



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

August 2, 2023

HPCA-22-00071

Agenda Item: VI.C.1.

Case Number: HPCA-22-00071

Property Address: 108 NW 25th Street

District: Jefferson Park Historic District

Applicant: Creative Home Designs
Fallon Brooks
100 N Broadway
3Edmond, OK 73034

Owner: Bad Apple Equities, LLC
Kayla Watson
13909 Technology Drive, Ste B
Oklahoma City, OK 73134

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Construct house (elective);
2. Construct garage (elective);
3. Install mechanical equipment (elective);
4. Install paving (elective);
5. Install fence (elective)
6. Revise previously approved items 1, 2, and 4 to accommodate setback and ROW (required).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

This proposal includes items 3 and 5, installation of mechanical equipment and installation of a fence. These items were not previously approved due to lack of illustration on the site plan.

The proposal includes item 6, which proposes the revision of items 1, 2, and 4 for placement of all new construction on the site, consistent with the historic setback and ROW requirements. Ultimately the house will move south, and the garage will move north, reducing the space between the structures.

2. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 25th Street between N Robinson Ave and I-235.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: N/A

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1998

National Register Listing: 1995

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey (property no longer extant):

108 Northwest 25th, 1922. This is a one-story Colonial Revival frame house with boxed eaves. The symmetrical façade features a central entrance with an eyebrow hood supported by triangular brackets. Paired windows flank the entrance. There is a wall end chimney on the west elevation. The exterior is sheathed with weatherboard. The front hip of the roof has been replaced with a front gable with no eaves; the building is noncontributing because of this alteration.

Additional Information:

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 1-story frame dwelling with a 1-story frame “autohouse” at the shared driveway on the east. The dwelling is indicated with shingles, typically wood. The shared garage is indicated with composition roofing, indicative of a flat roof for this period. The 1949 edition of the maps indicates composition shingles on the dwelling. Later editions show no changes to the site.

4. Existing Conditions

The site is presently vacant. Fencing not consistent with the Guidelines exists on the site.

The property is zoned R-4.

5. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

| Case Number | Date | Owner | Decision |
|--|----------------|---------------|----------------------------|
| HPCA-22-00071 | August 3, 2022 | Bad Apple | Approved |
| Infill construction of a dwelling, a garage, and installation of paving. | | | |
| HPCA-09-072 | July 1, 2009 | Michael Raven | Recommendation of approval |
| Recommendation to City Council regarding the historic integrity of the dwelling as related to demolition as a dilapidated structure. Loss of integrity was the result of a house fire. | | | |

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

1. Item 3, Install mechanical equipment (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes installation of two compressor units in the west side yard toward the south (rear) end of the dwelling.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.4 Service and Mechanical Areas

Policy: Mechanical equipment, such as HVAC units and satellite dishes, should be located out of public view. They should be screened with landscaping (best) or fencing (acceptable).

Design Justification: Most mechanical units and equipment are non-historic additions to buildings, and the effect of their visual impact on a property's or district's historic character should be minimized.

Sustainability Justification: Maintaining equipment ensures its continued use, which conserves materials required for replacement. Screening with landscaping is preferred over fencing and the plants absorb carbon dioxide. New fencing materials require new resources and energy to manufacture, transport and install.

- 2.4.3: Service and mechanical equipment are commonplace, but their presence must be minimized by appropriate placement and screening. A planted screen is preferred and a fence screen is also acceptable.
- 2.4.2: Mechanical equipment must not be located in public view. Equipment must be screened.

- c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That mechanical equipment must be minimized by both placement and screening.

2. Item 5, Install fence (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes the installation of a fence at perimeter of property. The fence begins on the east, south of the front (north) wall of the garage and travels south to the rear (south) property line. It continues west along the south property line, and then north along the west property line to a point approximately 40 percent back in the west side yard.

No dimension to verify a 40 percent setback in the side yard has been included.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.8 Fences and Walls

Policy: Preserve original or historic fences and fence walls. New fences should be of renewable materials such as wood, woven wire or brick. Vinyl fences are not appropriate.

Design Justification: Fence walls and fences historically marked property boundaries and may have shielded private areas from public view. Historic materials such as wire, wood and brick are compatible materials; vinyl materials introduce an incompatible artificial appearance.

Sustainability Justification: Preserving existing fences and fence walls saves resources. New wood fences constructed of lumber from managed forests represents use of a renewable resource. Petroleum-based vinyl fencing is not a sustainable material.

- 2.8.4: Fences and fence walls in back yards have more flexible requirements than those in side yards or those that are front yard facing because they are less visible from the public right-of-way.
- 2.8.5: Fences and fence walls are generally permitted in side, corner side, and back yards. Interior side and corner side yard fences and fence walls must be set back from the historic front building line by a distance not less than six feet. Depending on the materials and details of a fence and fence wall, additional requirements of this section may apply.
- 2.8.6: A fence or fence wall located on the street facing side yard of a corner property must be set back from the inner edge of a public sidewalk by a minimum distance of two feet, or six feet from the curb where there is no sidewalk.
- 2.8.8: Fences shall be located behind any open front porch of the main building AND the open front porch of the main building of any adjacent property.
- 2.8.9: Fences and fence walls shall be located at or behind the front 40% of the side yard of the main building unless the fence or fence wall is 75% transparent not including posts or columns spaced a minimum of eight feet apart. Depending on the design and architecture of the main building, additional requirements of this section may apply.
- 2.8.10: Opaque fences and fence walls , those that are less than 75% transparent not including posts or columns space a minimum of eight feet apart, shall not obscure view of significant architectural features of the primary building on the property, such as a bay window, porte-cochere, or other significant character defining building projection or feature.
- 2.8.12: Fences and fence walls shall not exceed eight feet in height at the back property line or alley.
- 2.8.13: Fences and fence walls shall not exceed six feet in height on side or front facing locations.

