



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

September 6, 2023

HPCA-23-00100

Agenda Item: VI.D.5

Case Number: HPCA-23-00100

Property Address: 301 NW 18th Street

District: Heritage Hills Historic District

Owner: Charles E. Wiggin
301 NW 18th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73103-1903

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Remove and replace eight (8) window sets on the garage quarters (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant is proposing to remove and replace eight (8) window sets on the garage quarters.

2. Location

Project site is located on the north side of NW 18th Street, on the northwest corner of NW 18th Street and N. Harvey Avenue.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1923

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1969

National Register Listing: 1979

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:

301 Northwest 18th Street, Brown House. This residence was constructed by John A. Brown, a dry goods merchant who developed the largest department store in Oklahoma City. A fine triple-pot chimney accents this 1923 brick and half-timber house.

Additional Information:

The 1949 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a two-story brick-veneered frame dwelling. A one-story frame "autohouse" is indicated on the northernmost property line with the front face back nearly 1/2 of the property depth from North Harvey Avenue. All structures have shingle roofs.

4. Existing Conditions

The owner reports that the windows on the garage quarters are rotted and deteriorated

beyond repair. The windows on the main structure were shown to be rotted and deteriorated beyond repair and were approved to be removed and replaced in 2013.

5. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-22-00034	05/04/2022	Oklahoma Natural Gas	Approved
Relocation of gas meters at multiple properties (elective).			
HPCA-17-00021	04/05/2017	Charles E. Wiggin	Approved
Replace driveway (elective).			
HPCA-14-00140	08/06/2014	Charles E. Wiggin	Approved
1) Replace walkway (elective); 2) Replace brick step in-kind (elective).			
HPCA-13-00044	05/01/2013	Charles E. Wiggin	Approved
1) Replace 48 windows (elective); 2) Install 47 storm windows (elective).			

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 1, Remove and replace eight (8) window sets on the garage quarters (elective).

- Description: The applicant is proposing to remove and replace eight window sets on the garage quarters. The owner reports that the windows are rotted and deteriorated beyond repair. In 2013, the owner received a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace forty-eight (48) windows on the main structure, but the windows on the garage quarters were not addressed at that time. The owner states that the new windows will match the windows on the main house and that none are visible from the street.

The proposal applies to eight (8) windows openings on the garage quarters.

Window #1 – 59” wide x 36” high, South elevation, lower level

Window #2 – 24” wide x 36” high, South elevation, lower level

Window #3 – 36” wide x 36” high, North elevation, lower level

Window #4 – 36” wide x 36” high, West elevation, lower level

Window #6 – 36” wide x 29” high, West elevation, upper level, dormer

Window #7 – 36” wide x 29” high, South elevation, upper level, dormer

Window #8 – 36” wide x 29” high, South elevation, upper level, dormer

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

Policy: Windows and shutters are important character-defining features of a building and originals should be retained and kept in good repair. Awnings may be an intended permanent character defining feature such as wood framed and finished with roof shingles to match the rest of the building or temporary such as contemporary fabric awnings with aluminum frames.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, positioning, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the architectural style and period of the building. Their design, details and craftsmanship make them worthy of preservation. The presence or absence of shutters and awnings are significant to the visual character of a building.

Sustainability Justification: Many buildings in historic districts retain old-growth wood windows which can last indefinitely if they are properly maintained, unlike new-growth wood or vinyl windows. In most cases, windows account for less than one-fourth of a home’s heat loss. Insulating the attic, walls and basement is a more economical approach to reducing energy costs than replacing historic windows. Proper maintenance and sealing of windows, along with adding storm windows, keeps windows out of landfills and enhances a building’s energy efficiency year round.

- 3.6.1: Regular maintenance and weather-stripping of historic windows ensures their preservation and improves the energy efficiency of a building.
- 3.6.2: Retain and preserve original or historic windows. Preserve and maintain historic window framing and number and configuration of glass panes.
- 3.6.3: Make repairs to an existing window rather than replacing the entire window unit, including replacement in kind of parts that are deteriorated beyond repair. Ordinary maintenance and repair is limited to less than 50% replacement of the window’s components and parts including frames and sashes.
- 3.6.5: Original or historic windows more than 50% DETERIORATED BEYOND REPAIR may be replaced in kind.
- 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
- 3.6.9: If original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile.

- 3.6.10: New windows made of aluminum clad wood with enameled finish may be appropriate as replacements for historic wood windows since these may have acceptable sustainable qualities and closely resemble a painted finish.
 - 3.6.11: Vinyl is not an environmentally sustainable material, and the installation of vinyl-clad wood windows or entirely vinyl framed windows is not appropriate and will not be approved for the historic districts.
 - 3.6.12: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glazing) windows are acceptable as replacement windows when the historic windows in a building have been previously removed. When used, thermal pane windows must have true divided lites.
 - 3.6.13: A thermal pane window may be appropriate for replacement of a historic wood or metal window when the existing window frame and sash parts are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair. To replace a historic window with a new unit a window survey including a photograph of the interior and exterior of the unit must be provided to substantiate the condition of the window. Historic windows visible from the public-right-of-way must be retained and repaired or replaced in kind, including replication of muntins pattern and profile.
 - 3.6.15: Muntins sandwiched between layers of glass, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins are not appropriate and shall not be used.
 - 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.
 - 3.6.18: A new window may have a low emissivity coating applied to clear glass provided that the visible light transmittance is not less than .74 and the overall reflectance is not more than 17%.
- c. Considerations: Based on the date of construction, architectural features of the structure, Sanborn maps, and appearance of the windows, staff assumes the windows proposed for replacement are historic. The owner stated that the windows are rotted and deteriorated beyond repair. As the garage does not appear to be visible from the public right of way, and as the proposed windows are described as matching the wood windows that were previously approved and installed on the main structure, the replacement windows may be considered appropriate.
- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That the windows in the garage with living quarters does not appear to be visible from the public right of way;
 2. That the existing windows appear to be historic;
 3. That the proposed replacement windows appear to approximate the historic windows;
 4. That the existing windows have not been shown to be deteriorated to a state that warrants replacement of all windows;
 5. That additional documentation may be necessary to verify the condition of the existing windows.

E. HPCA-23-00100 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Continue Item 1, Remove and replace eight (8) window sets on the garage quarters (elective),** with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the windows in the garage with living quarters does not appear to be visible from the public right of way;
2. That the existing windows appear to be historic;
3. That the proposed replacement windows appear to approximate the historic windows;
4. That the existing windows have not been shown to be deteriorated to a state that warrants replacement of all windows;
5. That additional documentation may be necessary to verify the condition of the existing windows.

Additional information: documentation of the existing windows' condition verifying that they meet applicable Guidelines for replacement.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of Chapter 59 the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

RJ