



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

April 5, 2023

HPCA-22-00126

Agenda Item: VI.C.2.

Case Number: HPCA-22-00126

Property Address: 621 NW 41st Street

District: Crown Heights Historic District

Applicant: Bockus Payne Architecture
Collin Fleck
1001 NW 63rd Street, Suite 300
Oklahoma City, OK 73116

Owner: 621 Street LLC
Sam Rainbolt
1920 NW 56th Terrace
Oklahoma City, OK 73118

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

5) Revise previously approved items: 1) Construct addition with back porch to alter roof form, remove equipment doors, and modify window and door openings (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant proposes to construct a rear addition with porch and to relocate or modify related features including mechanical equipment, fencing, and paving. The revision differs slightly from that previously approved by the Commission in that the proposal includes a hipped roof rather than gable end, a window on the west rather than a door, and a sidelight at the north patio door.

2. Location

Project site is located on the north side of NW 41st Street, mid-block between N Walker and N Shartel.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1936

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1977

National Register Listing: 1995

National Register Description:

C. 1936. This two-story, painted brick Italian Renaissance residence has a moderately pitched, hipped roof with slightly overhanging eaves, brackets, and composition shingles. Apart from an east wing, the façade is symmetrical and features double hung 8/8 windows, a paneled wood door, and quoins. A decorative surround accents the entrance. There is a brick chimney on the west elevation, as well as a porte-cochere with a shed roof. The garage is detached.

Additional Information:

The 1950 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance Maps shows a two-story brick-veneered dwelling with a one-story porch at the front, southeast corner. The form of the house is rectangular, with a small projection off the rear, northwest corner. A one-story brick veneered “autohouse” is illustrated in the northwest corner of the backyard. All structures are indicated to have shingle roofs.

4. Existing Conditions

The northeast porch appears to have been enclosed, and the porte-cochere added, sometime between 1955 and 1996. A projection at the rear, northwest corner of the structure appears larger than what is shown on Sanborn maps and may also be a later alteration.

5. Previous Actions

This application was previously reviewed and approved by the Commission November 2, 2022, contingent upon submittal of fully dimensioned drawings, details of materials and products, including the light fixtures, porch columns, doors, and screening for mechanical equipment relocation.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

1. None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 5, Revise previously approved items: 1) Construct addition with back porch to alter roof form, remove equipment doors, and modify window and door openings (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to revise the previously approved proposal to incorporate a combination flat and hipped roof at the addition and to modify some openings on the proposed addition. The proposed addition has a combination hipped and flat roof. The height of the roof sits below the ridge line of the existing hipped roof.

The proposed revision adds a multi-light, hung window at the first floor, west elevation. A single, multi-light hung window is proposed above. On the first floor of the east

elevation, a half wall wraps a grill area on the proposed porch with a pair of French doors beyond. The wall transitions at the east to include a brick screening for mechanical equipment. The north (rear) elevation of the adds a patio door with a sidelight and single, multi-light hung windows at the first and second story. Previously approved louvered doors for a mechanical room at the west elevation have been eliminated.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.5 Landscape & Landscape Elements

Policy: The term “landscape” comprises the exterior environment of a historic property. Landscape elements can be natural or constructed features, including decks, patios, landforms, site furniture, pools, fountains, terraces, sculptures, planters, trellises, pergolas, outdoor lighting and other features, which generally should be located out of public view. Landscape features should be restrained on the fronts of buildings to allow viewing of the “public face” of the property and maintain historic streetscapes.

Design Justification: Just as the site, context and environment are critical to the character of a historic building, property and district, the landscape is also an important character-defining feature of a historic property. Original or historic landscape elements may be important character-defining features of a historic property and should be preserved. Added landscape features are more appropriate in back or side yards.

Sustainability Justification: Retain existing elements that represent embodied energy or impart some degree of energy efficiency to the building (e.g., a shading pergola). Address sustainability standards when installing new elements, such as light fixtures with solar cells. Screening with landscaping is preferred over fencing, as fencing requires new resources and energy to manufacture and transport. Landscaping with native and low-water plants conserves water.

