



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

April 5, 2023
HPCA-23-00012

Agenda Item: VI.D.3.

Case Number: HPCA-23-00012

Property Address: 806 NW 16th Street

District: Mesta Park

Applicant: AMMP Studio, llc
Mike Patterson
216 Cricket Hollow
Edmond, OK 73034

Owner: David Howald
806 NW 16th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73106

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

- 1) Construct deck with outdoor kitchen with wooden guardrail (elective);
- 2) Construct pergola at deck with retractable shade (elective);
- 3) Construct pool and hot tub with concrete deck (elective);
- 4) Install 8 foot tall trellis with chain link mesh (elective);
- 5) Install slide and enclosed access at approximately 11 feet above pool deck (elective);
- 6) Construct outdoor shower at approximately 10.5 feet tall (elective);
- 7) Replace driveway (elective);
- 8) Install patio with pavers and rock (elective);
- 9) Install gutters and downspouts (elective);
- 10) Relocate air conditioner (elective); and
- 11) Install gas generator (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 16th Street, second house west of the intersection of Shartel and NW 16th Street.

2. Site History

Date of Construction: 1920

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1994

National Register Listing: 1983

Additional Information:

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 2-story brick veneered frame dwelling with 1-story front porch extending the entire length of the front north façade. A 1-story frame “autohouse” is indicated on the southwest corner abutting the property line. All structures have shingle roofs.

3. Existing Conditions

The back elevation of the property currently includes a concrete driveway that extends from NW 16th street all the way to the detached garage located at the rear property line. There is also a concrete patio behind the house that is connected to the driveway. The proposed area for the pool, hot tub, slide, and trellis is currently open green space with two trees.

4. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-15-00030	05/06/2015	Emily Stanley & Anthony Kim	Approved
1) Replace 29 non-historic windows (elective).			

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

1. Item 5, Install slide and enclosed access at approximately 11 feet above pool deck

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to build a slide structure on the southeast corner of the proposed pool. The height of the slide structure is 10’-6”, and it will be enclosed with wood siding with a wooden platform, near the top of the structure, which is accessed via a ladder from the ground. Pool slides are not typically reviewed, but this slide structure may require permits and is in excess of 6-feet tall. , The slide structure has been included for this reason.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.5 Landscape & Landscape Elements

- **2.5.5:** Pool slides, play equipment and tree houses in back yards are not subject to review unless a building or other permit is required by the Municipal Code.
- **2.5.33:** Swimming pools, hot tubs, and similar structures shall be located in back yards and shall not encroach into side setbacks or utility easements.
- **2.5.34:** Swimming pools are structures and contribute to the overall built space

of the lot, affecting drainage conditions of the lot and adjacent properties; therefore, impermeable pool decks shall be constructed to direct water away from surrounding structures and toward storm drains, French drains, or water harvesting containers.

- 2.5.3: Landscape elements in back yards, not visible from any street or adjacent property and less than six feet in height are not subject to review unless a building or other type of permit is required by the Municipal Code.

c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the slide structure is located in the back yard and will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way.

2. Item 6, Construct outdoor shower at approximately 10.5 feet tall

- a. Description: The applicant proposes the addition of an outdoor shower. The shower will measure 11' in height, and will be constructed of wood. The placement of the outdoor shower will be over existing pavement, close to the historic structure, so the increase in lot coverage and the visual impact will be minimal.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

4.5 Accessory Buildings

- **4.5.5:** The appearance and location of a new accessory building should be based on the appearance of the historic accessory building if such existed. Use historic photographs and other documentation such as Sanborn Fire Insurance maps for guidance as to size and location of a previous accessory building on the property.
- **4.5.6:** If documentation of a historical accessory building at the site is not available, the size, design and location of a new accessory building should be in keeping with other accessory buildings in the block and historic district.
- **4.5.7:** Accessory buildings should be located in the back yard.
- **4.5.8:** Design of new accessory buildings shall be secondary to that of the main historic building and should be secondary to the design of the property's historic garage.
- **4.5.9:** Accessory buildings more than six feet tall should be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to the main residential building. Additionally, new accessory buildings may relate to similar accessory buildings within the historic district.
- **4.5.10:** Materials used at accessory buildings should reflect the use and function of the accessory building, and not necessarily that of the primary building. Materials used at exterior facades of accessory buildings were often different (simpler and less costly) than material used for the main building.
- **4.5.11:** New accessory buildings shall follow the historic side and back yard

setback patterns of other accessory buildings on the property, in the block or in the historic district.

