



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

October 5, 2022

HPCA-22-00130

Agenda Item: VI.D.7.

Case Number: HPCA-22-00130

Property Address: 424 NW 22nd Street

District: Mesta Park Historic District

Applicant: Express Sunrooms of Oklahoma
Corbin Harris
912 Posados Drive
Edmond, OK 73012

Owner: Ben Miller
424 NW 22nd Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73103

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Construct screened sunroom (required).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

Note: the proposed work has been completed but must be reviewed as if it had not. The applicant proposes the addition of a screened sunroom at the rear of the dwelling.

2. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 22nd Street, between Walker and Hudson.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1921

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1994

National Register Listing: 1983

Additional Information:

A comparison between the current site plan and the 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates the loss of an historic 2- car auto-house with a flat composition roof at some point. The garage structure was located approximately 2/3 back from the front property line and remained present on the Sanborn maps through 1955. The primary

structure was continuously listed as a dwelling, rather than flats or duplex, on all available editions of the maps from 1922 through 1955.

Existing Conditions

The dwelling was remodeled in 2016 with an addition at the rear, repair of front porch and construction of a new garage.

The proposed work has been done but must be reviewed as if it had not.

1. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-16-00082	10/05/2016	Brandon Swearingen Renovations LLC	Approved
1) Construct garage (elective); 2) Construct an addition (elective); 3) Install handrail at rolling terrace steps in front sidewalk(elective); and 4) Remove non-historic front porch columns and install more appropriate columns (elective); and 11) Install light fixtures (elective).			

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 1, Construct screened sunroom (elective).

- a. Description: The owner proposes the construction of a rear addition at 156 square feet. The addition is a screened back porch at the southwest corner of the building. Documentation includes architectural shingles, wood siding, screening and metal framing, extruded aluminum. The structure is 1-story and measures 12 by 13 feet. The proposed porch is a permanent attachment to a previous addition (658 square feet) to the dwelling and includes a modest shed roof visible from the public right-of-way on the west. A screen door is included on the east side.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.3 Porches, Canopies, Porte-Cocheres & Balconies

Policy: Historic porches, canopies, porte-cocheres and balconies are important

features and are often the dominant characteristic of a building. These features that are visible from the public right-of-way should not be altered.

Sustainability Justification: Porches, canopies, and porte-cocheres protect entrances, provide shade, and enhance a building's energy efficiency.

- 3.3.7: Enclosing historic side or back porches or balconies with glazing changes the historic character of a building and should be avoided. However, while not encouraged, such enclosures at side or back porches not connected to a front or primary porch or balcony may be allowed. The details of such enclosures must be minimal and not obscure or detract from the historic details of the porch or building.

Storm and Screen Doors

- 3.5.14: Storm or screen doors shall be stained or painted. It is customary for the color of the storm or screen door to match the color of the primary door or the color of the surrounding door trim.
- 3.5.15: Storm or screen doors not visible from the public right-of-way may have transparent glass or screen portions that are less than 65% of the total exterior face area of the door.
- 3.5.18: A new wood screen door may be installed where no wood screen door has previously existed.
- 3.5.19: A new wood screen door shall be compatible with the historic character of the building and differentiated so as to not present a false historical appearance.
- 3.6.30: New screen windows frames must be of wood, and match the profile, size and design of the historic frame or typical window screen frames in the historic district. New screens shall be of a color, material, and screen size that they are still transparent enough for the window behind them to be visible from the public right-of-way.

4.1 General Requirements for New Construction and Additions

Policy: New construction and additions should not destroy historic materials or general features that characterize a historic building, property or district. New work should be differentiated from existing, historic structures and protect the historic integrity of the property and the historic district. Additions to historic structures should be done so that the historic character of the structure is retained and, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original structure and site would be unimpaired.

Design Justification: New construction and its integration with an existing building, property or district should be compatible with surrounding existing historic architecture. Compatibility may include the size, shape, massing and materials of new construction. The relationship of new construction form to the historic context in which it is located is critical for maintaining visual character of a historic building, property or district.

Sustainability Justification: Effective resource conservation includes consideration of the renewability of resources, the manufacturing processes used to create the materials and the recycled construction materials, energy costs associated in the manufacture and shipping of construction materials, and the ways selected materials can help make the new building, as a whole, energy efficient.

4.3 Building Additions

Policy: Additions should complement and not detract from the overall historic character of the historic district.

Design Justification: The way in which a historic building and an addition to it relate is important in protecting the integrity of the historic property and district. An addition directly affects the integrity of the building as a whole. Building additions should not detract from the historic character of the historic building or district.

Sustainability Justification: New construction should adhere to principles of sustainability in their materials, design and energy efficiency. If construction of additions results in the removal of original fabric, consideration should be given to maximizing the retention or re-use of existing historic features, details and materials.

