



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

September 6, 2023

HPCA-23-00103

Agenda Item: VI.D.6

Case Number: HPCA-23-00103

Property Address: 930 NW 21st Street

District: Mesta Park Historic District

Applicant: Sam Gresham Architecture
Hollie Hunt
400 NW 23rd Street Suite B
Oklahoma City, OK 73103

Owner: Dana Meister
930 NW 21st Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73106

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Demolish existing carport (elective); and
2. Construct new two-story garage (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The proposal is to construct a two-story garage where a carport or highly modified garage currently exists.

2. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 21st Street, on the southeast corner of NW 21st Street and N Olie Avenue.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1919

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1994

National Register Listing: 1983

Additional Information:

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 2-story frame dwelling with 1-story front porch extending nearly the entire length of the front (north) façade and wrapping the east corner for approximately 1/3 of the façade. A small 1-story frame “autohouse” is indicated on the southwest corner abutting the alley and spanning approximately ½ of the south property line. All structures have shingle roofs. The 1920

edition of the Sanborn Insurance maps indicates the dwelling and porch roofs to be composition material. The 1955 edition indicates no further changes to the site or buildings.

4. Existing Conditions

A garage, though highly modified, currently exists at this location. Large sections of wall have been removed from at least two walls. A driveway currently exists.

5. Previous Actions

Previous applications for an Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-22-00052	08/03/2022	Harry & Dana Meister	Withdrawn
1) Construct 2-story garage and add apron (elective); and 2) Demolish carport (elective).			
HPCA-22-00034	05/04/2022	Oklahoma Natural Gas	Approved
Relocation of gas meters at multiple properties (elective).			
HPCA-14-00057	06/17/2014	Harry & Dana Meister	Approved
Replace 6 windows (elective).			

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 1, Demolish existing carport (elective).

a. Description: The applicant is requesting to demolish an existing carport/garage and build a new garage. The existing carport/garage is 415 square feet, with a storage area that is 97 square feet (total area is 512 square feet). The sides are open on the North and South elevations. The condition and age of the structure is unknown.

a. References: *Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020*
59-4250.4

L. *Demolitions.*

(1) *General Provisions.*

(a) A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for the demolition or removal of any structure within any HL or HP District. Applications for demolition permits shall be filed with the Development Services

Director, but shall not be issued unless accompanied by a Certificate of Appropriateness.

- (c) A Certificate of Appropriateness shall be required for those structures declared dilapidated by the City Council whose removal is not undertaken by the City.
- (2) *Findings and Purpose.* Demolition or removal of a historic structure constitutes an irreplaceable loss to the quality and character of the City. Therefore, a Certificate of Appropriateness shall only be granted if one of the following occurs:
- (a) As determined by the Commission, the structure is noncontributing to the historic integrity of the historic district and the demolition will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or district.
 - (b) As evaluated by the Commission based upon information including, but not limited to, reports, photographs, or inspection as part of a site visit, the structure is in a state of decay or ruin and poses an imminent threat to public health or safety and the demolition of said structure is required to alleviate said threat.
 - (d) The structure is a garage or other accessory building and meets at least one of the following criteria addressing the functionality and continued use of the historic structure in relation to the impact of a demolition on the historic character of the property and district:
 - (1) The structure is not large enough to accommodate a standard size parking space and cannot reasonably be altered to do so;
 - (2) The condition of the structure makes it physically impractical to rehabilitate without the loss of all or nearly all fabric contributing to its historic integrity;
 - (3) The structure is not original to the property;
 - (4) The structure has minimal impact upon the historic integrity of the property and district, due to factors including the structure's lack of historic integrity and significance, architectural significance, or minimal to no visibility from a public way.
- (5) *Burden of Proof.* The applicant has the burden of proof to establish, by a preponderance of evidence, the necessary facts to warrant demolition.
- (6) *Standards for Demolition Approval.* The Historic Preservation Commission shall approve the application for demolition if it finds any of the following:
- (a) The structure is noncontributing to the historic district and the demolition will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or district.
 - (b) The structure, which has not otherwise been declared a public nuisance by the City Council, poses an imminent threat to public health or safety and the demolition of said structure is required to alleviate said threat.

(c) There is "no viable economic use" of the structure as said term is defined in this section.

- b. Considerations: The carport/garage appears to be a garage that has been modified by removal of large sections of wall on at least two sides. It is located 15'4" from the west side property line on N. Olie Avenue, and appears to align with the garage to the south of the subject property. Structures proposed for demolition should be fully documented.

