



# **STAFF REPORT**

## **Historic Preservation Commission**

**October 5, 2022**

**HPCA-22-00117**

---

**Agenda Item:** VI.D.3.  
**Case Number:** HPCA-22-00117  
**Property Address:** 612 NW 41st Street  
**District:** Crown Heights Historic District  
**Applicant:** Sine Construction  
Bob Sine  
1120 NW 51st Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73118  
**Owner:** Tim Farris  
612 NW 41st Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73118

### **A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION**

2. Construct garage (elective); and
3. Install paving (elective).

### **B. BACKGROUND**

#### **1. Project Description**

The applicant proposes the construction of a replacement garage.

#### **2. Location**

Project site is located on the south side of NW 41<sup>st</sup> Street, mid-block between Walker and Shartel

#### **3. Site History**

***Date of Construction:*** 1935

***Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark:*** 1977

***National Register Listing:*** 1995

***Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:***

612 Northwest 41st, C. 1932. This two-story, brick Italian Renaissance residence has a moderately pitched, hipped roof with composition shingles and a single-story wing with pyramidal hipped roof. The façade features paired double-hung windows on the second floor, casement windows on the first, and cast stone sills. The paneled wood door has glazing and is flanked by brick pilasters and topped with a brick triangular pediment with

cast stone trim. A brick chimney on the façade has cast stone accents. The garage is detached.

***Additional Information:***

The 1949 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrate a 2-story dwelling with brick veneer and a small projection on the rear. A rectangular, detached garage is illustrated near, but not on, the east property line, approximately 2/3 back from the front (north) property line. The “autohouse” is a frame structure. The roofs are indicated as shingle, typically wood shingle. No changes are indicated on subsequent editions of the maps.

**4. Existing Conditions**

The Commission previously approved the demolition of the existing garage due to its condition.

**5. Previous Actions**

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-21-00026	03/03/2021	Blake Farris	Approved
Addition			
HPCA-20-00035	05/06/2020	Emily Ward	Approved
Pergola			
HPCA-324			
Install fence and gate			

Other actions, such as variances, other approvals, citations could also be described here.

**C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE**

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.\**

None.

**D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS**

*This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020\* as referenced below:*

**1. Item 2, Construct garage (elective); and 3) Install paving (elective).**

- a. Description: The applicant proposes construction of a 1.5 story garage where the 1-story garage was approved for demolition at the September 2022 HP Commission meeting. The replacement garage is approximately 585 square feet and measures 22

by 26.5 feet. The wall height is 12 feet, and the height to the peak of the roof is 17.5 feet with a 5/12 pitch. An exposed 12-inch stem wall is proposed.

The proposal includes siding, trim, soffit, and fascia material from the smooth HardiPlank line, which is a cementitious product supported by the Guidelines. Most dimensions of the structure are detailed, but the siding dimension is not. Round, louvered vents in a synthetic material are proposed in the front, clipped gable end and at the rear. A craftsman style, steel door is proposed on the west, with a clad wood window. Lantern style light fixtures are proposed. The overhead door is proposed at 8 feet by 18 feet. Gutters and downspouts are proposed. Architectural grade shingles are proposed.

No filling or excavation are noted. Additional paving to the garage is required at the driveway.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

#### **4.1 General Requirements for New Construction**

- 4.1.3: Significant alteration of the topography of a property through extensive grading, removal or alteration of rolled terraces and similar character-defining features, filling or excavating, is not permitted.
- 4.1.4: Refer to Chapter 3, “Alterations to Building Fabric and Components of Historic Building,” for items, components, features or materials planned for new construction or additions that may not be addressed by this Chapter.

#### **4.4 Garages**

**Policy:** As with other accessory buildings, garages should have their own form and should generally appear as secondary structures and not visually overwhelm or compete with the other historic buildings of the property or district.

**Design Justification:** The way in which a new garage relates to other historic buildings of a property is important in historic districts. A new garage directly affects the integrity of the property as a whole. For this reason, a new garage should not detract from the historic character of the property.

**Sustainability Justification:** New garage construction should adhere to principles of sustainability in materials, design, and energy efficiency.

