



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

April 5, 2023
HPCA-21-00192

Agenda Item: VI.D.1.

Case Number: HPCA-21-00192

Property Address: 2301 NW 26th Street

District: Shepherd Historic District

Applicant: Living Spaces LLC
Jon Reinke
2304 NW 26th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73107

Owner: Carol Reinke
2301 NW 26th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73107-2511

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

5. Revise Item 2) Replace garage (elective) to amend the garage door proposal.

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant was approved for replacement of the existing garage 612 square foot, 1-story garage with a 750 square foot, 1-story garage. The project is nearly completed. The approved wood panel garage door is not currently available, and the applicant proposes a metal door with composite trim applied instead.

2. Location

Project site is located on the northwest corner of the intersection of NW 26th Street and N Youngs Blvd.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1936

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1998

National Register Listing: 1997

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:

2301 Northwest 26th, C. 1931. This one-story, brick Tudor Revival house has a cross

gabled composition roof with two front facing gables, both projecting. The centered gable projects the farthest, and serves as the porch; its columns are arched and winged. The left gable has a triple-arched ribbon of windows, and an arched vent above. An eyebrow dormer is over a three-ribbon window on the right front. Three gables face to the right and a secondary entrance is also on the right side. There is a detached garage in the rear, facing the side street.

Additional Information:

The 1950 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 1-story, brick-veneered, frame dwelling with 1-story, small, centrally located, front porch on the south façade. A 1-story frame “autohouse” with attached dwelling on the west end is indicated toward the north property line. All structures have shingle roofs. The 1955 edition of the maps indicates the dwelling and porch roofs to be composition material.

Prior to 1999, it appears that an addition was constructed on the rear (north) end of the dwelling that included an attic build-out and exterior stair. That addition expanded the rear of the structure to both the east and the west, creating non-historic projections. Between 2006 and 2009, the current property owner proposed enclosure of a side porch at that addition on the west side, and reconstruction and configuration of the deck and stair that access the upper exit at the rear of dwelling.

4. Existing Conditions

The previously existing garage is no longer extant, and the approved replacement garage is in place. A steel overhead door is temporarily in place, pending approval of an alternate.

5. Previous Actions

HPCA-21-00192 includes items to demolish garage, approved 02/02/2022; replace garage, approved 04/06/2022; revise garage to include a pair of pedestrian doors, approved 08/16/2022; revise garage to increase height by 12 inches, approved 10/05/2022.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 5: Revision of 2) Replace garage, to include the installation of a metal overhead door with composite trim.

- a. Description: The applicant proposes a change from a simple, wood paneled, overhead door with recessed panels to a carriage style overhead door with a metal face and

applied composite trim.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

1.4 Historic Preservation and Sustainability

Sustainable Development

The word “sustainability” has become a common part of our modern language. One familiar definition that was popularized in 1987 by a publication of the United Nations Commission on Environment and Development is “*Sustainable development meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.*” The concept of this definition is that sustainable development requires consideration of the finite supply of resources.

1.9 Overall Approach and Format

- If material replacement in kind is not feasible or practical, the HPC may consider the use of appropriate substitute materials that are sustainable.

4.4 Garages

Design Justification: The way in which a new garage relates to other historic buildings of a property is important in historic districts. A new garage directly affects the integrity of the property as a whole. For this reason, a new garage should not detract from the historic character of the property.

- 4.4.1: Garage doors should typically be painted to match the color of the garage. For garages that are “high style” it may be appropriate to use the color of the garage doors as a complementary or accent color to the building color scheme.
- 4.4.2: Electronic garage door openers may be installed and used.
- 4.4.5: Construction of a replacement garage shall approximate the original configuration, form, massing, style, placement and detail of the former garage as described by photographic or other documentation.
- 4.4.9: Materials used for a new garage should reflect the property’s historical development and the use and function of the garage. Materials used for the exterior facades of a garage were often different (and less costly) than those used for the primary building.
- 4.4.10: A garage may be of ‘modest’ or ‘high-style’ design to complement a property’s historical development. Often, a new garage should be modest with a simple rectangular plan and form and a low-pitched, gabled or hipped roof. Doors and windows may have little or no ornamentation.

Garage Doors, Openings, and Doors

- 4.4.14: Spacing and size of window and door openings in a new garage should

be consistent with the historical development of the property and similar to their historic counterparts within the streetscape or historic district, as should the proportion of window to wall space.

- 4.4.18: New garage vehicle doors in all other districts may be solid wood, wood veneer with a concealed metal frame, or composite materials including fiberglass or wood fiber (85% minimum wood fiber content). Doors should first match the historic design. When the historic design is unknown then the doors should match the design of other historic garage doors used in the respective district. A paneled design may be appropriate.
- 4.4.20: Metal garage vehicle doors with a paneled design are acceptable in the Heritage Hills East, Putnam Heights, and Shepherd districts. These doors can be used at garages that are modest in style, located at the back of the lot, and minimally visible from the street or public right-of-way. Garage vehicle doors that are highly visible from a public street including the side street of a corner lot should not be metal.
- 4.4.22: If a historic garage is to be demolished to allow the construction of a new garage, it is encouraged that the historic doors be salvaged and re-used at the new garage, or if this is not possible, that the historic garage doors be replicated in the new garage design.
- 4.4.23: Doors at new high style garages should complement the garage in design and materials. The use of paneled wood garage doors or custom garage doors is encouraged at these locations.