Demolition of a non-historic structure may have no adverse effect on the site or district. The existing structure appears to be wider than the structure depicted on the Sanborn Fire insurance maps. However, the age of the structure is unknown and actual conditions have not been established.

- c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That a highly modified garage is present;
2. That, as determined by the Commission, the structure is noncontributing to the historic integrity of the historic district and the demolition will not adversely affect the historic character of the property or district because the structure is not historic or original to the site;
3. That the structure has minimal impact upon the historic integrity of the property and district, due to factors including the structure's lack of historic integrity and significance, and/or architectural significance.

2. Item 2, Construct new two-story garage (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes the construction of a two-story, high style garage with apartment, spanning approximately $\frac{3}{4}$ of the south property line. The proposed footprint is 931 square feet which includes the proposed garage (506 square feet) and apartment (425 square feet) on the lower level. There is an additional 290 square feet on the second level. The proposed structure is approximately 21'8½" tall, 24'6" wide, and 38' deep. The existing garage, with storage area, is approximately 20'9" wide and 24'8½" deep and the total area is 512 square feet. The proposed increase is 3'9" in width and 13'3½" in depth. It appears that the proposed structure will extend to the rear property line and the side property line on N. Olie Avenue.

Two (2) overhead doors are located on the west. Two (2) pedestrian doors are located at the first floor on the north side. Brackets are located on either side of the pedestrian doors. There do not appear to be any exterior light fixtures indicated in the proposed drawings.

The existing structure is located 10 feet from the center of the alley to the south. The existing driveway is indicated as 15'4" deep, as measured from the property line, and 20' wide. The proposed garage will be constructed over the existing driveway space located within the property lines and the remaining portion of the driveway will be located in the right of way. This means that there will not be enough depth to park a car in the driveway without overhanging the public sidewalk and potentially extending beyond the curb.

Proposed materials include an architectural grade shingle, 6" wood lap siding, wood

trim, scalloped wood siding in the gable ends, and metal framed wood veneered overhead doors (painted), with recessed beadboard panels and clear glass windows in top panels with simulated divided light, 5/8” muntins.

Pedestrian doors are described as half-lite doors with a 5/8” simulated divided light and recessed lower panels. Windows are illustrated as one over one, hung, wood windows, two on the west elevation, two on the north elevation and one on the south elevation. Windows on the lower corner of north and east elevation are described as wood casement windows with a center sash and leaded muntins.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

4.4 Garages

Policy: The retention of existing, historic garages is encouraged. A historic garage should be refurbished and modified instead of demolished or replaced to accommodate contemporary lifestyle requirements. New garages are permitted where a house does not have a garage or where a new garage is necessary. As with other accessory buildings, garages should have their own form and should generally appear as secondary structures and not visually overwhelm or compete with the other historic buildings of the property or district.

Design Justification: The way in which a new garage relates to other historic buildings of a property is important in historic districts. A new garage directly affects the integrity of the property as a whole. For this reason, a new garage should not detract from the historic character of the property.

Sustainability Justification: New garage construction should adhere to principles of sustainability in materials, design, and energy efficiency.

- 4.4.1: Garage doors should typically be painted to match the color of the garage. For garages that are “high style” it may be appropriate to use the color of the garage doors as a complementary or accent color to the building color scheme.
- 4.4.2: Electronic garage door openers may be installed and used.
- 4.4.3: Construction of a new or replacement garage should follow the historic setback for a garage on the property or setback patterns of other garages in the streetscape or historic district.
- 4.4.5: Construction of a replacement garage shall approximate the original configuration, form, massing, style, placement and detail of the former garage as described by photographic or other documentation.
- 4.4.6: Construction of a replacement garage may reasonably expand beyond the footprint of a historic one- or two- car garage, up to a total footprint of 450 square feet or 5% of the lot, whichever is greater, in order to accommodate a standard size parking space for up to two vehicles. Additional factors including the level of visibility of a new garage and the size and massing of surrounding structures may be considered.

