



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

August 2, 2023

HPCA-23-00087

Agenda Item: VI.D.4.

Case Number: HPCA-23-00087

Property Address: 717 NW 16th Street

District: Mesta Park Historic District

Owner: BMG Properties LLC
Brian Walz
22322 Cedar Ridge Rd
Edmond, OK 73025

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

- 1) Remove second floor exterior door (elective);
- 2) Replace windows (elective);
- 3) Reconstruct walls of enclosed porch (elective);
- 5) Remove aluminum siding (elective); and
- 6) Install railings at porch (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant proposes repair and replacement to previously altered features on the rear of the dwelling. A door with remnants of a landing will be removed and covered with matching wood siding. Windows installed in the enclosed porch will be removed and replaced.

The proposal includes removal of metal siding, installation of wood siding at the enclosed porch, and installation of front porch railing.

2. Location

Project site is located on the north side of NW 16th Street, mid-block between Shartel and Lee Avenues.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1905

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1994

National Register Listing: 1983

Additional Information:

The applicant has information that indicates the dwelling was originally a one-story dwelling that acquired a horizontal addition in the 1930s resulting in the existing two-story structure. They were also informed that at some point it was converted from single family to a duplex, and later converted back to single family home. An early, undated, photo of the one to one and a half story dwelling is included in the packet.

This dwelling historically was one of three dwellings located on a parcel that included lots 18 through 22. It was the central dwelling and occupied part of lot 21, all of lot 20 and part of lot 19. The roof of house and porches illustrated as shingles, likely wood shingles. Two story dwellings also occupied the parcel with one to the west and one to the east. Four unidentified accessory structures were located at the north property line at the alley. Those structures occupied lots 19 through 22 and varied in size, shape and roofing materials. All were frame structures. Roofing materials of the accessory structures included composition, likely a flat roof, shingles, likely wood, and non-combustible roofing material.

The 1919 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a one and a half story frame dwelling with one-story front porch extending the entire width of the front (south) façade and wrapping around the east corner of the dwelling. A one-story back (north) porch is illustrated to span over half the width of the rear wall.

The 1922 edition illustrates the dwelling located on lots 21 and 20. There appears to be no change to the one and a half story dwelling. Two small accessory structures are indicated on the north property line abutting the alley. One appears to have composition roofing, while the accessory structure in the northeast corner is illustrated with shingles and is described as an “autohouse.”

The 1949 edition illustrates an expansion to the west of the front porch which may be the porte-cochere we see now. No back porch is illustrated on the plans. Only one accessory structure is illustrated. The ‘autohouse’ is illustrated in the northwest corner of the site with composition roofing.

Subsequent editions through 1955 illustrate no additional changes, though the 1955 edition is unclear and roofing material cannot be determined.

4. Existing Conditions

The front of the dwelling has brick columns and piers and no railings at the front porch

5. Previous Actions

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-02-128	10/04/2002	Chris and Wendy Cook	Approved
Replace pair of front doors with single door and sidelights to match previous condition.			

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

1. **Item 1, Remove second floor exterior door (elective); and 5, Remove aluminum siding (elective).**

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to remove aluminum siding from the rear of the structure to expose original siding. The applicant also proposes to infill a non-historic door opening and remnants of a landing. Salvaged siding located on site will be installed where door and landing were previously cut in.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.1 Maintenance, Preservation and Rehabilitation of Exterior Building Materials

- 3.1.4: Repairs shall be done with like materials.
 - 3.1.12: If repairs or replacement affect more than two-thirds (66%) of an inappropriate component or material located on any individual building face, then all inappropriate components or materials shall be replaced with an appropriate component or material. Removal of more than 50% of an inappropriate material no longer meets the definition of ordinary maintenance and repair, and a Certificate of Appropriateness is required.
 - 3.1.14: Remove an inappropriate component or material and restore the original or historic component or material that is revealed by such removal.
 - 3.1.15: New material should match the historic in material type, dimensions, design, configuration, texture, surface coatings and visual appearance.
 - 3.1.17: Incompatible non-historic alterations to a historic building are encouraged to be removed, and the building restored to its original appearance during the period of significance.
- c. Recommended Specific Findings:
 1. That removal of non-original and inappropriate alterations are supported by the Standards and Guidelines.

