



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

September 6, 2023

HPCA-23-00102

Agenda Item: VI.C.3

Case Number: HPCA-23-00102

Property Address: 1005 NW 40th Street

District: Crown Heights Historic District

Applicant: Randy Wunder
7521 N Classen Boulevard
Oklahoma City, OK 73116

Owner: Alexandra Hickey-Owen
1005 NW 40th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73118-8221

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Install stand-alone carport (elective);
2. Remove and replace driveway under carport (elective); and
3. Widen driveway under carport (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant is proposing to add an open sided, flat-roofed carport in front of the existing detached garage. He proposes to demolish and repour a section of the driveway that would be under the carport because it is in poor condition. He is also requesting to widen the driveway under the proposed carport to allow for the columns supporting it.

2. Location

Project site is located on the north side of NW 40th Street, mid-block between N Western Avenue and Shartel Avenue.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1939

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1977

National Register Listing: 1995

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:

C. 1939. This one-story, uncut stone Minimal Traditional residence has a moderately pitched, cross-gabled roof with composition shingles. The asymmetrical façade features two casement windows and cast stone sills. A centered porch has wood columns and a flat

roof with a wrought-iron balustrade. There is a stone wall chimney and a detached garage.

Additional Information:

The 1950 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a one-story stone-veneered frame dwelling with one-story front porch. A one-story stone-veneered frame “autohouse” is indicated on the easternmost property line, with the front face back nearly $\frac{3}{4}$ of the property depth from the front property line. All structures have shingle roofs. The 1955 edition indicates no further changes to the site or buildings.

4. Existing Conditions

The detached garage is located in the northeast corner of the rear yard. The applicant is proposing to add an open sided, flat-roofed carport. As reported by applicant, the concrete driveway is in poor condition in the area under the proposed carport.

5. Previous Actions

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-14-00102	06/04/2014	David & Amanda Jones	Approved
1) Replace non-historic brick walkway with concrete walkway (elective); 2) Replace shutters (elective); 3) Replace concrete porch floor and steps in kind to match the historic materials in all details, dimensions, and configuration (elective).			
HPCA-13-00002	01/09/2013	David & Amanda Jones	Approved
1) Replace fence (elective).			

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020. **

1. Items 2 and 3, Remove and replace driveway under carport (elective); and Widen driveway under carport (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to widen the concrete driveway under the carport by 1’2” wide and 17’5” long. Due to the poor condition of the driveway, the applicant proposes to remove a section under the proposed carport and replace it with new concrete. The dimensions of the section are 10’10” x 8’0”. Although the Standards and Guidelines would allow for the approval of the driveway changes to be approved administratively, they are being brought to the Commission in conjunction with the request for the carport.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.3 Sidewalks, Driveways, Parking Lots, Curbs and Vacant Sites

Policy: *Sidewalks, driveways and off-street parking should not interrupt the historic continuity of landscaped front or corner side yards. Historic concrete sidewalks and walkways should be preserved and repaired with concrete that is*

consistent in pattern, size, texture and color. Historic concrete driveways should be preserved, and new driveways should be of concrete rather than asphalt.

Design Justification: Historically, the consistency and repetition of sidewalk and driveway spacing, placement, dimension and materials create a rhythm to the street. Retaining the specific rhythm of a street is important to preserve historic character. Oklahoma City's historic districts and properties have strong visual elements of grey colored concrete for sidewalks, walkways, some streets and curbs.

Sustainability Justification: Existing historic concrete sidewalks, steps and driveways represent embodied energy and should be preserved. Concrete is a long-lasting sustainable material, reflects solar heat and light and should be repaired or replaced as needed with new concrete to match. New driveways should be of similar design, pattern, texture, dimensions and color as the historic driveway. The use of permeable paving for non-historic and new driveways, sidewalks and parking areas is encouraged because it helps to reduce water run-off.