- 4.4.7: Design a new garage to be secondary to that of a property's main historic building.
- 4.4.9: Materials used for a new garage should reflect the property's historical development and the use and function of the garage. Materials used for the exterior facades of a garage were often different (and less costly) than those used for the primary building.
- 4.4.10: A garage may be of 'modest' or 'high-style' design to complement a property's historical development. Often, a new garage should be modest with a simple rectangular plan and form and a low-pitched, gabled or hipped roof. Doors and windows may have little or no ornamentation.
- 4.4.11: When no photographic or other documentation is available, A new one-story garage should be similar in height to other similar, historic one-story garages in the streetscape and historic district. A new two-story garage should be similar in height to the historic two-story garages of adjacent properties, in the streetscape and of the historic district.
- 4.4.12: When no photographic or other documentation of a previous historic garage is available, a replacement garage may be two-stories tall when the original or historic garage was two-stories, or if located in a block where two-story or one and a half story garages are dominant or occur on abutting property. New garages in blocks that contain only one-story garages shall be one-story.
- 4.4.13: In locations where two-story garages are not allowed, a garage may be one and a half stories as defined in the Municipal Code so long as its design and height approximate the massing of a previous historic garage at the property, or adjacent one-story garages if no documentation of a previous historic garage is available.

Garage Doors, Openings, and Doors

- 4.4.14: Spacing and size of window and door openings in a new garage should be consistent with the historical development of the property and similar to their historic counterparts within the streetscape or historic district, as should the proportion of window to wall space.
- 4.4.17: New garage pedestrian doors in all other districts may be solid wood with wood frames or alternate door and door frame materials such as composite wood or aluminum clad wood for locations that are not visible from the public right-of-way. Otherwise pedestrian doors and frames shall be solid wood.
- 4.4.18: New garage vehicle doors in all other districts may be solid wood, wood veneer with a concealed metal frame, or composite materials including fiberglass or wood fiber (85% minimum wood fiber content). Doors should first match the historic design. When the historic design is unknown then the doors should match the design of other historic garage doors used in the

respective district. A paneled design may be appropriate.

- 4.4.21: At double garages, two single garage vehicle doors should be used instead of one larger, double door. This will maintain the scale and rhythm of older structures, making a two-car garage seem smaller and more compatible with the primary building and the district.
- 4.4.22: If a historic garage is to be demolished to allow the construction of a new garage, it is encouraged that the historic doors be salvaged and re-used at the new garage, or if this is not possible, that the historic garage doors be replicated in the new garage design.
- 4.4.23: Doors at new high style garages should complement the garage in design and materials. The use of paneled wood garage doors or custom garage doors is encouraged at these locations.

4.6 Exterior Materials at New Construction

Policy: Materials used in the construction of new buildings, additions, garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible in appearance and design with common building materials in the district, or typical of structures of the proposed style, type, age and location.

Wall Materials

- 4.6.2: Materials for new construction should be consistent with those at other buildings within the property, block and historic district. Consideration should be given to the pattern of development of the specific property and lot.
- 4.6.3: Wood siding may be tongue and groove, shiplap, novelty or other compatible type. Board and batten may also be appropriate for use on accessory buildings; it is rarely used on primary buildings.
- 4.6.6: Cementitious siding (smooth finish) of an appropriate profile may be used at new construction of stand-alone primary buildings, garages and other accessory buildings. It may also be used for additions to historic structures.
- 4.6.7: Exterior insulation finish systems (also known as EIFS or Dryvit), metal and vinyl siding, concrete block, imitative brick or stone or gravel aggregate materials are not permitted as wall materials. However, ornamental, rock-faced, mold-formed or rusticated concrete block may be used for foundation walls if previously used for other buildings on the property or in the district.
- 4.6.9: Masonry bonding patterns, sizes and color should be similar to those found at the property or used for historic buildings in the historic district and typical of structures of the same style, type, age and location.

Windows

- 4.6.11: Windows in new stand-alone construction must be similar to their counterparts within the property, block or historic district. These windows may be wood, vinyl clad wood, metal clad wood, or metal with a profile

similar to the windows of other buildings on the property. For new infill construction the profile must be similar to the windows used on other properties in the block or historic district.

- 4.6.12: New windows may have a simpler window pane pattern than their historic counterparts; for example, if the historic windows are 6/1 (read “six over one”), then 1/1 windows of the same overall size may be used.
- 4.6.13: Windows constructed entirely of aluminum or vinyl are not permitted, and aluminum surfaces cannot have a clear, mill or anodized finish unless supported by historic documentation for a specific property or structure.
- 4.6.14: Clear glass must be used in all windows. Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass in windows is generally not appropriate. Patterned, leaded or colored glass can be used in transoms and sidelights when established by the architectural style of the building or when supported by historical documentation for a specific property or structure.
- 4.6.15: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glass) windows are acceptable for additions or new construction. When muntins are proposed for a divided light appearance they should be “true divided lights” meaning that the thin wood framing (called ‘muntins’) completely frames and separates each piece of glass from the others.
- 4.6.16: Simulated muntins sandwiched between layers of glass in thermal windows, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins may not be used except when internal muntins are used in conjunction with permanently fixed surface-applied muntins on the interior and the exterior of the glass.