- 4.3.1: Additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes, and should be appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building. The incorporation of existing architectural features with new design elements can contribute added interest and compatibility.
- 4.3.2: New additions must be planned so that they are constructed to the back of the property or on a non-character-defining elevation preferably not visible from the public right-of-way. Character-defining features of buildings should not be radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed by an addition. The existing historic building fabric should not be damaged by the installation of a new addition.
- 4.3.3: It is not appropriate to alter the overall character of historic districts by substantially reducing the ratio of open space to built space on any site through new construction, additions or introduction of surface paving or other hardscape feature.
- 4.3.4: New additions shall not exceed 50% of the square footage of the footprint of the existing historic structure (enclosed space only), or 750 square feet, whichever is larger, and shall be no taller, no wider, and no deeper than the existing historic structure.
- 4.3.5: Additions to historic or non-historic buildings should relate to and complement the style of the main building, and may relate to the general style of the streetscape.

- 4.3.6: An addition to a historic building must be designed to be visibly distinguishable from the original historic building.
- 4.3.7: Additions to historic buildings should be designed so that connections between new construction and historic structures are clearly discernible. A clear definition of the transition between the new addition and the historic structure should be established and maintained.
- 4.3.10: Additions should be clearly secondary to and distinct from the original building. This can be accomplished by providing a clear visual break between the historic building and the addition, by setting the façade of the addition back from that of the historic building, or by constructing a recessed area at the point at which the addition and the historic building join together.
- 4.3.11: Use of different but compatible materials or different (simplified) detailing is also appropriate to differentiate a new addition from the historic building.
- 4.3.12: The design of a new addition must consider and respect the massing, roof shape, bay spacing, cornice lines and materials of the building to which it is being added.

4.6 Exterior Materials at New Construction

Policy: Materials used in the construction of new buildings, additions, garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible in appearance and design with common building materials in the district, or typical of structures of the proposed style, type, age and location.

Design Justification: The form, materials and details of exterior walls and embellishments, as well as their scale, texture and variety, contribute to the overall character of the historic district.

Sustainability Justification: Materials for new exterior wall construction should be as sustainable as possible. Appropriate siding materials may include stucco, wood, brick, or cementitious siding. Vinyl and metal siding materials are not sustainable and should not be used.

- 4.6.2: Materials for new construction should be consistent with those at other buildings within the property, block and historic district. Consideration should be given to the pattern of development of the specific property and lot.
- 4.6.3: Wood siding may be tongue and groove, shiplap, novelty or other compatible type. Board and batten may also be appropriate for use on accessory buildings; it is rarely used on primary buildings.
- 4.6.6: Cementitious siding (smooth finish) of an appropriate profile may be used at new construction of stand-alone primary buildings, garages and other accessory buildings. It may also be used for additions to historic structures.
- 4.6.18: Storm windows and window screens are permitted and should meet the recommendations and requirements of the applicable sections in the

“Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.

- 4.6.20: Recommendations and requirements for primary entrance doors, screen doors and storm doors, and doors that are visible from the public right-of-way are the same as described for the “Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.
 - 4.6.22: Pedestrian doors that are not visible from the public right-of-way may be made of alternate materials including aluminum clad wood, composite wood, and fiberglass. Doors in Heritage Hills must be of solid wood.
 - 4.6.26: Composition roofs should be of higher quality and are often referred to as Architectural Grade or Dimensional Grade. These shingles are usually rated as 30-, 40-, or 50-year shingles and have a thicker profile.
- c. Considerations: The screened porch is a permanent addition to the rear of the dwelling. This addition attached to the rear of a previous addition that was 658 square feet. The total square footage is approximately 819 square feet. No site plan has been provided. A site plan will better illustrate site coverage, as well as building proximity as related to Code requirements.

The building materials include extruded aluminum components. These are painted to match the house. There is some indication that wood is included, but the plans are contradictory. The siding is indicated to match that of the primary building, though the material is not described. The screening material is dark, but transparent. The screen door is not described, and it is presumed to be aluminum.

The general appearance of the proposed screened porch appears compatible with the primary building. However, the materials may not be consistent with the Standards and Guidelines. The relationship between the proposed addition, the garage, the property lines, and the overall site coverage must be described.

- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That the proposed screened porch is minimally visible from the public right of way and may have minimal impact on the character of the property and district;
 2. That the proposed screened porch attaches to the existing structure and must be reviewed as an addition;
 3. That the proposed screened porch, in combination with an existing, recent addition may exceed the appropriate square footage for additions to existing buildings;
 4. That the proposed screened porch adds to the built, impermeable space at the property and may alter the built-to-open space ratio;
 5. That a complete, to scale and fully dimensioned site plan is required;
 6. That all exterior materials must be verified and described.

E. HPCA-22-00130 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Continue Item 1, construct a screened porch addition**, with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed screened porch is minimally visible from the public right of way and may have minimal impact on the character of the property and district;
2. That the proposed screened porch attaches to the existing structure, and must be reviewed as an addition;
3. That the proposed screened porch, in combination with an existing, recent addition may exceed the appropriate square footage for additions to existing buildings;
4. That the proposed screened porch adds to the built, impermeable space at the property and may alter the built-to-open space ratio;
5. That a complete, to scale and fully dimensioned site plan is required;
6. That all exterior materials must be verified and described.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

ady