



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

April 5, 2023

HPCA-23-00014

Agenda Item: V.A.1.

Case Number: HPCA-23-00014

Property Address: 110-112 NW 16th Street

District: Heritage Hills East Historic District

Owner: Stephen Prentice
314 Frisco RD NW
Piedmont, OK 73078

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Replace windows (required).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

This work has been initiated but must be reviewed as if it had not. Half of the windows of the duplex were replaced with new vinyl windows. The applicant is pursuing avenues for windows to replace the inappropriate windows as well as replace remaining historic windows that will be documented to be deteriorated beyond repair.

The applicant requests a continuance to further research appropriate window replacements.

2. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 16th Street, between Robinson and Broadway.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1926

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1999

National Register Listing: 2020

Additional Information:

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates no building in this location that abuts what was the elective railway right of way to the west and back yards of 3 dwellings to the east. The 1949 edition illustrates 2-story, brick veneered, flats with composition roofing, illustrative of a flat roof, and a fire escape. The 1949 edition also indicates that the 3 dwellings at the southeast corner at the intersection of Broadway and

W 16th Street were replaced with an auto repair shop and filling station. A wide, rectangular “autohouse” is illustrated south of the subject structure, but without property lines, it is unclear if the garage served the flats, one of the dwellings, or the filling station and repair shop. The garage appears as frame construction with a composition (flat) roof and easy access to the driveway south of the auto repair shop. No changes are indicated on subsequent editions of the maps.

4. Existing Conditions

This is an historic duplex with one over one, hung, wood windows. Windows of one side of the duplex remain historic windows, while windows of the other side have been replaced with inappropriate replacement windows.

5. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

| Case Number | Date | Owner | Decision |
|--------------------------------|-------------|--------------|-----------------|
| HPCA-05-144 | 2005 | Struble | Approved |
| Deck, driveway, fence and gate | | | |

Other actions, such as variances, other approvals, citations could also be described here.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 1, Replace windows (required).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes replacement of all historic, one over one, double hung, wood windows with white vinyl, hung, one over one, insulated, windows. Mullions are removed, seating within the openings appears to have changed, and various portions of frame material has been removed in some openings.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

Policy: Windows and shutters are important character-defining features of a building and originals should be retained and kept in good repair. Awnings may be an intended permanent character defining feature such as wood framed and finished with roof shingles to match the rest of the building or temporary such as

contemporary fabric awnings with aluminum frames.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, positioning, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the architectural style and period of the building. Their design, details and craftsmanship make them worthy of preservation. The presence or absence of shutters and awnings are significant to the visual character of a building.

Sustainability Justification: Many buildings in historic districts retain old-growth wood windows which can last indefinitely if they are properly maintained, unlike new-growth wood or vinyl windows. In most cases, windows account for less than one-fourth of a home's heat loss. Insulating the attic, walls and basement is a more economical approach to reducing energy costs than replacing historic windows. Proper maintenance and sealing of windows, along with adding storm windows, keeps windows out of landfills and enhances a building's energy efficiency year round.

- 3.6.1: Regular maintenance and weather-stripping of historic windows ensures their preservation and improves the energy efficiency of a building.
- 3.6.2: Retain and preserve original or historic windows. Preserve and maintain historic window framing and number and configuration of glass panes.
- 3.6.3: Make repairs to an existing window rather than replacing the entire window unit, including replacement in kind of parts that are deteriorated beyond repair. Ordinary maintenance and repair is limited to less than 50% replacement of the window's components and parts including frames and sashes.
- 3.6.4: The application of ultraviolet (UV) film to window glazing is the least costly option for reducing heat gain from sunlight and may be an acceptable addition to window glass. UV filters can have a service life of ten or more years; when replacement of the film is required, great care must be taken not damage to historic glass and framing.
- 3.6.5: Original or historic windows more than 50% DETERIORATED BEYOND REPAIR may be replaced in kind.
- 3.6.6: New window openings may be allowed on the back facade or the back 30% of the side elevations. New windows must be compatible with historic or existing windows in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials and details.
- 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
- 3.6.9: If original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile.

- 3.6.10: New windows made of aluminum clad wood with enameled finish may be appropriate as replacements for historic wood windows since these may have acceptable sustainable qualities and closely resemble a painted finish.
 - 3.6.11: Vinyl is not an environmentally sustainable material, and the installation of vinyl-clad wood windows or entirely vinyl framed windows is not appropriate and will not be approved for the historic districts.
 - 3.6.12: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glazing) windows are acceptable as replacement windows when the historic windows in a building have been previously removed. When used, thermal pane windows must have true divided lites.
 - 3.6.13: A thermal pane window may be appropriate for replacement of a historic wood or metal window when the existing window frame and sash parts are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair. To replace a historic window with a new unit a window survey including a photograph of the interior and exterior of the unit must be provided to substantiate the condition of the window. Historic windows visible from the public-right-of-way must be retained and repaired or replaced in kind, including replication of muntins pattern and profile.
 - 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.
 - 3.6.17: Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass are not permitted in windows, except that special glass, for example, patterned, leaded or colored glass, can be used in transoms and sidelights when appropriate as established by the architectural style and the specific history of the building for which the special glass is proposed.
 - 3.6.18: A new window may have a low emissivity coating applied to clear glass provided that the visible light transmittance is not less than .74 and the overall reflectance is not more than 17%.
- c. Considerations: If original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntin pattern and profile. The historic windows have not been established as deteriorated beyond repair. No survey of window conditions was provided. No dimensions of existing windows are provided.
- Vinyl is not an environmentally sustainable material, and the installation of vinyl-clad wood windows or entirely vinyl framed windows is not supported by the Standards and Guidelines.
- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That it has not been established that the existing historic windows are deteriorated beyond repair;
 2. That the proposed windows do not match all of the characteristics of the historic windows, including mullions and profile; and

3. That vinyl windows are not appropriate and are not supported by the Standards and Guidelines.

E. HPCA-23-00014 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Continue Item 1, replace windows**, with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

- 1) That it has not been established that the existing historic windows are deteriorated beyond repair;
- 2) That the proposed windows do not match all of the characteristics of the historic windows, including mullions and profile; and
- 3) That vinyl windows are not appropriate and are not supported by the Standards and Guidelines.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

ady