Doors

- 4.6.19: Recommendations and requirements for garage type doors are described in the “Garage” section of this chapter.
- 4.6.21: Swinging (French) or sliding patio doors used for new construction in the back of a new infill primary building, or new garages, accessory buildings, or new additions in the back yard and used in conjunction with sidelights may use the recommendations and requirements associated with the previous subsection of this section, “Windows,” provided that the patio doors and sidelights will match.
- 4.6.22: Pedestrian doors that are not visible from the public right-of-way may be made of alternate materials including aluminum clad wood, composite wood, and fiberglass. Doors in Heritage Hills must be of solid wood.

Roof and Roofing Materials

- 4.6.23: Wood shingles, composition shingles, slate tiles, terra cotta or clay tiles are permitted for use on roofs. Recommendations and requirements for these materials are found in the “Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.

- 4.6.26: Composition roofs should be of higher quality and are often referred to as Architectural Grade or Dimensional Grade. These shingles are usually rated as 30-, 40-, or 50-year shingles and have a thicker profile.
- 4.6.27: Built-up roofs, single-ply membranes should not be used on sloped roofs.
- 4.6.28: Multi-colored asphalt shingles and synthetic wood shingles should not be used on sloped roofs.
- 4.6.29: Historic eaves, copings, cornices, dormers and roof trim should be retained and preserved.

2.3 Sidewalks, Driveways, Parking Lots, Curbs and Vacant Sites

- 2.3.5: Maintain the continuity of existing original or historic sidewalks and the curb cut radius or curved approach when replacing an existing driveway or introducing a new driveway.
- 2.3.6: New concrete for sidewalks, driveways, curbs, and parking lots shall match the aged appearance in design details, color and texture of the existing concrete it replaces or adjacent concrete that will remain. If new concrete is not replacing existing concrete and is not adjacent to any existing concrete it should have an aged appearance in color and finish. New concrete visible from the public right-of-way shall not be bright white in color.
- 2.3.7: All sidewalks, driveways, and curbs visible from the public right-of-way shall be constructed to maintain the continuity of materials and character present in the district.
- 2.3.8: Private sidewalks and driveways must be constructed of concrete except where historical precedent demonstrates the previous existence of brick, stone or other materials, which may be considered appropriate for replacement.
- 2.3.9: Maintain the continuity of existing original or historic sidewalks and the curb cut radius or curved approach when replacing an existing driveway or introducing a new driveway.
- 2.3.10: Locate new driveways and sidewalks so that the topography of the building site and significant landscape features, such as mature trees, are retained. Protect mature trees and other significant landscape features from direct construction damage and from delayed damage such as destruction of root area or soil compaction by not permitting construction equipment access to the ground area under the tree canopy.
- 2.3.11: Curb cuts, including those intended to comply with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), should be installed to minimize damage to the original concrete sidewalks. The color and texture of the new concrete shall match and be consistent with the existing adjacent concrete color and texture.
- 2.3.16: New impermeable parking surfaces must be graded to drain toward

the street and away from buildings.

- c. Considerations: A new garage should be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to the primary building and should relate to similar garages within the historic district, as appropriate.

When no photographic or other documentation is available, a new one and a half-story garage should be similar in height to the historic one and a half-story garages of adjacent properties in the streetscape and of the historic district. The proposed garage has been compared to a portion of the primary structure and appears to be nearly the height of the primary structure. The proposed garage has not been illustrated to be similar in height to historic one and a half- or two-story garages of the adjacent properties in the streetscape or district.

As currently designed, the proposed garage does not meet the definition of a half-story, as defined in the Municipal Code: “*Half-Story*: A space under a sloping roof which has the line of intersection of roof decking and wall face not more than three feet above the top floor level, and in which space not more than two-thirds of the floor area is finished off for use. A half-story containing independent apartments or living quarters shall be counted as a full story.”

The proposed garage far exceeds the size of the historic accessory structure and the appropriate size threshold, as established by the Guidelines of 405 square feet or 5% of the lot. No justification for the increased size and height of the garage has been established.

The proposed garage includes ornate windows with diamond-paned, leaded glass that do not appear to be present on the existing garage structure or primary dwelling. The use of high-style, historic architectural details without historic precedent on an accessory building is inappropriate.

