



# STAFF REPORT

## Historic Preservation Commission

June 2, 2021

HPCA-21-00066

---

**Agenda Item:** VI. D. 10.

**Case Number:** HPCA-21-00066

**Property Address:** 518 NW 14th Street

**District:** Heritage Hills Historic District

**Applicant:** Sam Gresham Architects  
Hollie Hunt  
400 NW 23rd Street, Ste B  
Oklahoma City, OK 73103

**Owner:** Monica Jacks  
518 NW 14th Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73103

### A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

2. Construct addition at south end of garage (elective);
3. Construct balcony above garage addition (elective); and
4. Construct new stairs on east side of garage (elective).

### B. BACKGROUND

#### 1. Project Description

This project includes a one-story addition to widen the garage. The addition has a flat roof and new stairs to the second story. The remodel creates a balcony above the addition.

The proposal includes a pool which will be addressed administratively. Various other items appear on the plan which are not listed for review including an addition to the driveway, installation of a fence, and relocation of mechanical equipment. These items may be eligible for administrative approval.

#### 2. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 14<sup>th</sup> Street between N Dewey and N Walker.

#### 3. Site History

*Date of Construction:* 1917

*Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark:* 1969

*National Register Listing:* 1979

*Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:*

None.

***Additional Information:***

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates 2-story, brick construction dwelling with a  $\frac{3}{4}$  width, frame, 1-story front porch on the north façade, a 2-story frame projection on the west, and a 1-story frame projection on the rear (south). A 1-story, brick construction, “autohouse” is centered behind the dwelling. All roofs are indicated with composition roofs, typically flat. No obvious changes are illustrated in subsequent editions. However, the *Heritage Hills* book notes a very early remodel that altered the front porch and an extensive remodel by the second owner sometime shortly after 1955.

**4. Existing Conditions**

The existing garage is 2 stories with pedestrian access and a stair on the south end that is in very poor condition. The garage has a low slope, hipped roof, extensive fenestration, and a double car garage door and a pedestrian door on the west. Paving as it approaches the garage appears extensive.

**5. Previous Actions**

None.

**C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE**

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2010.\**

None.

**D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS**

*This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2010\* as referenced below:*

**1. Item 2, Construct addition at south end of garage (elective); Item 3, Construct balcony above garage addition (elective); and Item 4, Construct new stairs on east side of garage (elective).**

- a. **Description:** The applicant proposes a remodel to convert the existing 2-car plus storage of the first floor of the garage to a 4-car garage. This conversion includes and 11 by 24 foot addition for 262 square feet of addition on the south end of the structure. This is an increase to both the south and the east of the garage. The addition is 1-story with a flat roof that forms a balcony on the south end of the structure and stairs on the east. The conversion requires relocation of the existing, 16-foot wide, overhead door opening on the west façade and addition of a double wide overhead door. The remodel adds 262 square feet to the footprint of the garage which is currently approximately 560 square feet for a total of 822 square feet.

The proposed remodel does not add 262 square feet to the interior of the second story, but the roof of the addition provides a balcony at the second story entry. The addition displaces the stair, which will relocate to the east side of the garage.

Various existing pedestrian doors and windows are illustrated for relocation. No new pedestrian doors or windows are proposed. New overhead doors are proposed but not documented. Wall material is indicated as stucco to match and existing wood trim will be matched. The balcony railing is indicated as painted wood at 42 inches tall. No description of the stair material is included.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

### 3.9 Accessory Buildings Including Garages

**Policy:** Accessory buildings in historic districts may include a wide variety of building types, such as secondary dwellings, carriage houses, garages, and sheds. Accessory buildings original to a property or added prior to the past forty years may have gained historic significance and should be preserved and maintained.

**Design Justification:** The primary materials used at historic garages structures were most often wood siding (either horizontal or vertical) or brick that matched the main house, with metal or wood shingle roofs. Some structures were higher style and matched stonework of the primary building. Accessory structures may have had gabled, hip, low sloping shed roofs or other roof styles. Traditionally, accessory buildings, especially garages, were important elements of a property and were often designed to be simpler, match and compliment the associated buildings.

