



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

August 2, 2023

HPCA-23-00047

Agenda Item: VI.D.1.

Case Number: HPCA-23-00047

Property Address: 800 NW 16th Street

District: Mesta Park Historic District

Applicant: Jollybird Home Design
Fallon Magnus
733 NW 22nd Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73103

Owner: Susan Key
800 NW 16th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73103

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

2. Construct pergola (elective);
5. Construct playhouse/shed (required).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant proposes construction of a freestanding pergola to function as a garage and is seeking approval for a pre-existing portable playhouse.

2. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 16th Street, southwest corner of NW 16th and N Shartel

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1924

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1994

National Register Listing: 1983

Additional Information:

The 1950 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 2-story, brick-veneered, frame dwelling with 1-story front porch extending nearly the entire length of the front (south) façade and a 1-story small extension at the rear (north). A 1-story, brick veneered, frame “autohouse” is indicated in the southeast corner of the property approximately $\frac{3}{4}$ west of the east property line. The dwelling is illustrated with “non-combustible” roofs,

typically indicating tile or slate. The garage is indicated with shingles, typically wood. No substantive changes are illustrated on other editions.

4. Existing Conditions

The property consists of a 2-story dwelling, a pool, patio, the garage, and various sidewalks.

5. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include: Nothing related to garage.

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-23-00047	07/05/2023	Susan Key	Approved
3) Install door and window (elective), 4) Replace window at NW corner to match new window (elective)			
HPCA-05-117	2005	Michael Menser	Approved
Install fence on rear property line.			

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 2, Construct pergola (elective);

- Description: The applicant proposes to construct a pergola, with polycarbonate roof panels, four (4) feet away from the existing garage to serve as a carport. The sides will be enclosed with wood lattice. Lattice is spaced three quarters (3/4) inch apart in both directions. The height is eight (8) feet, nine (9) inches tall. The structure appears to be 22 by 19 feet with wood posts, or 396 square feet. The pergola will have white aluminum gutters.
- References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.5 Landscape & Landscape Elements

- 2.5.19: Adding a pergola (see also 3.4, Pergola or Freestanding Trellis) to a back elevation can help shade an outdoor space and can offer some degree of shade to the interior, which means added energy efficiency. Do not add a pergola or trellis to a prominent elevation where none historically existed. Reconstruction of a missing pergola or trellis should be based on accurate

evidence of the original design.

- 2.5.20: New pergolas, not visible from the public right of way, may be constructed in back yards, at rear elevations or at accessory structures.
- 2.5.21: New pergolas shall be compatible with the building to which they relate in proportion, size, scale and material.
- 2.5.22: New pergolas constructed as an attachment to a primary or accessory structure shall be reviewed as a building addition and shall not damage or obscure historic character defining features.
- 2.5.23: New pergolas shall not be constructed in such a manner that abutment or attachment to an existing structure will allow for the pooling of moisture against or the infiltration of moisture into an existing structure.
- 2.5.24: The bottom of the canopy of a new pergola shall not exceed eight (8) feet above the finished floor height of the structure to which it relates, and the overall height of a pergola should not exceed nine (9) feet and shall be compatible with the building to which it relates in proportion, size, scale and material.
- 2.5.25: Freestanding pergolas may have concrete floors; however, permeable flooring materials are recommended. Posts may be set in concrete.
- 2.5.26: Pergolas shall be constructed of wood or sustainable alternative materials that closely resemble wood and may have decorative functional metal elements such as wrought iron where appropriate. Synthetic materials that do not closely replicate historic fabric, such as plastic and vinyl, are prohibited.
- 2.5.27: Pergolas with columns or walls constructed of permanent building materials such as brick, stucco, or stone shall be reviewed as new construction.

3.4 Pergola or Freestanding Trellis (See also 2.5, Landscape and Landscape Elements)

Policy: A pergola or freestanding trellis, as original historic building elements, are historically important features and should be retained and preserved. A trellis is a freestanding grid that is used to define or screen outdoor spaces.

Design Justification: As popular features for Bungalow, Craftsman and other early 20th century building styles, pergolas and freestanding trellis, contribute to the historic character of a building and convey its age and style.

Sustainability Justification: The use of a pergola or freestanding trellis helps to provide shade to a building and uses screening through vegetation rather than other materials.

- 3.4.3. Do not add a new pergola or freestanding trellis on a prominent (visible from the public right-of-way) elevation where none existed historically.