Interior, first floor space is described as an “apartment.” While the interior function of the structure is not subject to design review, it should be noted that Historic Preservation zoning does not permit the use of an accessory building as a second dwelling.

The proposed garage does not appear to follow the historic setback for a garage on the property or follow the setback patterns of other garages in the streetscape or historic district. The Standards and Guidelines state that new garages in blocks that contain only one-story garages shall be one-story and should follow the historic setback.

- d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That construction of a new or replacement garage should follow the historic setback for a garage on the property or setback patterns of other garages in the streetscape or historic district and the proposed replacement garage does not appear to follow the historic setback or setback pattern;

2. That the proposed replacement garage does not appear to approximate the original configuration, form, massing, style, placement, and detail of the former garage as described by photographic or other documentation;
3. That the footprint of the proposed replacement garage is greater than 5% of the site, which is 350 square feet; greater than 450 square feet, the size allowed by the Standards and Guidelines, and greater than the size of the existing building, 512 square feet, at 931 square feet on the lower level, and the increase of 419 square feet is not supported by the Standards and Guidelines;
4. That the increase in the footprint of the garage is visually discernible, as viewed from the public rights-of-way;
5. That the proposed garage introduces architectural features and details that may contribute to the structure being more visually prominent and no longer secondary to the primary dwelling;
6. That no photographic or other documentation of an original historic garage has been submitted, and the Standards and Guidelines do not support a one and a half-story or two-story garage at this location based on the historic presence, or dominant character of the block or abutting properties;
7. That the proposed garage doors appear to be consistent with the Standards and Guidelines at this site;
8. That spacing and sizes of windows and doors, as well as window to wall ratios, should be consistent with the historical evolution of the property and similar to historic counterparts in the district;
9. That clear glass must be used in all windows and reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass in windows is generally not appropriate. Leaded glass can only be used in transoms and sidelights when established by the architectural style of the building or when supported by historical documentation for a specific property or structure;
10. That all materials must be illustrated, to the extent that they can be determined, to be consistent with materials supported in the Standards and Guidelines.

E. HPCA-23-00103 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve Item 1, Demolish existing carport (elective)**, with the specific finding that the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property, but is necessary because of an imminent threat to public health and safety, and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That a highly modified garage is present;
2. That, as determined by the Commission, the structure is noncontributing to the historic integrity of the historic district and the demolition will not adversely affect the historic

character of the property or district because the structure is not historic or original to the site.

3. That the structure has minimal impact upon the historic integrity of the property and district, due to factors including the structure's lack of historic integrity and significance, and/or architectural significance.
2. **Continue Item 2, Construct new 1-1/2 story garage (elective)**, with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and is in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That construction of a new or replacement garage should follow the historic setback for a garage on the property or setback patterns of other garages in the streetscape or historic district and the proposed replacement garage does not appear to follow the historic setback or setback pattern;
2. That the proposed replacement garage does not appear to approximate the original configuration, form, massing, style, placement, and detail of the former garage as described by photographic or other documentation;
3. That the footprint of the proposed replacement garage is greater than 5% of the site, which is 350 square feet; greater than 450 square feet, the size allowed by the Standards and Guidelines, and greater than the size of the existing building, 512 square feet, at 931 square feet on the lower level; and the proposed increase of 419 square feet is not supported by the Standards and Guidelines;
4. That the proposed increase in the footprint of the garage is visually discernible as viewed from the public rights-of-way;
5. That the proposed garage introduces architectural features and details that may contribute to the structure being more visually prominent and no longer secondary to the primary dwelling;
6. That no photographic or other documentation of an original historic garage has been submitted, and the Standards and Guidelines do not support a one and a half-story or two-story garage at this location based on historic presence, or dominant character of the block or abutting properties;
7. That the proposed garage doors appear to be consistent with the Standards and Guidelines at this site;
8. That spacing and sizes of windows and doors, as well as window to wall ratios, should be consistent with the historical evolution of the property and similar to historic counterparts in the district;
9. That clear glass must be used in all windows; reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass in windows is generally not appropriate; and leaded glass can only be used in transoms and sidelights when established by the architectural style of the building, or when supported by historical documentation for a specific property or structure;

10. That all materials must be illustrated to the extent that they can be determined to be consistent with materials supported in the Standards and Guidelines.

Required Additional Information:

- 1) Material illustrations related to siding, light fixtures, gutters, downspouts, and mechanical equipment if proposed;
- 2) Revisions to the garage design, as directed by the HP Commission.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of Chapter 59 the Oklahoma City Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

RJ