- 4.4.1: Garage doors should typically be painted to match the color of the garage. For garages that are “high style” it may be appropriate to use the color of the garage doors as a complementary or accent color to the building color scheme.
- 4.4.2: Electronic garage door openers may be installed and used.
- 4.4.3: Construction of a new or replacement garage should follow the historic setback for a garage on the property or setback patterns of other garages in the streetscape or historic district.

- 4.4.4: Historic garages in Oklahoma City's historic districts are predominantly detached, and attached garages are not appropriate unless documentation demonstrates their previous historic existence at the property.
- 4.4.5: Construction of a replacement garage shall approximate the original configuration, form, massing, style, placement and detail of the former garage as described by photographic or other documentation.
- 4.4.6: Construction of a replacement garage may reasonably expand beyond the footprint of a historic one- or two- car garage, up to a total footprint of 450 square feet or 5% of the lot, whichever is greater, in order to accommodate a standard size parking space for up to two vehicles. Additional factors including the level of visibility of a new garage and the size and massing of surrounding structures may be considered.
- 4.4.7: Design a new garage to be secondary to that of a property's main historic building.
- 4.4.9: Materials used for a new garage should reflect the property's historical development and the use and function of the garage. Materials used for the exterior facades of a garage were often different (and less costly) than those used for the primary building.
- 4.4.10: A garage may be of 'modest' or 'high-style' design to complement a property's historical development. Often, a new garage should be modest with a simple rectangular plan and form and a low-pitched, gabled or hipped roof. Doors and windows may have little or no ornamentation.
- 4.4.8: When no photographic or other documentation of a previous garage is available, a new garage should be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to the primary building and should relate to similar garages within the historic district, as appropriate.
- 4.4.11: When no photographic or other documentation is available, A new one-story garage should be similar in height to other similar, historic one-story garages in the streetscape and historic district. A new two-story garage should be similar in height to the historic two-story garages of adjacent properties, in the streetscape and of the historic district.
- 4.4.12: When no photographic or other documentation of a previous historic garage is available, a replacement garage may be two-stories tall when the original or historic garage was two-stories, or if located in a block where two-story or one and a half story garages are dominant or occur on abutting property. New garages in blocks that contain only one-story garages shall be one-story.
- 4.4.13: In locations where two-story garages are not allowed, a garage may be one and a half stories as defined in the Municipal Code so long as its design and height approximate the massing of a previous historic garage at the

property, or adjacent one-story garages if no documentation of a previous historic garage is available.

### **Garage Doors, Openings, and Doors**

- 4.4.14: Spacing and size of window and door openings in a new garage should be consistent with the historical development of the property and similar to their historic counterparts within the streetscape or historic district, as should the proportion of window to wall space.
- 4.4.17: New garage pedestrian doors in all other districts may be solid wood with wood frames or alternate door and door frame materials such as composite wood or aluminum clad wood for locations that are not visible from the public right-of-way. Otherwise pedestrian doors and frames shall be solid wood.
- 4.4.18: New garage vehicle doors in all other districts may be solid wood, wood veneer with a concealed metal frame, or composite materials including fiberglass or wood fiber (85% minimum wood fiber content). Doors should first match the historic design. When the historic design is unknown then the doors should match the design of other historic garage doors used in the respective district. A paneled design may be appropriate.
- 4.4.21: At double garages, two single garage vehicle doors should be used instead of one larger, double door. This will maintain the scale and rhythm of older structures, making a two-car garage seem smaller and more compatible with the primary building and the district.
- 4.4.22: If a historic garage is to be demolished to allow the construction of a new garage, it is encouraged that the historic doors be salvaged and re-used at the new garage, or if this is not possible, that the historic garage doors be replicated in the new garage design.
- 4.4.23: Doors at new high style garages should complement the garage in design and materials. The use of paneled wood garage doors or custom garage doors is encouraged at these locations.

## **4.6 Exterior Materials at New Construction**

**Policy:** Materials used in the construction of new buildings, additions, garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible in appearance and design with common building materials in the district, or typical of structures of the proposed style, type, age and location.

**Design Justification:** The form, materials and details of exterior walls and embellishments, as well as their scale, texture and variety, contribute to the overall character of the historic district.