- **4.5.12:** Spacing and size of window and door openings should be similar to their historic counterparts within the block or historic district, as should the proportion of window to wall space.
- **2.5.3:** Landscape elements in back yards, not visible from any street or adjacent property and less than six feet in height are not subject to review unless a building or other type of permit is required by the Municipal Code.

c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the outdoor shower will be minimally visible from the public right-of-way at the street.
2. The shower placement will not contribute to an increase in the overall lot coverage.

3. Item 9, Install gutters and downspouts

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to install new gutters and downspouts around the perimeter of the historic structure. The gutters and downspouts will be a painted metal that will match the historic structure.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.7 Roofs

- **3.7.21:** Flashing shall be copper or other metal finished to match the roof color. Unfinished galvanized metal flashing shall not be used.
- **3.7.22:** Gutters and downspouts may be installed and shall be unfinished copper or painted or powder finished metal unless physical or photographic evidence demonstrates historical use of alternative materials or finish for the specific building.
- **3.7.23:** Exposed galvanized metal or non-painted gutters and downspouts are not permitted.
- **3.7.24:** New gutters shall be painted or powder finished to match the fascia color of the building unless copper is used. New downspouts shall be painted or powder finished to match the building or the building trim unless copper is used.
- **3.7.25:** Copper gutters and down spouts may be installed when appropriate for the style of the building. Historical gutter shapes shall only be used when consistent with historical physical or photographic evidence of their use at the specific building.
- **3.7.26:** The original shape, line, pitch and overhang of historic roofs are significant to the overall character of the building and must be retained.

c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the new gutters and downspouts meet all relevant Guidelines and will help to control water runoff from the roof of the historic structure.

4. Items 10 & 11, Relocate air conditioner; & install gas generator

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to relocate the existing condenser to the immediate western side of the proposed rear deck. The applicant proposes the addition of a 4' wooden fence for additional screening between the new location for the condenser and the driveway. The applicant also proposes the addition of a new gas generator on the eastern elevation of the property north of the existing side yard fence. The new gas generator will be screened with landscaping and a new 4' fence.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.4 Service and Mechanical Areas

- **2.4.3:** Service and mechanical equipment are commonplace, but their presence must be minimized by appropriate placement and screening. A planted screen is preferred and a fence screen is also acceptable.
 - **2.4.4:** Service equipment (including ground mounted solar collectors), mechanical areas and trash receptacles, if proposed, must be screened from the street and other pedestrian areas. Loading areas should be located away from primary facades and be well maintained.
- c. Recommended Specific Findings:
 1. That mechanical equipment must be appropriately placed;
 2. That mechanical equipment must be screened;
 3. That the proposed relocation and addition of mechanical is proposed to be screened and meets relevant Guidelines.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Items 1, 2, & 4, Construct deck with outdoor kitchen with wooden guardrail; Construct pergola at deck with retractable shade; & Install 8 foot tall trellis with chain link mesh

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to construct a painted wood deck 2' above grade. The deck will include an area for an outdoor kitchen and a pergola with retractable shade. The deck will also feature a 3' guardrail comprised of painted wood to match the existing guardrail on the second story balcony. The applicant has indicated that the proposed deck and historic structure will have some separation between them.

The applicant also proposes the addition of a wire mesh/chain link trellis on the south (rear) elevation of the property. The proposed trellis would be 8' tall running from the proposed slide structure to the edge of the existing detached garage. There will be about 2' of separation between the existing detached garage and the proposed trellis. There is

an existing 8' wood fence on the rear property line south of the proposed trellis. The proposed pool equipment will be located between the two.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.5 Landscape & Landscape Elements