- 2.8.16: Acceptable materials for fences and fence walls are wood, brick, stone, cast iron, iron, chain link, twisted wire, painted aluminum that mimics the appearance of cast iron or iron fences, or a combination of these materials. Materials for fences and fence walls should be consistent with materials historically used at each individual property or within the historic district during the period of significance.
 - 2.8.17: Wood fences may be left unfinished or painted or stained in colors appropriate to the style and period of the property or the district. The exterior flat fence or fence wall surface, if painted, should be compatible with the color of the main building.
 - 2.8.18: Decorative painting and murals shall not be applied to fence or fence wall surfaces visible from the public right-of-way.
 - 2.8.19: Tops of new fences or fence walls may be horizontal, stepped, scooped, arched or parallel with the grade, as appropriate to the style and period of the main building or the historic district.
 - 2.8.21: The side of a fence or wall facing the street or alley shall be the “finished” side.
- c. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That opaque fences shall be 40 percent back in the side yard;
 2. That the finished side of the fence will face alley and street;
 3. That side and front facing fences shall be no more than six feet tall and fences at the rear property line shall be no more than eight feet tall.
3. **Item 6, (required) to revise previously approved items 1, construct dwelling, 2, construct garage, and 4, install paving to accommodate historic set back and existing ROW.**
- a. Description: The applicant proposes reorientation of the site to provide for the historic, built, setback and to accommodate the ROW illustrated in the new site plan. The dwelling will move south, into alignment with front walls of abutting dwellings to the east and west. The garage will move north, toward the rear of the dwelling. The proposed paving of the driveway and rear patio will be reduced to accommodate the reduction in space between the house and garage.
- There are obvious differences between the previously approved dwelling elevations, due to redesign of the dwelling to meet the required front yard setback. However, the style of the dwelling remains consistent with the architectural style of the previously approved dwelling; the height and dimensions have not increased; the massing, scale, proportion, and wall to window ratios remain compatible with adjacent similar structures; and the proposed materials remain the same.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.2 Setbacks

Policy: Maintaining historical patterns of development including front and corner side-yard setbacks is an important character-defining feature of a district.

Design Justification: Historic setback patterns are important for maintaining an authentic streetscape and protecting vistas from, and views to, a historic property and district.

Sustainability Justification: Maintaining historic front and side-yard setbacks ensures the preservation of a district's components, sustaining their embodied energy and negating the need for replacement with new resources.

- 2.2.1: Along a streetscape in a historic district, there is often a uniform and unifying setback for buildings from the street. Maintain consistency with historical setbacks to preserve historic development and historic subdivision patterns.
- 2.2.2: Maintain building orientation patterns, for example, with front facades of primary buildings facing and parallel with the street.
- 2.2.3: Maintain established side-yard setbacks and spacing patterns between buildings to reinforce the sequence of individual structures along the streetscape.
- 2.2.4: Maintain established setbacks for accessory buildings
- 2.2.5: Development of vacant lots must respect the historic development of the property and the district in terms of setbacks and relationship between public and private spaces.
- 2.2.6: Accessory buildings should follow the historic setback patterns of the property or other accessory buildings in the streetscape or district when replaced in kind.
- 2.2.7: New construction must be reviewed not only for architectural design, but also for historic back and side-yard setbacks.

4.2 Stand-Alone New Construction

- 4.2.1: New buildings must follow historic setback patterns of the street.
- 4.2.2: New stand-alone and infill buildings should be consistent with historical patterns of development for the property, block and district.
- 4.2.3: Construction of stand-alone and infill buildings should be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to adjacent or nearby buildings and streetscapes.

c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That new construction must follow historic setback patterns of the street and be consistent with historical patterns of development;
2. That the proposed revision is consistent with the intent of the previously

approved Certificate of Appropriateness.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

E. HPCA-22-00071 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

- 1. Approve Items 3 and 5, to install mechanical equipment and fencing** with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; the items comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That mechanical equipment is minimized by both placement and screening (fence).
 2. That opaque fences will be 40 percent back in the side yard;
 3. That the finished side of the fence will face alley and street;
 4. That side and front facing fences will be no more than six feet tall, and fences at the rear property line will be no more than eight feet tall.
- 2. Approve Item 6, to revise site placement of items 1, 2, and 4, the construction of a dwelling and garage, and installation of paving to accommodate historic set back and existing ROW,** with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; the items comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That new construction must follow historic setback patterns of the street and be consistent with historical patterns of development;
2. That the proposed revision is consistent with the intent of the previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: Chapter 59 §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6 of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, as amended.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

map