- 3.9.7: Spacing and sizes of new window and door openings in a garage or other accessory building must be compatible with the existing accessory building and similar to their historic counterparts within the property, streetscape, or district, as must the proportion of window to wall space, without necessarily duplicating them.
- 3.9.8: Windows at accessory buildings, including those in pedestrian and vehicle doors, shall meet the requirements and recommendations of the section of this chapter for “Windows, Shutters, and Awnings.”
- 3.9.9: If it is necessary to replace the existing doors or other deteriorated or missing elements or details at a garage or other accessory structure, replace with a design based on accurate historical documentation. A new design that is compatible in style, form, scale, size, placement and finish with the primary structure or other historic garages and accessory buildings in the district may be used when no physical or photographic documentation exists otherwise.
- 3.9.10: In Heritage Hills Architectural and Historic District only solid wood vehicle garage doors with wood or concealed metal frames that match historical designs used in the district or compatible paneled designs are permitted.
- 3.9.11: In Heritage Hills Architectural and Historic District only solid wood garage pedestrian doors with wood frames that match historical designs used in the district or compatible paneled designs are permitted.

- 3.9.16: Texture of replacement garage door material shall match the original or historic garage door texture or resemble smooth cut wood when the original garage door texture is not known.

#### 4.3 Building Additions

**Policy:** Additions should complement and not detract from the overall historic character of the historic district.

**Design Justification:** The way in which a historic building and an addition to it relate is important in protecting the integrity of the historic property and district. An addition directly affects the integrity of the building as a whole. Building additions should not detract from the historic character of the historic building or district.

- 4.3.1: Additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes, and should be appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building. The incorporation of existing architectural features with new design elements can contribute added interest and compatibility.
- 4.3.2: New additions must be planned so that they are constructed to the back of the property or on a non-character-defining elevation preferably not visible from the public right-of-way. Character-defining features of buildings should not be radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed by an addition. The existing historic building fabric should not be damaged by the installation of a new addition.
- 4.3.3: It is not appropriate to alter the overall character of historic districts by substantially reducing the ratio of open space to built space on any site through new construction, additions or introduction of surface paving or other hardscape feature.
- 4.3.4: New additions shall not exceed 50% of the square footage of the footprint of the existing historic structure (enclosed space only), or 750 square feet, whichever is larger, and shall be no taller, no wider, and no deeper than the existing historic structure.
- 4.3.5: Additions to historic or non-historic buildings should relate to and complement the style of the main building, and may relate to the general style of the streetscape.
- 4.3.6: An addition to a historic building must be designed to be visibly distinguishable from the original historic building.
- 4.3.7: Additions to historic buildings should be designed so that connections between new construction and historic structures are clearly discernible. A clear definition of the transition between the new addition and the historic structure should be established and maintained.
- 4.3.8: An addition may be differentiated from the historic building by

connecting the two with a modest connector, designed to be as transparent and unobtrusive as possible.

- 4.3.9: Historic details in the coping, eaves and parapet of the historic building may be continued at the point where the historic structure connects to the addition.
  - 4.3.10: Additions should be clearly secondary to and distinct from the original building. This can be accomplished by providing a clear visual break between the historic building and the addition, by setting the façade of the addition back from that of the historic building, or by constructing a recessed area at the point at which the addition and the historic building join together.
  - 4.3.11: Use of different but compatible materials or different (simplified) detailing is also appropriate to differentiate a new addition from the historic building.
  - 4.3.12: The design of a new addition must consider and respect the massing, roof shape, bay spacing, cornice lines and materials of the building to which it is being added.
  - 4.3.13: An addition may be horizontal (added to a side or back elevation) or vertical (a second story added to an existing one-story). However, vertical additions are not permitted at corner lots, nor in the Mesa Park Historic District. While vertical additions are not prohibited in other districts and internal lots, it is rare that the other requirements and recommendations of this section can be met.
  - 4.3.14: Vertical additions to buildings must be located so that they are not visible to a person standing at ground level on the opposite side of an adjacent right-of-way. A vertical addition is not permitted at a corner lot because such an addition would be visible from the side street.
  - 4.3.15: Facades of additions facing an alley or rear property line may be simplified and secondary in design to that of facades that are more visible from adjacent properties or the streetscape public right-of-way. The same materials should be used for alley-facing facades as that of the other facades unless this varies from the typical historic condition within the district.
- c. Considerations: The existing garage is presumed to be the original garage with an upstairs addition. The proposed footprint is 822 square feet and does exceed both 5% of the site the 450 square foot limitation indicated in the Standards and Guidelines. 680 square feet is 5% of this 80 by 170-foot property. The addition may substantially reduce the ratio of open to built space as it encroaches to both the east and the south. The addition is planned toward the back of the property. Proposed changes to the south, east and west of the garage will be most visible from NW 13<sup>th</sup> Street, but only minimally so at Dewey and at 14<sup>th</sup> Street. Additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes. Additions should be appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building.

