



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

September 6, 2023

HPCA-23-00101

Agenda Item: VI.C.2

Case Number: HPCA-23-00101

Property Address: 316 NW 18th Street

District: Heritage Hills

Applicant: Gumerson Blake
Jeff Blake
1020 NW 81st Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73114

Owner: Christina Henson
316 NW 18th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73103

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Construct a one-story addition (elective); and
2. Replace existing back porch with a new, covered porch (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 18th Street, mid-block between N Harvey Ave and N Hudson Ave.

2. Site History

Date of Construction: 1922

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1969

National Register Listing: 1979

Additional Information:

The 1949 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 2-story brick-veneered frame dwelling. A 1-story frame “autohouse” is indicated on the southwestern corner of the property.

3. Existing Conditions

Currently, there are existing porches and a stone patio where the proposed addition and new covered porch are proposed.

4. Previous Actions

None.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 1, Construct a one-story addition (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes the construction of a rear, single-story addition to the southeast corner of the main structure. The addition will be approximately 550 sq ft, and it will be clad in matching brick veneer.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

Section 4.3 Building Additions

- 4.3.1: Additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes, and should be appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building. The incorporation of existing architectural features with new design elements can contribute added interest and compatibility.
- 4.3.2: New additions must be planned so that they are constructed to the back of the property or on a non-character-defining elevation preferably not visible from the public right-of-way. Character-defining features of buildings should not be radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed by an addition. The existing historic building fabric should not be damaged by the installation of a new addition.
- 4.3.3: It is not appropriate to alter the overall character of historic districts by substantially reducing the ratio of open space to built space on any site through new construction, additions or introduction of surface paving or other hardscape feature.
- 4.3.4: New additions shall not exceed 50% of the square footage of the footprint of the existing historic structure (enclosed space only), or 750 square feet, whichever is larger, and shall be no taller, no wider, and no deeper than the existing historic structure.
- 4.3.5: Additions to historic or non-historic buildings should relate to and complement the style of the main building, and may relate to the general style of the streetscape.
- 4.3.6: An addition to a historic building must be designed to be visibly distinguishable from the original historic building.

- 4.3.7: Additions to historic buildings should be designed so that connections between new construction and historic structures are clearly discernible. A clear definition of the transition between the new addition and the historic structure should be established and maintained.
 - 4.3.8: An addition may be differentiated from the historic building by connecting the two with a modest connector, designed to be as transparent and unobtrusive as possible.
 - 4.3.9: Historic details in the coping, eaves and parapet of the historic building may be continued at the point where the historic structure connects to the addition.
 - 4.3.10: Additions should be clearly secondary to and distinct from the original building. This can be accomplished by providing a clear visual break between the historic building and the addition, by setting the façade of the addition back from that of the historic building, or by constructing a recessed area at the point at which the addition and the historic building join together.
 - 4.3.11: Use of different but compatible materials or different (simplified) detailing is also appropriate to differentiate a new addition from the historic building.
 - 4.3.12: The design of a new addition must consider and respect the massing, roof shape, bay spacing, cornice lines and materials of the building to which it is being added.
 - 4.3.13: An addition may be horizontal (added to a side or back elevation) or vertical (a second story added to an existing one-story). However, vertical additions are not permitted at corner lots, nor in the Mesa Park Historic District. While vertical additions are not prohibited in other districts and internal lots, it is rare that the other requirements and recommendations of this section can be met.
 - 4.3.14: Vertical additions to buildings must be located so that they are not visible to a person standing at ground level on the opposite side of an adjacent right-of-way. A vertical addition is not permitted at a corner lot because such an addition would be visible from the side street.
 - 4.3.15: Facades of additions facing an alley or rear property line may be simplified and secondary in design to that of facades that are more visible from adjacent properties or the streetscape public right-of-way. The same materials should be used for alley-facing facades as that of the other facades unless this varies from the typical historic condition within the district.
- c. Considerations: The applicant proposes the removal of an existing porch and patio to accommodate the addition to the rear southeast corner of the historic structure. The proposed addition does not appear to increase the overall lot coverage for this site.