- **2.5.19:** Adding a pergola (see also 3.4, Pergola or Freestanding Trellis) to a back elevation can help shade an outdoor space and can offer some degree of shade to the interior, which means added energy efficiency. Do not add a pergola or trellis to a prominent elevation where none historically existed. Reconstruction of a missing pergola or trellis should be based on accurate evidence of the original design.
- **2.5.20:** New pergolas, not visible from the public right of way, may be constructed in back yards, at rear elevations or at accessory structures.
- **2.5.21:** New pergolas shall be compatible with the building to which they relate in proportion, size, scale and material.
- **2.5.22:** New pergolas constructed as an attachment to a primary or accessory structure shall be reviewed as a building addition and shall not damage or obscure historic character defining features.
- **2.5.23:** New pergolas shall not be constructed in such a manner that abutment or attachment to an existing structure will allow for the pooling of moisture against or the infiltration of moisture into an existing structure.
- **2.5.24:** The bottom of the canopy of a new pergola shall not exceed eight (8) feet above the finished floor height of the structure to which it relates, and the overall height of a pergola should not exceed nine (9) feet and shall be compatible with the building to which it relates in proportion, size, scale and material.
- **2.5.25:** Freestanding pergolas may have concrete floors; however, permeable flooring materials are recommended. Posts may be set in concrete.
- **2.5.26:** Pergolas shall be constructed of wood or sustainable alternative materials that closely resemble wood and may have decorative functional metal elements such as wrought iron where appropriate. Synthetic materials that do not closely replicate historic fabric, such as plastic and vinyl, are prohibited.
- **2.5.27:** Pergolas with columns or walls constructed of permanent building materials such as brick, stucco, or stone shall be reviewed as new construction.
- **2.5.28:** New rear decks shall be compatible with the building to which they relate in proportion, size, scale and material.
- **2.5.29:** New rear decks that exceed six (6) feet in height or are visible from the public right of way require a certificate of appropriateness.
- **2.5.30:** New rear decks shall be constructed of wood or sustainable alternative materials that closely resemble wood and may have decorative or functional metal elements such as wrought iron where appropriate. Synthetic materials that do not closely replicate historic fabric, such as plastic and vinyl are prohibited.
- **2.5.31:** Rear decks that permanently attach to the structure, have a roof, or are constructed of permanent building materials such as brick, stucco or stone shall

be reviewed as building additions. CMU is prohibited unless matching documented original or historic building material on site.

- **2.5.32:** New decks shall not be constructed in such a manner that abutment or attachment to an existing structure will allow for the pooling of moisture against or the infiltration of moisture into an existing structure

3.4 Pergola or Freestanding Trellis

- **3.4.1:** Preserve and maintain original or historic pergolas and freestanding trellis. Ordinary maintenance and repair does not require review.
- **3.4.2:** Up to 50% of an original or historic pergola or freestanding trellis may be repaired by replacement without review only if the alteration results in no change in materials, dimensions, design, configuration, texture, surface coatings or visual appearance.
- **3.4.3:** Do not add a new pergola or freestanding trellis on a prominent (visible from the public right-of-way) elevation where none existed historically.
- **3.4.4:** A missing pergola or freestanding trellis may be reconstructed if based on accurate evidence of original configuration, placement and detail as supported by historic photographs.

- c. Considerations: The applicant has indicated that there will be some separation between the historic structure and the proposed deck. However, given its proximity to the historic structure and that it will still be attached to the main structure, the deck should still adhere to the guidelines regarding rear decks. The proposed material for the guardrails on the deck appear to meet the guidelines for a rear deck as the Guidelines indicate that materials used should be of compatible materials for the historic structure to which the deck/pergola relates. The proposed guardrails will match the existing guardrails on the second-story balcony of the historic structure. The proposed location for the deck is existing concrete patio area, and the applicant has indicated that they will remove the concrete that is currently there. The removal of the existing concrete will lessen the total impermeable surface area of the entire lot as well as the overall lot coverage.

The applicant proposes to add a pergola on top of the proposed rear deck. The pergola will be made of wood, and it will include a retractable shade. The height to the top of the pergola measures at 12'-5" and 11'-9" to the bottom of the roof of the pergola. The height from the finished floor of the historic structure to which the pergola and deck relates will be 8'. Guidelines for administrative approval of pergolas stipulate that this height should not to surpass 9' overall, though the Commission may approve pergolas exceeding this Guideline if deemed appropriate. Additionally, there is a Guideline regarding the size of pergolas as they relate to the main structures in terms of height and massing. The proposed pergola and deck appear to appropriately relate in size and material to the historic structure to which they relate.

For the trellis, the applicant has indicated that the material would not be seen due to the intended use for growing ivy. The proposed trellis will not be visible from the public right-of-way since it is on the rear (south) elevation of the property. Additionally, there is an 8' fence on the rear property line that will further screen the trellis from view. The

Guidelines for trellises prohibit non-historic trellises that are visible from the public right-of-way, but there is no information related to appropriate materials for non-historic trellises. The proposed material for the proposed trellis would not be an appropriate material for repairing or reconstructing a historic trellis, but there are no specific Guidelines for new, non-historic trellises that are not visible from the public right-of-way.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the deck and pergola are located on the rear elevation and they will have minimal visual impacts from the public right-of-way;
2. That the proposed deck will not increase the existing lot coverage for the property;
3. That the proposed material for the proposed trellis is neither supported nor prohibited by the Guidelines for a non-historic trellis not visible from the public right-of-way.

