was a one-story structure and approximately 360 square feet;
2. That when the historic condition is known, a replacement garage shall approximate the original configuration, form, massing, style, placement and detail of the former garage as described by photographic documentation;
3. That construction of a replacement garage may reasonably expand beyond the footprint of a historic garage to accommodate up to two parking spaces;
4. That the maximum recommended square feet is 450 or 5% of the site;
5. That two, single car, overhead doors are recommended to address the massing and proportions of historic structures rather than a large, double, overhead door;
6. That wall to window ratios should be similar to other historic garages;
7. That the materials of the proposed garage are consistent with the criteria and compatible with surrounding structures.

**E. HPCA-21-00040 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

1. **Continue Item 2, construct garage**, with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020\*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

**Specific Findings:**

- 1) That the historic garage was approved for demolition in April 2021 was a one-story structure and approximately 360 square feet;
- 2) That when the historic condition is known, a replacement garage shall approximate the original configuration, form, massing, style, placement and detail of the former garage as described by photographic documentation;
- 3) That construction of a replacement garage may reasonably expand beyond the footprint of a historic garage to accommodate up to two parking spaces;
- 4) That the maximum recommended square feet is 450 or 5% of the site;
- 5) That two, single car, overhead doors are recommended to address the massing and proportions of historic structures rather than a large, double, overhead door;
- 6) That wall to window ratios should be similar to other historic garages;
- 7) That the materials of the proposed garage are consistent with the criteria and compatible with surrounding structures.

**Recommended Additional Documentation:**

- 1) A plan for a one-story garage similar in form, massing and detail to the historic garage;
- 2) Plans that include window placement similar to the historic garage or other similar historic garages;

- 3) Plans that include two, single sized, overhead doors where possible.

*Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.*

*\*Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

*Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2010 are available online at [www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html](http://www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html) ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9<sup>th</sup> floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.*

*ady*