



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

October 5, 2022

HPCA-22-00128

Agenda Item: VI.D.6.
Case Number: HPCA-22-00128
Property Address: 719 NW 16th Street
District: Mesta Park Historic District
Owner: Austin Hayes
1160 W Britton Rd BX 2
Oklahoma City, OK 73114

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Install shutters (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

Replace shutters.

2. Location

Project site is located on the north side of 16th Street, mid-block between Shartel and Lee.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1916

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1994

National Register Listing: 1983

Additional Information:

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 2-story frame dwelling with 1-story front porch extending the entire length of the front (south) façade and wrapping the east corner. A 1-story porch spans approximately half the rear (north) façade. A 1.5-story frame "autohouse" is indicated centrally on the rear (north) property line. All structures have shingle roofs, with the front porch indicated as non-combustible. The 1949 edition of the maps indicates the dwelling roof to be composition material, and the historic garage to have been replaced with a 1-story frame autohouse in the northwest corner of the lot with composition roofing. Subsequent editions show no further changes to the property.

4. Existing Conditions

The front of the dwelling was repaired previously in 1999 and a new front porch, entry, and sidewalk were constructed.

5. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-1293	XX/XX/XX	Philip Reid	Approved/Denied
Construct porch and install sidewalk.			
HPCA-06-020		Philip Reid	Approved
Install porch rail.			

Other actions, such as variances, other approvals, citations could also be described here.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 1, Install shutters (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes replacement of the existing, non-historic shutters. Existing shutters are vinyl, louvered, shutters at 18 inches wide. The proposed shutters are wood, ranch style shutters on a rail. The proposed shutters are 24 by 56 inches and functional. At the first floor, only one shutter per pair of windows could exist. All hardware is black metal.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

Policy: Windows and shutters are important character-defining features of a building and originals should be retained and kept in good repair. Awnings may be an intended permanent character defining feature such as wood framed and finished with roof shingles to match the rest of the building or temporary such as contemporary fabric awnings with aluminum frames.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, positioning, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the architectural style and period of the building. Their design, details and craftsmanship make them worthy of preservation. The presence or absence of shutters and awnings are significant to the visual character of a building.

Shutters

- 3.6.31: Historic shutters should be preserved and maintained.
 - 3.6.32: Shutters on historic building may have been functional and decorative in design. Operable shutters could be closed during summer days to reduce heat light and heat. New shutters may be functional, decorative, or both.
 - 3.6.33: Shutters are only permitted where they existed historically, and where they are appropriate to the style and character of the house. Inappropriate shutters are encouraged to be removed.
 - 3.6.34: Shutters must be half the width of the window and mounted to be or appear operational.
- c. Considerations: Shutters are proposed where existing shutters are located on the front wall of the dwelling. The existing shutters are non-historic but may potentially be replacement shutters for previously existing, historic shutters. The actual historic condition has not been documented.

The design components of the proposed shutters incorporate a modern interpretation of shutters and doors that emulate sliding stable doors. The design is not consistent with any known shutter installation within the historic districts.

The proposed shutters are 24 inches wide, but the width of the window has not been provided.

- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That the existing shutters are non-historic, of inappropriate material, and purely decorative, as the pair of windows could not have been covered by traditional shutters;
 2. That replacement in kind of the existing shutters would have no further effect on the character of the historic dwelling;
 3. That the proposed shutters are wood and are designed to appear operational;
 4. The proposed shutters appear to be more than half the width of the window;
 5. That the proposed shutters have not been illustrated to be consistent and compatible with the style and character of the house, or to be based on historic precedent.

E. HPCA-22-00128 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Continue Item 1, install new shutters**, with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the existing shutters are non-historic, of inappropriate material, and purely decorative as the pair of windows could not have been covered by traditional

shutters;

2. That replacement in kind of the existing shutters would have no further effect on the character of the historic dwelling;
3. That the proposed shutters are wood and are designed to appear operational;
4. The proposed shutters appear to be more than half the width of the window;
5. That the proposed shutters have not been illustrated to be consistent and compatible with the style and character of the house, or to be based on historic precedent.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and at each HP Commission Meeting.

ady