Additions to historic buildings must be compatible to the design and character of the historic structure to which they relate. However, additions to historic structures must also have features incorporated into the design that indicate that said addition is not historic. The proposed addition has an off-set from the main house and has a differing roof form that both help to differentiate the proposed addition from the historic

structure. Additionally, the proposed addition will have a brick veneer that matches the brick on the historic structure. The applicant has even indicated that they intend to reuse brick removed from the historic structure. Both of these factors combined meet the intentions of the Guidelines for additions, resulting in an addition that is discernible from, yet compatible with, the main structure and does not detract from the overall historic character of the structure.

In addition, the proposed addition will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way. The proposed addition's eastern wall is offset from the historic structure by just over 3', but the addition is on the rear, southeastern corner of the historic structure.

The applicant proposes the use of double hung, clad-wood windows matching the windows on the historic structure. The proposed roofing materials are composition shingles that will match the existing shingles used on the main structure.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed addition is minimally visible from the public right-of-way;
2. That the proposed addition is visually distinguishable from the historic structure; and
3. That the proposed addition is compatible in terms of scale, design, and materials used.

2. Item 2, Replace existing back porch with a new, covered porch (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes the construction of a new, covered porch off of the southwest corner of the historic structure. The proposed porch will be approximately 255 sq ft.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

Section 3.3 Porches, Canopies, Porte-Cocheres & Balconies

- 3.3.7: Enclosing historic side or back porches or balconies with glazing changes the historic character of a building and should be avoided. However, while not encouraged, such enclosures at side or back porches not connected to a front or primary porch or balcony may be allowed. The details of such enclosures must be minimal and not obscure or detract from the historic details of the porch or building.
- 3.3.8: Reconstruction of a missing porch, canopy, porte-cochere or balcony is encouraged and must be based on accurate physical evidence of the original or historic configuration, placement and detail of the feature and supplemented with historic photographs that show the original feature.
- 3.3.9: If no photographs or other documentation exist, the design of a replacement porch should be compatible with the historic building in height, proportion, style, roof shape, material, texture, detail and color. Buildings of a similar architectural style can provide examples of appropriate design.
- 3.3.12: New or replacement columns should be of materials appropriate to the style and design of the building including the porch. Replacement columns should match

the original or historic columns in size, design, scale, massing, materials and details.

- 3.3.14: The use of alternative materials for porch columns on primary facades such as fiberglass may be approved by the Commission if the finished appearance will be indistinguishable from the appearance, design, and texture of the original or historic columns.
 - 3.3.15: Porch columns of vinyl or hollow core aluminum, or wrought iron are not appropriate unless historic documentation demonstrates otherwise.
- c. Considerations: The proposed covered porch will replace an existing porch on the rear elevation of the house, and it includes a new paved drive area immediately to the west of the proposed porch. The proposed porch will use 3' iron porch railings on the eastern and western elevations of the proposed covered porch. The proposed porch will also feature decorative columns that will have the same appearance as wooden columns. The roofing material for the porch will be the same composition shingle used for the proposed addition, and it will match the existing roofing materials. The proposed porch does not appear to contribute to an increase in lot coverage for the site.
- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That the proposed porch will not be visible from the public right-of-way;
 2. That the proposed porch is of an appropriate design as to not distract from the historic character of the main house; and
 3. That the proposed porch will replace an existing rear porch.

E. HPCA-23-00101 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve Items 1 and 2, Construct a one-story addition; and Replace existing back porch with a new, covered porch** with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed addition is minimally visible from the public right-of-way;
2. That the proposed addition is visually distinguishable from the historic structure;
3. That the proposed addition is compatible in terms of scale, design, and materials used;
4. That the proposed porch will not be visible from the public right-of-way;
5. That the proposed porch is of an appropriate design as to not distract from the historic character of the main house; and
6. That the proposed porch will replace an existing rear porch.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of Chapter 59 of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, as amended, governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, as amended, are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

DC