2. **Item 6, Install railings at porch (elective).**

- a. Description: The applicant proposes construction of front porch railings similar to the 1930 condition. All materials are proposed as painted wood.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.1 Maintenance, Preservation and Rehabilitation of Exterior Building Materials

- 3.1.15: New material should match the historic in material type, dimensions, design, configuration, texture, surface coatings and visual appearance.
- 3.1.16: When a missing or severely deteriorated feature, element, or component is replaced, it shall be replaced in-kind, that is, matching the

original in dimensions, detail, size, form, material and finish.

- 3.1.19: If original or historic materials do not remain, the original form may be reconstructed or restored based on physical, photographic, or documentary evidence.
- 3.1.27: If replication of original elements is not possible because of a lack of historical physical, photographic or documentary evidence, then a new design that is compatible with the original form, style, and period of the building shall be used.
- 3.1.28: An appropriate option for a replacement feature is a new design that is compatible with the remaining character-defining features of the historic building.
- 3.1.29: The new design of a missing feature shall take into account the size, scale, and materials of the historic building; should be clearly differentiated to avoid a false historical appearance; and should maintain visual attention on the authentic and historic aspects of the building.

c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That reproducing a known historic condition, such as porch railings, based on photographs and accounting for scale and proportion is supported by the Standards and Guidelines.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 2, Replace windows (elective); and 3, Reconstruct walls of enclosed porch (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to remove non-historic storm windows at the enclosed back porch. Walls and openings will be reconstructed to accommodate a large rectangular fixed window on the east side of the enclosed porch and a pair of large, fixed windows on the north elevation. Wood siding to match the historic will be installed upon removal of aluminum siding.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

Policy: Windows and shutters are important character-defining features of a building and originals should be retained and kept in good repair. Awnings may be an intended permanent character defining feature such as wood framed and finished with roof shingles to match the rest of the building or temporary such as contemporary fabric awnings with aluminum frames.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, positioning, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and

help convey the architectural style and period of the building. Their design, details and craftsmanship make them worthy of preservation. The presence or absence of shutters and awnings are significant to the visual character of a building.

- 3.6.5: Original or historic windows more than 50% DETERIORATED BEYOND REPAIR may be replaced in kind.
- 3.6.6: New window openings may be allowed on the back facade or the back 30% of the side elevations. New windows must be compatible with historic or existing windows in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials and details.
- 3.6.10: New windows made of aluminum clad wood with enameled finish may be appropriate as replacements for historic wood windows since these may have acceptable sustainable qualities and closely resemble a painted finish.
- 3.6.11: Vinyl is not an environmentally sustainable material, and the installation of vinyl-clad wood windows or entirely vinyl framed windows is not appropriate and will not be approved for the historic districts.
- 3.6.12: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glazing) windows are acceptable as replacement windows when the historic windows in a building have been previously removed. When used, thermal pane windows must have true divided lites.
- 3.6.13: A thermal pane window may be appropriate for replacement of a historic wood or metal window when the existing window frame and sash parts are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair. To replace a historic window with a new unit a window survey including a photograph of the interior and exterior of the unit must be provided to substantiate the condition of the window. Historic windows visible from the public-right-of-way must be retained and repaired or replaced in kind, including replication of muntins pattern and profile.
- 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.
- 3.6.17: Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass are not permitted in windows, except that special glass, for example, patterned, leaded or colored glass, can be used in transoms and sidelights when appropriate as established by the architectural style and the specific history of the building for which the special glass is proposed.
- 3.6.18: A new window may have a low emissivity coating applied to clear glass provided that the visible light transmittance is not less than .74 and the overall reflectance is not more than 17%.

- c. Considerations: The plate windows combine to provide glass openings that are large, similar to an enclosed porch. The window description indicates clad windows with the

option for SunResist glass color. Clear glass is required. SunResist color is an unknown product but suggests tinted windows. The size and shape of proposed windows may continue to represent the previous existence of a porch.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That tinted windows are not supported by the Standards and Guidelines;
2. That siding profile is chosen to match the historic.

E. HPCA-23-00087 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

- 1. Approve Items 1, 5, and 6 to remove second floor door and cover, remove aluminum siding, and construct front porch railing,** with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That removal of non-original and inappropriate alterations, such as door ways, landings, and aluminum siding, are supported by the Standards and Guidelines.
 2. That reproducing a known historic condition, such as porch railings, based on photographs and accounting for scale and proportion is supported by the Standards and Guidelines.
- 2. Continue Items 2 and 3, replace windows and reconstruct walls with new siding at the back porch,** with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That tinted windows are not supported by the Standards and Guidelines; and
2. That siding profile is chosen to match the historic.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of Chapter 59 the Oklahoma City Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.