- 2.5.28: New rear decks shall be compatible with the building to which they relate in proportion, size, scale and material.
- 2.5.29: New rear decks that exceed six (6) feet in height or are visible from the public right of way require a certificate of appropriateness.
- 2.5.30: New rear decks shall be constructed of wood or sustainable alternative materials that closely resemble wood and may have decorative or functional metal elements such as wrought iron where appropriate. Synthetic materials that do not closely replicate historic fabric, such as plastic and vinyl are prohibited.
- 2.5.31: Rear decks that permanently attach to the structure, have a roof, or are constructed of permanent building materials such as brick, stucco or stone shall be reviewed as building additions. CMU is prohibited unless matching documented original or historic building material on site.

- 2.5.32: New decks shall not be constructed in such a manner that abutment or attachment to an existing structure will allow for the pooling of moisture against or the infiltration of moisture into an existing structure.
- 2.5.37: It is not appropriate to alter the overall character of historic districts by substantially reducing the ratio of open space to built space on any site through new construction, additions or introduction of surface paving or other hardscape features.

4.3 Building Additions

Policy: Additions should complement and not detract from the overall historic character of the historic district.

Design Justification: The way in which a historic building and an addition to it relate is important in protecting the integrity of the historic property and district. An addition directly affects the integrity of the building as a whole. Building additions should not detract from the historic character of the historic building or district.

Sustainability Justification: New construction should adhere to principles of sustainability in their materials, design and energy efficiency. If construction of additions results in the removal of original fabric, consideration should be given to maximizing the retention or re-use of existing historic features, details and materials.

- 4.3.1: Additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes, and should be appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building. The incorporation of existing architectural features with new design elements can contribute added interest and compatibility.
- 4.3.2: New additions must be planned so that they are constructed to the back of the property or on a non-character-defining elevation preferably not visible from the public right-of-way. Character-defining features of buildings should not be radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed by an addition. The existing historic building fabric should not be damaged by the installation of a new addition.
- 4.3.3: It is not appropriate to alter the overall character of historic districts by substantially reducing the ratio of open space to built space on any site through new construction, additions or introduction of surface paving or other hardscape feature.
- 4.3.4: New additions shall not exceed 50% of the square footage of the footprint of the existing historic structure (enclosed space only), or 750 square feet, whichever is larger, and shall be no taller, no wider, and no deeper than the existing historic structure.
- 4.3.5: Additions to historic or non-historic buildings should relate to and complement the style of the main building, and may relate to the general style

of the streetscape.

- 4.3.6: An addition to a historic building must be designed to be visibly distinguishable from the original historic building.
- 4.3.7: Additions to historic buildings should be designed so that connections between new construction and historic structures are clearly discernible. A clear definition of the transition between the new addition and the historic structure should be established and maintained.
- 4.3.8: An addition may be differentiated from the historic building by connecting the two with a modest connector, designed to be as transparent and unobtrusive as possible.
- 4.3.9: Historic details in the coping, eaves and parapet of the historic building may be continued at the point where the historic structure connects to the addition.
- 4.3.10: Additions should be clearly secondary to and distinct from the original building. This can be accomplished by providing a clear visual break between the historic building and the addition, by setting the façade of the addition back from that of the historic building, or by constructing a recessed area at the point at which the addition and the historic building join together.
- 4.3.11: Use of different but compatible materials or different (simplified) detailing is also appropriate to differentiate a new addition from the historic building.
- 4.3.12: The design of a new addition must consider and respect the massing, roof shape, bay spacing, cornice lines and materials of the building to which it is being added.
- 4.3.13: An addition may be horizontal (added to a side or back elevation) or vertical (a second story added to an existing one-story). However, vertical additions are not permitted at corner lots, nor in the Mesa Park Historic District. While vertical additions are not prohibited in other districts and internal lots, it is rare that the other requirements and recommendations of this section can be met.
- 4.3.14: Vertical additions to buildings must be located so that they are not visible to a person standing at ground level on the opposite side of an adjacent right-of-way. A vertical addition is not permitted at a corner lot because such an addition would be visible from the side street.
- 4.3.15: Facades of additions facing an alley or rear property line may be simplified and secondary in design to that of facades that are more visible from adjacent properties or the streetscape public right-of-way. The same materials should be used for alley-facing facades as that of the other facades unless this varies from the typical historic condition within the district.

4.6 Exterior Materials at New Construction

Policy: Materials used in the construction of new buildings, additions, garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible in appearance and design with common building materials in the district, or typical of structures of the proposed style, type, age and location.

Design Justification: The form, materials and details of exterior walls and embellishments, as well as their scale, texture and variety, contribute to the overall character of the historic district.