2. Item 3, Construct pool and hot tub with concrete deck

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to install a pool and hot tub near the southeast corner of the property. The pool measures 23' by 29'-4". The hot tub will be located in the northeast corner of the pool and the proposed slide structure will be located in the southeast corner of the pool. The proposed concrete pavers will abut the northern and eastern edges of the proposed pool and hot tub, and the pavers will be 3' by 3' with 4" space in between each paver. The related pool equipment will be placed between the rear property fence and the proposed wire mesh trellis.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.5 Landscape & Landscape Elements

- **2.5.33:** Swimming pools, hot tubs, and similar structures shall be located in back yards and shall not encroach into side setbacks or utility easements.
 - **2.5.34:** Swimming pools are structures and contribute to the overall built space of the lot, affecting drainage conditions of the lot and adjacent properties; therefore, impermeable pool decks shall be constructed to direct water away from surrounding structures and toward storm drains, French drains, or water harvesting containers.
 - **2.5.35:** Significant alteration of the topography of a property through extensive grading, removal or alteration of rolled terraces and similar character-defining features, filling or excavating, is not permitted.
 - **2.5.36:** Relocating drainage features is discouraged, unless such actions seek to correct poor surface and storm water run-off drainage situations. Storm water harvesting is encouraged.
 - **2.5.37:** It is not appropriate to alter the overall character of historic districts by substantially reducing the ratio of open space to built space on any site through new construction, additions or introduction of surface paving or other hardscape features.
- c. Considerations: The base for the pavers around the pool will be concrete, which is

required for pools. Pools are considered structures that contribute to the overall lot coverage, so the addition of the pool where none had existed previously will increase the overall lot coverage of the site. The current lot coverage for the site is approximately 61%. The proposed changes will put lot coverage at roughly 62.4% with the proposed pool and hot tub contributing to about a 6% increase on its own. However, the proposed pavers in the driveway (see Items 7 and 8) still allow for permeability, and therefore will offset some of the permeability and lot coverage concerns. The lot coverage would remain about the same without the inclusion of the pavers and the removal of the concrete where the proposed deck is to be located. Therefore, there may not be a significant increase in lot coverage overall.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed pool, hot tub, and concrete pavers will have a minimally visible impact on the site as viewed from the public right-of-way.
2. That the lot coverage will be increased by the proposed additions by about 1.4% due to offsets from the proposed pavers in the driveway and the removal of impermeable surfaces currently on the lot.
3. That the related pool equipment will be screened.

3. Item 7, Replace driveway; and Item 8, Install patio with pavers and rock

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to replace the existing driveway from the front property line to the detached garage in the rear. The applicant has indicated that the pavement is cracked in several places. The pavement will be replaced in kind with two changes. The first change is for the area immediately south of the porte-cochere. This area will use concrete pavers with stones filling the spaces between them. The second change is the removal of the concrete patio immediately south of the house.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.3 Driveways

- **2.3.5:** Maintain the continuity of existing original or historic sidewalks and the curb cut radius or curved approach when replacing an existing driveway or introducing a new driveway.
- **2.3.6:** New concrete for sidewalks, driveways, curbs, and parking lots shall match the aged appearance in design details, color and texture of the existing concrete it replaces or adjacent concrete that will remain. If new concrete is not replacing existing concrete and is not adjacent to any existing concrete it should have an aged appearance in color and finish. New concrete visible from the public right-of-way shall not be bright white in color.
- **2.3.7:** All sidewalks, driveways, and curbs visible from the public right-of-way shall be constructed to maintain the continuity of materials and character present in the district.
- **2.3.8:** Private sidewalks and driveways must be constructed of concrete except

where historical precedent demonstrates the previous existence of brick, stone or other materials, which may be considered appropriate for replacement.

- **2.3.12:** Driveways, eight feet or less in width, may be replaced by a driveway of up to ten feet in width; width may vary as the driveway approaches the garage to correspond to the width of the garage door openings. However, property owners are encouraged to limit the quantity of impervious concrete surfaces to assist in reducing storm water runoff.
- **2.3.16:** New impermeable parking surfaces must be graded to drain toward the street and away from buildings.
- **2.3.17:** Although the Municipal Code has specific requirements for surfaces to be used for driving and parking, consideration should be given to the use of permeable paving surfaces, such as unit pavers or recycled-plastic grid systems installed below grade, to reduce run-off and flooding. Crushed rock or pea gravel is not permitted by the Municipal Code as an individual parking surface. Parking directly on the ground (earth, dirt, or grass) is also not permitted. Various types of permeable paving may be appropriate in the back yard as long as the paving is not visible from the public right-of-way and the Municipal Code requirements are met.