**Sustainability Justification:** Materials for new exterior wall construction should be as sustainable as possible. Appropriate siding materials may include stucco, wood, brick, or cementitious siding. Vinyl and metal siding materials are not sustainable and should not be used.

### **Wall Materials**

- 4.6.2: Materials for new construction should be consistent with those at other buildings within the property, block and historic district. Consideration should be given to the pattern of development of the specific property and lot.
- 4.6.3: Wood siding may be tongue and groove, shiplap, novelty or other compatible type. Board and batten may also be appropriate for use on accessory buildings; it is rarely used on primary buildings.
- 4.6.6: Cementitious siding (smooth finish) of an appropriate profile may be used at new construction of stand-alone primary buildings, garages and other accessory buildings. It may also be used for additions to historic structures.

### **Windows**

- 4.6.11: Windows in new stand-alone construction must be similar to their counterparts within the property, block or historic district. These windows may be wood, vinyl clad wood, metal clad wood, or metal with a profile similar to the windows of other buildings on the property.
- 4.6.12: New windows may have a simpler window pane pattern than their historic counterparts; for example, if the historic windows are 6/1 (read “six over one”), then 1/1 windows of the same overall size may be used.
- 4.6.14: Clear glass must be used in all windows. Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass in windows is generally not appropriate. Patterned, leaded or colored glass can be used in transoms and sidelights when established by the architectural style of the building or when supported by historical documentation for a specific property or structure.
- 4.6.15: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glass) windows are acceptable for additions or new construction. When muntins are proposed for a divided light appearance they should be “true divided lights” meaning that the thin wood framing (called ‘muntins’) completely frames and separates each piece of glass from the others.
- 4.6.16: Simulated muntins sandwiched between layers of glass in thermal windows, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins may not be used except when internal muntins are used in conjunction with permanently fixed surface-applied muntins on the interior and the exterior of the glass.

### **Doors**

- 4.6.19: Recommendations and requirements for garage type doors are described in the “Garage” section of this chapter.
- 4.6.20: Recommendations and requirements for primary entrance doors, screen doors and storm doors, and doors that are visible from the public right-of-way are the same as described for the “Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.

- 4.6.22: Pedestrian doors that are not visible from the public right-of-way may be made of alternate materials including aluminum clad wood, composite wood, and fiberglass. Doors in Heritage Hills must be of solid wood.

#### **Roof and Roofing Materials**

- 4.6.23: Wood shingles, composition shingles, slate tiles, terra cotta or clay tiles are permitted for use on roofs. Recommendations and requirements for these materials are found in the “Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.
- 4.6.26: Composition roofs should be of higher quality and are often referred to as Architectural Grade or Dimensional Grade. These shingles are usually rated as 30-, 40-, or 50-year shingles and have a thicker profile.
- 4.6.28: Multi-colored asphalt shingles and synthetic wood shingles should not be used on sloped roofs.
- 4.6.29: Historic eaves, copings, cornices, dormers and roof trim should be retained and preserved.

- c. Considerations: The Guidelines indicate that the construction of a replacement garage shall approximate the original configuration, form, massing, style, placement and detail of the former garage. The Guidelines then provide direction for new garages where the historic condition cannot be documented. The criteria describe where 2-story garages are allowed or how new 1.5 story garages may be incorporated. The criteria states “In locations where two-story garages are not allowed, a garage may be one and a half stories as defined in the Municipal Code so long as its design and height approximate the massing of a previous historic garage at the property, or adjacent one-story garages if no documentation of a previous historic garage is available.” The historic garage is extant, and massing of the garage should be approximated in the current proposal.

The current design proposes a change in style to address the massing of the garage. The proposal incorporates banding, increased trim pieces, a taller overhead door, and articulation via round vents in the gable ends. The inclusion of the clipped or Dutch gable end contributes to approximation of the historic garage. The elevated style does not appear to compete with the historic dwelling but is higher style than the existing remaining historic garages in the area. The garage is located well to the rear of the property but remains visible from the street.

The existing garage included a non-historic, double wide, overhead door at 16 feet wide. The proposed overhead door is 18 feet wide. The guidelines state “At double garages, two single garage vehicle doors should be used instead of one larger, double door. This will maintain the scale and rhythm of older structures, making a two-car garage seem smaller and more compatible with the primary building and the district.” The proposed width of the garage appears capable of accommodating two single sized overhead doors.