- 2.3.6: New concrete for sidewalks, driveways, curbs, and parking lots shall match the aged appearance in design details, color and texture of the existing concrete it replaces or adjacent concrete that will remain. If new concrete is not replacing existing concrete and is not adjacent to any existing concrete, it should have an aged appearance in color and finish. New concrete visible from the public right-of-way shall not be bright white in color.
- 2.3.7: All sidewalks, driveways, and curbs visible from the public right-of-way shall be constructed to maintain the continuity of materials and character present in the district.
- 2.3.8: Private sidewalks and driveways must be constructed of concrete except where historical precedent demonstrates the previous existence of brick, stone or other materials, which may be considered appropriate for replacement.
- 2.3.9: Maintain the continuity of existing original or historic sidewalks and the curb cut radius or curved approach when replacing an existing driveway or introducing a new driveway.
- 2.3.10: Locate new driveways and sidewalks so that the topography of the building site and significant landscape features, such as mature trees, are retained. Protect mature trees and other significant landscape features from direct construction damage and from delayed damage such as destruction of root area or soil compaction by not permitting construction equipment access to the ground area under the tree canopy.
- 2.3.12: Driveways, eight feet or less in width, may be replaced by a driveway of up to ten feet in width; width may vary as the driveway approaches the garage to correspond to the width of the garage door openings. However, property owners are encouraged to limit the quantity of impervious concrete

surfaces to assist in reducing storm water runoff.

c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That new driveways and sidewalks must be constructed of concrete, drain away from structures and must match the aged appearance of the existing paving to be replaced.
2. That driveway widths may vary as the driveway approaches the garage to correspond to the width of the garage door opening; and
3. That the driveway is not being altered outside of the rear yard and does not appear to be visible from the street.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

2. Item 1, Install stand-alone carport (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to add a stand-alone carport in front of the existing garage, which is located in the rear yard. The proposed carport will be built of wood to match the dimensions and details of the features found on the front porch of the subject home, and painted to match the color of the house trim and garage. The height will be 8'5" tall and will be 16'9" long x 12'10" wide. It is an open-air structure supported by four columns. The roof of the carport will be flat, using TPO membrane for waterproofing, along with a subtle tapered underlayment to provide pitch for drainage. The edges of the roof will be covered by guttering on all four sides. The carport will not be attached to the garage.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.5 Landscape & Landscape Elements

- 2.5.19: Adding a pergola (see also 3.4, Pergola or Freestanding Trellis) to a back elevation can help shade an outdoor space and can offer some degree of shade to the interior, which means added energy efficiency. Do not add a pergola or trellis to a prominent elevation where none historically existed. Reconstruction of a missing pergola or trellis should be based on accurate evidence of the original design.
- 2.5.20: New pergolas, not visible from the public right of way, may be constructed in back yards, at rear elevations or at accessory structures.
- 2.5.21: New pergolas shall be compatible with the building to which they relate in proportion, size, scale and material.
- 2.5.22: New pergolas constructed as an attachment to a primary or accessory structure shall be reviewed as a building addition and shall not damage or obscure historic character defining features.

- 2.5.23: New pergolas shall not be constructed in such a manner that abutment or attachment to an existing structure will allow for the pooling of moisture against or the infiltration of moisture into an existing structure.
- 2.5.24: The bottom of the canopy of a new pergola shall not exceed eight (8) feet above the finished floor height of the structure to which it relates, and the overall height of a pergola should not exceed nine (9) feet and shall be compatible with the building to which it relates in proportion, size, scale and material.
- 2.5.25: Freestanding pergolas may have concrete floors; however, permeable flooring materials are recommended. Posts may be set in concrete.
- 2.5.26: Pergolas shall be constructed of wood or sustainable alternative materials that closely resemble wood and may have decorative functional metal elements such as wrought iron where appropriate. Synthetic materials that do not closely replicate historic fabric, such as plastic and vinyl, are prohibited.
- 2.5.27: Pergolas with columns or walls constructed of permanent building materials such as brick, stucco, or stone shall be reviewed as new construction.

3.4 Pergola or Freestanding Trellis (See also 2.5, Landscape and Landscape Elements)

- 3.4.3. Do not add a new pergola or freestanding trellis on a prominent (visible from the public right-of-way) elevation where none existed historically.
- 3.4.4: A missing pergola or freestanding trellis may be reconstructed if based on accurate evidence of original configuration, placement and detail as supported by historic photographs.

