



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

October 5, 2022

HPCA-22-00068

Agenda Item: VI.D.1.

Case Number: HPCA-22-00068

Property Address: 626 NW 28th Street

District: Paseo Historic District

Applicant: TRN Enterprises LLC
Tammy Neihart
6608 N Western Ave
Oklahoma City, OK 73116

Owner: Drebaracks LLC
Andrew Black
2812 N Lee Ave
Oklahoma City, OK 73103

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Replace non-historic windows (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant proposes to replace seven non-historic windows. This application was heard at two previous meetings of the HP Commission. No additional information has been received.

2. Location

Project site is located on the southeast corner of NW 28th Street and N Lee.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: circa 1941

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1998

National Register Listing: 2004 Additional

Information:

The 1949 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a two-story, brick veneered structure described as “Flats” (apartments) with a two-story porch at the southeast corner.

A two-story garage with attached dwelling is indicated at the southwest corner of the site, addressed separately as 628 ½ NW 28th Street. Both structures are indicated to have shingle roofs, typically wood shingle.

4. Existing Conditions

The windows proposed to be replaced are metal, presumably storm windows, with no wood sashes remaining in the openings. Wood windows remain in other openings and are not proposed to be replaced, serving as a guide for accurate window replacement.

5. Previous Actions

None.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 1, Replace non-historic windows (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to replace seven non-historic windows. The proposed replacement windows appear to approximate the muntin pattern of the remaining historic windows, but have not been fully described.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

Policy: Windows and shutters are important character-defining features of a building and originals should be retained and kept in good repair. Awnings may be an intended permanent character defining feature such as wood framed and finished with roof shingles to match the rest of the building or temporary such as contemporary fabric awnings with aluminum frames.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, positioning, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and

help convey the architectural style and period of the building. Their design, details and craftsmanship make them worthy of preservation. The presence or absence of shutters and awnings are significant to the visual character of a building.

Sustainability Justification: Many buildings in historic districts retain old-growth wood windows which can last indefinitely if they are properly maintained, unlike new-growth wood or vinyl windows. In most cases, windows account for less than one-fourth of a home's heat loss. Insulating the attic, walls and basement is a more economical approach to reducing energy costs than replacing historic windows. Proper maintenance and sealing of windows, along with adding storm windows, keeps windows out of landfills and enhances a building's energy efficiency year-round.

- 3.6.1: Regular maintenance and weather-stripping of historic windows ensures their preservation and improves the energy efficiency of a building.
- 3.6.2: Retain and preserve original or historic windows. Preserve and maintain historic window framing and number and configuration of glass panes.
- 3.6.3: Make repairs to an existing window rather than replacing the entire window unit, including replacement in kind of parts that are deteriorated beyond repair. Ordinary maintenance and repair is limited to less than 50% replacement of the window's components and parts including frames and sashes.
- 3.6.5: Original or historic windows more than 50% DETERIORATED BEYOND REPAIR may be replaced in kind.
- 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
- 3.6.9: If original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile.
- 3.6.10: New windows made of aluminum clad wood with enameled finish may be appropriate as replacements for historic wood windows since these may have acceptable sustainable qualities and closely resemble a painted finish.
- 3.6.11: Vinyl is not an environmentally sustainable material, and the installation of vinyl-clad wood windows or entirely vinyl framed windows is not appropriate and will not be approved for the historic districts.
- 3.6.12: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glazing) windows are acceptable as replacement windows when the historic windows in a building have been previously removed. When used, thermal pane windows must have true divided lites.

-
- 3.6.13: A thermal pane window may be appropriate for replacement of a historic wood or metal window when the existing window frame and sash parts are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair. To replace a historic window with a new unit a window survey including a photograph of the interior and exterior of the unit must be provided to substantiate the condition of the window. Historic windows visible from the public-right-of-way must be retained and repaired or replaced in kind, including replication of muntins pattern and profile.
 - 3.6.15: Muntins sandwiched between layers of glass, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins are not appropriate and shall not be used.
 - 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.
 - 3.6.17: Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass are not permitted in windows, except that special glass, for example, patterned, leaded or colored glass, can be used in transoms and sidelights when appropriate as established by the architectural style and the specific history of the building for which the special glass is proposed.
 - 3.6.18: A new window may have a low emissivity coating applied to clear glass provided that the visible light transmittance is not less than .74 and the overall reflectance is not more than 17%.
- c. Considerations: The applicant has provided documentation of new windows that appear to indicate metal windows, and the applicant indicates that they will be framed with wood to match the historic windows in the downstairs unit of the building. The Guidelines require new windows to match historic windows when available for comparison, and to be wood or aluminum clad wood. In the instance of windows with muntins, true divided lite windows are required by the Guidelines, which are only available in a wood product.
- Accurate documentation of replacement windows that approximate the historic windows and meet relevant Guidelines is necessary in order to recommend approval. The applicants have received two continuances, and they have not provided sufficient information regarding the proposed work as requested. Metal windows are not a supported replacement material.
- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That the existing windows are not historic;
 2. That when non-historic windows are replaced, the Guidelines for replacement window details and materials are applicable;
 3. That the proposed windows do not meet relevant Guidelines for materials;
 4. The applicant has not provided sufficient information as requested to illustrate materials consistent with the guidelines for replacement windows.

E. HPCA-22-00068 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

- 1. Deny without prejudice Item 1, Replace non-historic windows,** with the specific findings that the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; is not consistent with the provisions of the guidelines, and is not in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

- 1) That the existing windows are not historic;
- 2) That when non-historic windows are replaced, the Guidelines for replacement window details and materials are applicable;
- 3) That the proposed windows do not meet relevant Guidelines for materials for replacement windows;
- 4) The applicant has not provided sufficient information as requested to illustrate materials consistent with the guidelines for replacement windows.

Additional information: A new application with a window proposal that fully documents materials consistent with the guidelines for replacement windows, muntin configuration, and window surrounds, including mullions where applicable, in comparison to remaining historic windows and meeting relevant Guidelines for window replacement.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

DGC