- 3.4.4: A missing pergola or freestanding trellis may be reconstructed if based on accurate evidence of original configuration, placement and detail as supported by historic photographs.

4.5 Accessory Buildings

Policy: Accessory buildings could have been very modest, simple rectangular buildings such as barns, garages or outbuildings with one large opening for an overhead or sliding garage door or more ornate children's playhouse, workshops or carriage houses with materials and details that matched the main building. Garages are addressed separately in the preceding section within this chapter.

The retention of existing, accessory buildings is encouraged. Refurbishment and modifications to historic accessory buildings is preferred to demolition and replacement. New accessory buildings are permitted where necessary, and they should have their own form. However, they should appear as secondary structures and not visually overwhelm or compete with the property's other historic buildings.

Design Justification: The way in which new accessory buildings relate to other historic buildings of a property is important in historic districts. A new accessory building directly affects the integrity of the property as a whole. Therefore, a new accessory building should not detract from the historic character of the property.

Sustainability Justification: New accessory building design and construction should adhere to principles of sustainability in materials, design, and energy efficiency.

- 4.5.1: Pre-fabricated storage units, such as garden sheds, less than six feet in height may be located in back yards.
- 4.5.2: Pre-fabricated units must have a minimum three foot setback from side or back property lines.
- 4.5.3: Acceptable exterior materials for pre-fabricated units include those listed in the "Exterior Materials at New Construction" section of this chapter.
- 4.5.4: Plastic pre-fabricated storage units may be used. Metal sided units are not acceptable for such buildings.
- 4.5.5: The appearance and location of a new accessory building should be based on the appearance of the historic accessory building if such existed. Use historic photographs and other documentation such as Sanborn Fire Insurance maps for guidance as to size and location of a previous accessory building on the property.
- 4.5.6: If documentation of a historical accessory building at the site is not available, the size, design and location of a new accessory building should be in keeping with other accessory buildings in the block and historic district.
- 4.5.7: Accessory buildings should be located in the back yard.
- 4.5.8: Design of new accessory buildings shall be secondary to that of the

main historic building and should be secondary to the design of the property's historic garage.

- 4.5.9: Accessory buildings more than six feet tall should be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to the main residential building. Additionally, new accessory buildings may relate to similar accessory buildings within the historic district.
- 4.5.10: Materials used at accessory buildings should reflect the use and function of the accessory building, and not necessarily that of the primary building. Materials used at exterior facades of accessory buildings were often different (simpler and less costly) than material used for the main building.
- 4.5.11: New accessory buildings shall follow the historic side and back yard setback patterns of other accessory buildings on the property, in the block or in the historic district.
- 4.5.12: Spacing and size of window and door openings should be similar to their historic counterparts within the block or historic district, as should the proportion of window to wall space.
- 4.5.13: Ramps or other accessibility-related construction should be installed in a way that does not damage the historic fabric of other historic buildings and should be designed and located to be as unobtrusive as possible.
- 4.5.14: If mechanical equipment, skylights or solar panels are placed on the roof of an accessory building, they should be set back or screened so that they are not visible to a person standing at ground level on the opposite side of an adjacent street or public right-of-way.

- a. Considerations: The applicant proposes a detached pergola rather than the previously proposed new garage to accommodate the garage remodel to include a guest house. The pergola is proposed east of the garage facing Shartel at this corner lot. The proposed pergola materials are consistent with the guidelines. The applicant has modified the application to include lattice sides rather than the large boards that were originally proposed. The more trellis-like approach may be more consistent with the historic character of the district.

The Standards and Guidelines indicate that accessory structures, of which a structure to cover automobiles may be considered, shall follow the historic side yard and back yard setback patterns. They also direct us to not add a pergola to a prominent elevation, noted as “visible from the public right of way.” The proposed pergola or accessory structure is visible from the street or public right of way at this corner lot.

The addition of tightly spaced lattice (3/4 inch) used for screening, may not be consistent with the common perception of a pergola. The Standards and Guidelines define a pergola as an open grid, supported by rows of columns, for growing vines; most often a series of wood beams supporting narrow boards supported by wood columns; may be attached to a building or covering a garden or walkway. The addition of polycarbonate roof panels across the top of the pergola is not supported by the Standards and Guidelines.

The proposed pergola height is consistent with the criteria for pergolas, and the structure appears to align with the soffit of the garage. As the structure will be fairly close to the street, it will be visible beyond the gate. The alignment with the soffit may reduce the visibility of the pergola but will also reduce visibility of the existing garage.