- c. Considerations: The Guidelines indicate that new concrete for sidewalks, driveways, curbs, and parking lots shall match the aged appearance in design details, color and texture of the existing concrete it replaces or adjacent concrete that will remain. The applicant has indicated that they will treat the new pavement to give it an aged look. The existing driveway design includes numerous true expansion joints which may illustrate a previous knowledge of the site conditions no longer known. In kind paving should also ensure that design details are replicated in proposed new paving. New concrete visible from the public right-of-way shall not be bright white in color.

The area south of the porte-cochere will not be replaced with concrete. Instead this approximately 550 square foot area will be replaced with 3' by 3' concrete pavers. These pavers will be semipermeable, since the applicant has indicated that the base for these pavers will be compacted gravel, which will help to lessen the overall impact of the proposed changes to the site. The location of the pavers for this patio/driveway area is behind the porte-cochere and is not readily visible from the public right-of-way.

The applicant also proposes to remove the existing concrete patio area that currently abuts the historic house. This is the proposed area for the deck, and the intention for removing the concrete from this area is to allow for more permeability on the site as well as to offset some of the increased lot coverage from the proposed pool and hot tub.

- c. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That new concrete for sidewalks, driveways, curbs, and parking lots shall match the aged appearance in design details, color and texture of the existing concrete it replaces or adjacent concrete that will remain.
 2. That integral color does not provide an aged appearance; but topical treatments appear to be successful.

3. That the replacement of the driveway will not change the dimensions of what is already present beyond removing the concrete patio at the rear of the house.
4. That using a base comprised of compacted gravel or a similar base will allow for some increased permeability.
5. That removing the concrete patio will reduce the lot coverage.
6. That the use of pavers may lessen the impacts of stormwater runoff for the property.

E. HPCA-23-00012 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve Items 5, 6, 9, 10, & 11, Install slide and enclosed access at approximately 11 feet above pool deck; Construct outdoor shower at approximately 10.5 feet tall; Install gutters and downspouts; Relocate air conditioner; and Install gas generator** with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the slide structure is located in the back yard and will be minimally visible from the public right of way at the street.
 2. That the outdoor shower will be minimally visible from the public right of way at the street.
 3. The shower placement will not contribute to an increase in the overall lot coverage.
 4. That the new gutters and downspouts meet the guidelines and will help to control water runoff from the roof of the historic structure.
 5. That mechanical equipment must be appropriately placed;
 6. That mechanical equipment must be screened;
 7. That the proposed relocation and addition of mechanical equipment is proposed to be screened, and meets relevant Guidelines.
2. **Approve Items 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, & 8 Construct deck with outdoor kitchen with wooden guardrail; Construct pergola at deck with retractable shade; Construct pool and hot tub with concrete deck; Install 8-foot tall trellis with chain link mesh; Replace driveway; & Install patio with pavers and rock,** with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; the items comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the deck and pergola are located on the rear elevation and they will have minimal visual impacts from the public right-of-way;

2. That the proposed deck will not increase the existing lot coverage for the property;
3. That the proposed material for the proposed trellis is neither supported nor prohibited by the Guidelines for a non-historic trellis not visible from the public right-of-way.
4. That the proposed pool, hot tub, and concrete pavers will have a minimally visual impact on the site as viewed from the public right-of-way at the street.
5. That the lot coverage will be increased by the proposed additions by about 1.4% due to offsets from the proposed pavers in the driveway and the removal of impermeable surfaces currently on the lot.
6. That the related pool equipment will be screened.
7. That new concrete for sidewalks, driveways, curbs, and parking lots shall match the aged appearance in design details, color and texture of the existing concrete it replaces or adjacent concrete that will remain.
8. That integral color does not provide an aged appearance; but topical treatments appear to be successful.
9. That the replacement of the driveway will not change the dimensions of what is already present beyond removing the concrete patio at the rear of the house.
10. That using a base comprised of compacted gravel or a similar base will allow for some increased permeability.
11. That removing the concrete patio will reduce the lot coverage.
12. That the use of pavers may lessen the impacts of stormwater runoff for the property.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

DC