Sustainability Justification: Materials for new exterior wall construction should be as sustainable as possible. Appropriate siding materials may include stucco, wood, brick, or cementitious siding. Vinyl and metal siding materials are not sustainable and should not be used.

Wall Materials

- 4.6.2: Materials for new construction should be consistent with those at other buildings within the property, block and historic district. Consideration should be given to the pattern of development of the specific property and lot.
- 4.6.3: Wood siding may be tongue and groove, shiplap, novelty or other compatible type. Board and batten may also be appropriate for use on accessory buildings; it is rarely used on primary buildings.
- 4.6.4: Brick is a common material in Oklahoma City historic districts and is appropriate for use on new construction.
- 4.6.6: Cementitious siding (smooth finish) of an appropriate profile may be used at new construction of stand-alone primary buildings, garages and other accessory buildings. It may also be used for additions to historic structures.
- 4.6.9: Masonry bonding patterns, sizes and color should be similar to those found at the property or used for historic buildings in the historic district and typical of structures of the same style, type, age and location.

Windows

- 4.6.10: Windows in additions to existing buildings must match or complement the proportion, shape, pattern, size, details and profile of the windows in the historic building. If the historic or existing windows are wood, the windows of the addition may be wood, vinyl-clad wood or aluminum-clad wood. If the historic windows or existing are steel, the windows of the addition should be steel or other compatible metal. All windows in new additions should be of a profile similar to the windows in the historic building.
- 4.6.12: New windows may have a simpler window pane pattern than their historic counterparts; for example, if the historic windows are 6/1 (read “six over one”), then 1/1 windows of the same overall size may be used.
- 4.6.13: Windows constructed entirely of aluminum or vinyl are not permitted, and aluminum surfaces cannot have a clear, mill or anodized finish unless

supported by historic documentation for a specific property or structure.

- 4.6.14: Clear glass must be used in all windows. Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass in windows is generally not appropriate. Patterned, leaded or colored glass can be used in transoms and sidelights when established by the architectural style of the building or when supported by historical documentation for a specific property or structure.
- 4.6.15: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glass) windows are acceptable for additions or new construction. When muntins are proposed for a divided light appearance they should be “true divided lights” meaning that the thin wood framing (called ‘muntins’) completely frames and separates each piece of glass from the others.
- 4.6.16: Simulated muntins sandwiched between layers of glass in thermal windows, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins may not be used except when internal muntins are used in conjunction with permanently fixed surface-applied muntins on the interior and the exterior of the glass.

Doors

- 4.6.21: Swinging (French) or sliding patio doors used for new construction in the back of a new infill primary building, or new garages, accessory buildings, or new additions in the back yard and used in conjunction with sidelights may use the recommendations and requirements associated with the previous subsection of this section, “Windows,” provided that the patio doors and sidelights will match.
- 4.6.22: Pedestrian doors that are not visible from the public right-of-way may be made of alternate materials including aluminum clad wood, composite wood, and fiberglass. Doors in Heritage Hills must be of solid wood.

Roof and Roofing Materials

- 4.6.23: Wood shingles, composition shingles, slate tiles, terra cotta or clay tiles are permitted for use on roofs. Recommendations and requirements for these materials are found in the “Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.
- 4.6.26: Composition roofs should be of higher quality and are often referred to as Architectural Grade or Dimensional Grade. These shingles are usually rated as 30-, 40-, or 50-year shingles and have a thicker profile.
- 4.6.29: Historic eaves, copings, cornices, dormers and roof trim should be retained and preserved.

- c. Considerations: The size, form, overall materials, and architectural details of the addition were previously approved

The hipped roof form is consistent with the historic structure and a typical form for additions extending off the rear of structures while remaining below the peak of the existing, historic roof. The original roof form as seen from the street is retained.

Massing, proportions, and spacing of windows, doors, and other features appear consistent and compatible with the historic structure and meet applicable Guidelines for materials. All other proposed revisions appear to have no substantive impact upon the effects of the previous approval, or the historic character of the property or district.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed revision continues to meet applicable Guidelines for additions to historic structures.

E. HPCA-22-00126 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

- 1. Approve Item 5, Revise previously approved items: 1) Construct addition with back porch to alter roof form, remove equipment doors, and modify window and door openings (elective),** with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; the items comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed revision continues to meet applicable Guidelines for additions to historic structures.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

KMF