It was noted at the July meeting that accommodating parking with a removable, compatible structure that does not permanently impact historic fabric may be preferable to a more dramatic alteration to, or the replacement of, the historic garage. While the pergola is proposed in a location visible from the street, it is aligned with the façade of an accessory structure and not the primary dwelling; which may reduce the extent to which it is considered “prominent.”

b. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the Standards and Guidelines do not support a pergola at a prominent location where visible from the street;
2. That the Standards and Guidelines do not support pergolas constructed of synthetic materials that do not closely replicate historic fabric, such as plastic and vinyl;
3. That the Standards and Guidelines support pergolas constructed of wood or sustainable alternative materials that closely resemble wood;
4. That accessory structures located in the back yard must follow historic side yard and back yard setback patterns;
5. That the proposed pergola is visibly secondary to and differentiated from the structure to which it relates;
6. That the trellis-like application may be consistent with the historic character of the district;
7. That the proposed pergola is not attached to a structure and could be removed in the future.

2. Item 5, Construct playhouse/shed (required).

- a. Description: The applicant is seeking approval for an existing portable playhouse located in the rear yard of a corner lot. The playhouse is four (4) feet by eight (8) feet and it is eight (8) feet tall from ground to ridge. It is constructed of cedar shake shingles, LP Smart siding, and painted cedar doors and shutters.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

4.5 Accessory Buildings (see above)

- c. Considerations: Materials used at accessory buildings should reflect the use and function of the accessory building, and not necessarily that of the primary building. Materials used at exterior facades of accessory buildings were often different (simpler and less costly) than material used for the main building. The playhouse appears to be located outside the property line which may require a revocable permit; it has been described as portable which may allow it to be moved within the property line.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed accessory building is secondary to the primary dwelling in size, location, material, and design;
2. That the proposed accessory building is located so as to minimize visibility from the public right of way on NW 16th Street;
3. That the proposed accessory building is minimally visible from N Shartel Avenue;
4. That the proposed accessory building appears to be moderately screened by existing fencing and landscaping;
5. That accessory buildings should be in the back yard;
6. That accessory buildings shall follow the historic side and back yard setback patterns of the historic accessory structure or other accessory buildings in the block or district;
7. That the proposed structure is small, low and modest in design.

E. **HPCA-23-00047 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

1. **Approve Item 2, Construct pergola (elective), with unique circumstances and conditions** with the specific findings that the proposed work, with the **agreed-upon conditions**, will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; that the following **unique circumstances** exist; that the items do not strictly comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines or are not addressed by them, but are nonetheless consistent with the spirit and intent of the Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the Standards and Guidelines do not support a pergola at a prominent location or where visible from the street;
2. That the Standards and Guidelines do not support pergolas constructed of synthetic materials that do not closely replicate historic fabric, such as plastic and vinyl;
3. That the Standards and Guidelines support pergolas constructed of wood or sustainable alternative materials that closely resemble wood;
4. That accessory structures located in the back yard must follow historic side yard and back yard setback patterns;
5. That the proposed pergola is visibly secondary to and differentiated from the structure to which it relates;
6. That the trellis-like application may be consistent with the historic character of the district;
7. That the proposed pergola is not attached to a structure and could be removed in the future;

8. That the Sustainability Justification states that the use of a pergola or freestanding trellis helps to provide shade to a building and uses screening through vegetation rather than other materials.

Condition:

- 1) That the polycarbonate roof panels be excluded from the pergola as they are not supported by the Standards and Guidelines.

Unique Circumstance:

- 1) That the pergola, though visible from the street, does not obscure a prominent elevation and facilitates the ongoing use and preservation of the historic garage structure.
3. **Approve Item 5, Construct playhouse/shed (required), with the following conditions,** with the specific findings that the proposed work, with the **agreed-upon conditions**, will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; the items comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed accessory building is secondary to the primary dwelling in size, location, material, and design;
2. That the proposed accessory building is located so as to minimize visibility from the public right of way on N 16th Street;
3. That the proposed accessory building is minimally visible from N Shartel Avenue;
4. That the proposed accessory building appears to be moderately screened by existing fencing and landscaping;
5. That accessory buildings should be in the back yard;
6. That accessory buildings shall follow the historic side and back yard setback patterns of the historic accessory structure or other accessory buildings in the block or district;
7. That the proposed structure is small, low and modest in design;

Condition:

1. That the applicant will receive a revocable permit (if needed); or move the playhouse within the property line.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of Chapter 59 the Oklahoma City Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

rj