4.5 Accessory Buildings

Policy: Accessory buildings could have been very modest, simple rectangular buildings such as barns, garages or outbuildings with one large opening for an overhead or sliding garage door or more ornate children's playhouse, workshops or carriage houses with materials and details that matched the main building. Garages are addressed separately in the preceding section within this chapter.

The retention of existing, accessory buildings is encouraged. Refurbishment and modifications to historic accessory buildings is preferred to demolition and replacement. New accessory buildings are permitted where necessary, and they should have their own form. However, they should appear as secondary structures and not visually overwhelm or compete with the property's other historic buildings.

Design Justification: The way in which new accessory buildings relate to other historic buildings of a property is important in historic districts. A new accessory building directly affects the integrity of the property as a whole. Therefore, a new accessory building should not detract from the historic character of the property.

Sustainability Justification: New accessory building design and construction should adhere to principles of sustainability in materials, design, and energy efficiency.

- 4.5.5: The appearance and location of a new accessory building should be based on

the appearance of the historic accessory building if such existed. Use historic photographs and other documentation such as Sanborn Fire Insurance maps for guidance as to size and location of a previous accessory building on the property.

- 4.5.6: If documentation of a historical accessory building at the site is not available, the size, design and location of a new accessory building should be in keeping with other accessory buildings in the block and historic district.
 - 4.5.7: Accessory buildings should be located in the back yard.
 - 4.5.8: Design of new accessory buildings shall be secondary to that of the main historic building and should be secondary to the design of the property's historic garage.
 - 4.5.9: Accessory buildings more than six feet tall should be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to the main residential building. Additionally, new accessory buildings may relate to similar accessory buildings within the historic district.
 - 4.5.10: Materials used at accessory buildings should reflect the use and function of the accessory building, and not necessarily that of the primary building. Materials used at exterior facades of accessory buildings were often different (simpler and less costly) than material used for the main building.
 - 4.5.11: New accessory buildings shall follow the historic side and back yard setback patterns of other accessory buildings on the property, in the block or in the historic district.
- c. Considerations: The applicant proposes to construct an open-sided, flat-roofed, carport, which is similar in appearance to that of a pergola or other open-air landscape feature. The proposed height is consistent with the criteria for pergolas, and the structure appears to align with the soffit of the garage. The proposed materials are compatible with the garage in proportion, size, scale and materials. While the carport is proposed in a location visible from the street, it is aligned with the façade of an accessory structure and not the primary dwelling. The front of the garage is approximately 130 feet from the street, putting the front of the proposed carport approximately 113 feet from the street; these factors may reduce the extent to which it is considered "prominent."
- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That the dimensions and visible materials of the proposed structure appear consistent with the Standards and Guidelines for materials of an accessory building;
 2. That the proposed structure is located in the back yard in close proximity to the garage;
 3. That accessory buildings shall follow the historic side and back yard setback patterns of the historic accessory structure or other accessory buildings in the block or district;
 4. That the proposed structure appears to be moderately screened behind an existing

driveway gate;

5. That the proposed structure's visibility is limited by its placement which is in alignment with the garage and set back significantly from the street.

E. HPCA-23-00102 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve Item 1, Install stand-alone carport (elective)**, with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the dimensions and visible materials of the proposed structure appear consistent with the Standards and Guidelines for materials of an accessory building;
2. That the proposed structure is located in the back yard in close proximity to the garage;
3. That accessory buildings shall follow the historic side and back yard setback patterns of the historic accessory structure or other accessory buildings in the block or district;
4. That the proposed structure appears to be moderately screened behind an existing driveway gate;
5. That the proposed structure's visibility is limited by its placement which is in alignment with the garage and set back significantly from the street.

2. **Approve Items 2 and 3, Remove and replace driveway under carport (elective); and Widen driveway under carport (elective)**, with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That new driveways and sidewalks must be constructed of concrete, drain away from structures and must match the aged appearance of the existing paving to be replaced.
2. That driveway widths may vary as the driveway approaches the garage to correspond to the width of the garage door opening; and
3. That the existing driveway is not being altered outside of the rear yard and does not appear to be visible from the street.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of Chapter 59 the Oklahoma City Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

RJ