The proposed materials appear to generally be consistent with the Standards and Guidelines. However, PVC vents are not consistent. Wood vents are typical historic features while PVC, vinyl, plastics, etc. are not supported by the sustainability and

compatibility concepts of the Guidelines. Though slow to catch and burn, these products release highly toxic components once exposed.

The material choice for the pedestrian door is not listed as an approved material choice. Typically, steel doors do not emulate the appearance of traditional wood doors, though they are not specifically prohibited. As the door faces into the west yard, it will not be visible from the public right of way at the street, but will be visible at the abutting property, and minimally visible beyond the fence. The guidelines state “Pedestrian doors that are not visible from the public right-of-way may be made of alternate materials including aluminum clad wood, composite wood, and fiberglass. Doors in Heritage Hills must be of solid wood.”

The window documentation provided by the applicant does not indicate the cladding material for the proposed wood window. The criteria indicate that both aluminum cladding and vinyl cladding may be appropriate choices. The illustration of the window is an interior view only. However, as a one over one window, the intricacies of design details for divided lite is not necessary. The window will be visible only at the interior yard and the abutting property.

Relationships between siding, trim, and banding illustrate scale and proportion. The siding dimension is not currently described and the relationship between these is unknown. Whether the siding is equal to the dimensions of the trim, larger or smaller is relevant.

Driveway concrete should match the historic paving to which it abuts. Often a topical treatment is more effective and less costly.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the historic garage remains, and the Standards and Guidelines indicate that a replacement garage *shall* approximate the original form, massing, style and detail of the existing, historic garage;
2. That the proposed garage appears to meet the definition of a 1.5 story garage;
3. That the Standards and Guidelines indicate that a 1.5 story garage is appropriate when the design and height of the proposal approximate the massing of adjacent 1-story garages;
4. That garages of this block are historically 1 story;
5. That barring the oversized overhead door, the proposed garage may provide form, massing, scale, style, and detail that complements the transition between the primary dwelling and the abutting Tudor revival with higher peaked roofs;
6. That a pair of painted overhead doors more accurately reflects historic scale;
7. That relationships between the siding, trim, and banding are relevant to determine compatibility between the primary dwelling and the proposed garage, and siding dimensions must be described;
8. That new concrete must match the existing remaining concrete in aged appearance and finish.



---

**E. HPCA-22-00117 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

1. **Approve Item 2, construct new garage, with condition** with the specific findings that the proposed work, with the **agreed-upon conditions**, will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; the items comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020\*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

**Specific Findings:**

1. That the historic garage remains, and the Standards and Guidelines indicate that a replacement garage *shall* approximate the original form, massing, style and detail of the existing, historic garage;
2. That the proposed garage appears to meet the definition of a 1.5 story garage;
3. That the Standards and Guidelines indicate that a 1.5 story garage is appropriate when the design and height of the proposal approximate the massing of adjacent 1-story garages;
4. That garages of this block are historically 1 story;
5. That barring the oversized overhead door, the proposed garage may provide form, massing, scale, style, and detail that complements the transition between the primary dwelling and the abutting Tudor revival with higher peaked roofs;
6. That a pair of painted overhead doors more accurately reflects historic scale;
7. That relationships between the siding, trim, and banding are relevant to determine compatibility between the primary dwelling and the proposed garage, and siding dimensions must be described;
8. That new concrete must match the existing remaining concrete in aged appearance and finish.

**Conditions:**

1. That revised plans illustrating two, single-car width garage doors be submitted to staff prior to release of the Certificate of Appropriateness;
2. That detailed documentation of all components of the structure as noted in the Staff Report be submitted to staff prior to release of the Certificate of Appropriateness; and
3. That the proposed vents be revised to be wood rather than PVC.

*Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.*

*\*Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

*Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020, as amended, are available online at [www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html](http://www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html) ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9<sup>th</sup> floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.*

*ady*



# **STAFF REPORT**

## **Historic Preservation Commission**

---

**September 7, 2022**

**«Case\_»**