4.6 Exterior Materials at New Construction

Policy: Materials used in the construction of new buildings, additions, garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible in appearance and design with common building materials in the district, or typical of structures of the proposed style, type, age and location.

Design Justification: The form, materials and details of exterior walls and embellishments, as well as their scale, texture and variety, contribute to the overall character of the historic district.

Windows

- 4.6.11: Windows in new stand-alone construction must be similar to their counterparts within the property, block or historic district. These windows may be wood, vinyl clad wood, metal clad wood, or metal with a profile similar to the windows of other buildings on the property. For new infill construction the profile must be similar to the windows used on other properties in the block or historic district.
- 4.6.12: New windows may have a simpler window pane pattern than their historic counterparts; for example, if the historic windows are 6/1 (read “six over one”), then 1/1 windows of the same overall size may be used.
- 4.6.14: Clear glass must be used in all windows. Reflective, tinted, patterned

or sandblasted glass in windows is generally not appropriate. Patterned, leaded or colored glass can be used in transoms and sidelights when established by the architectural style of the building or when supported by historical documentation for a specific property or structure.

Doors

- 4.6.19: Recommendations and requirements for garage type doors are described in the “Garage” section of this chapter.
- c. Considerations: The overhead garage door of the previously existing garage was metal and was not original to the structure. It was a simple, raised panel door. Much of the exterior fabric of the structure was non-historic, and the garage had undergone various alterations over time. The previously approved recessed panel door is indicative of many simpler garage doors in the area. The known historic overhead doors in the Shepherd Historic District are wood, some with very unique design components particularly at front-facing attached garages. The new proposal for the garage door changes not only material of the approved door but also the design components.

The Guidelines indicate that wood paneled garage doors are appropriate though 4.4.23 also indicates that custom made doors may be appropriate at high-style garages. Custom made doors have previously been interpreted to mean wood doors made specifically to address the character of a particular building.

The overhead door proposed for this application includes visible metal components and applied composite trim. Neither of these materials appear to be supported by the Standards and Guidelines; the metal based on location and the composite based on material. The Standards and Guidelines state that “garage vehicle doors that are highly visible from a public street including the side street of a corner lot should not be metal.” Metal doors generally do not have the appearance of a wood door and often are manufactured with a wood grain appearance that is not similar to the appearance of painted, historic, wood finishes.

The standards and guidelines also mention synthetic materials that do not closely replicate historic fabric, such as plastic and vinyl in various locations. These products are prohibited in part because they do not adequately emulate the appearance of historic fabric and in part due to the toxicity of the life cycle of the products.

The Standards and Guidelines support sustainability in that preservation and reuse is promoted while replacement is discouraged (Chapter 1). The Standards and Guidelines support sustainability in the material selection process for replacement and new construction while maintaining an appearance that is consistent with that of building materials used in historic construction practices and while making environmentally sound material choices.

Polymer composites appear to have an extensive number of uses in the construction industry. Fiber reinforced polymer composites may be synthetic or may be biodegradable. As an exterior feature, the proposed garage door components designated as composite are presumed to be synthetic composite. The applicant is attempting to verify.

Vinyl and plastic are specifically prohibited in various locations in the Standards and Guidelines. While polymer composites were not directly addressed, we will continue to see technology in building materials evolve to meet consumer needs. End of life cycle and overall environmental impacts for polymer composites appears to be similar to that of plastics and vinyl.

Based on available information, the proposed composite product does not appear to meet Guidelines specific to building materials at new construction, and does not appear to meet the overall sustainability intent of the Standards and Guidelines.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed door is constructed of metal with composite trim;
2. That the Standards and Guidelines do not support a variety of synthetic products that do not closely resemble historic building materials and are detrimental to the environment;
3. That metal overhead doors are not supported at corner lots where visible from the street;
4. That the proposed overhead door design is not consistent with the evolution of the replacement of garage doors designs in the district;
5. That the proposed, revised design choice is not consistent with known historic fabric in the district.

E. HPCA-21-00192 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Continue Item 5 to revise Item 2, construct garage with revised overhead door design and material choice**, with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed door is constructed of metal with composite trim;
2. That the Standards and Guidelines do not support a variety of synthetic products that do not closely resemble historic building materials and are detrimental to the environment;
3. That metal overhead doors are not supported at corner lots where visible from the street;
4. That the proposed overhead door design is not consistent with the evolution of the replacement of garage doors designs in the district;
5. That the proposed, revised design choice is not consistent with known historic fabric in the district;
6. That the garage door is highly visible.

Additional Information: Revised garage door design and/or materials, as directed by the Commission.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

ady