The Guidelines indicate that a small garage may be increased in size to 450 square or 5% of the lot to provide for a 2-car garage.

The proposed railing is 42 inches tall which is consistent with commercial requirements and not consistent with typical historic dimensions or with typical modern residential requirements. Stucco and salvaged pedestrian doors and windows are proposed. Cut sheets are referenced but not included regarding the overhead doors. The criteria suggest that single overhead doors address historic scale and that only all wood overhead garage doors are supported in the Heritage Hills district.

The Guidelines indicate that additions to a historic building must be visibly distinguishable from the original historic building. The connections between new and historic fabric should be clearly discernible and additions should be clearly secondary to and distinct from the original building. That Standards also indicate that additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture and detail to adjacent structures an appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building.

The Standards and Guidelines indicate windows and doors contribute to the historic character of the building, the property and the district. The spacing and sizes of new window and door openings in a garage must be compatible with the existing building and similar to historic counterparts in the streetscape or district. The orientation of the proposed overhead doors should be similar to historic counterparts.

The stated relocation of existing doors and windows is presumed to indicate the relocation of existing historic fabric. However, the existing windows and doors have not been described or documented. The window and door locations appear compatible, but the materials must be documented as consistent with the Guidelines.

The proposed overhead doors have not been documented. The mentioned cut sheet was not provided. Heritage Hills requires solid wood or wood on metal frames.

The installation of the balcony and railing on the rear of the structure will be fully visible from NW 13<sup>th</sup> Street and is not a typical feature for an accessory structure. The Standards and Guidelines indicate that additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes. The balcony and the extremely tall railing are not consistent with the historic character of the property, the existing buildings, or the district and will be visible from the public right of way. As the rear of this accessory structure faces into a parking lot and not a residential area, the impact of the balcony may be less significant than the addition of a similar feature within an entirely residential setting.

Installation of the stair and railings on the east will be minimally visible. Materials of the stairs have not been indicated. The painted railings of the stair and balcony exceed requirements for residential property and exceed that of most historic similar features.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the addition is located in the rear of the property and rear of the building;
2. That the addition approaches both the south and east property lines;
3. That the existing structure is a 2-car garage;

4. That the proposal increases the garage to a 4-car garage;
5. That the existing building to which the addition is proposed has been previously altered;
6. That the size of the garage with the proposed addition is not consistent with the limiting criteria for garage sizes in the Standards;
7. That the addition, balcony, stair and railing are visible from 13<sup>th</sup> Street but minimally visible from NW 14<sup>th</sup> Street;
8. That materials of the stairs, the overhead doors, and the existing doors and windows for relocation are not documented to be consistent with the Guidelines;
9. That missing cut sheets must be provided.

**E. HPCA-21-00066 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

- 1. Continue Items 2, 3, and 4, construct addition, construct balcony, and construct stairs and railing,** with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020\*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

**Specific Findings:**

- 1) That the addition is located in the rear of the property and rear of the building;
- 2) That the existing building to which the addition is proposed has been previously altered;
- 3) That the size of the garage with the proposed addition is consistent with the limiting criteria for garage sizes in the Standards;
- 4) That the addition, balcony, stair and railing are visible from 13<sup>th</sup> Street but minimally visible from NW 14<sup>th</sup> Street;
- 5) That the addition is not differentiated from the existing structure;
- 6) That materials of the stairs, the overhead doors, and the existing doors and windows for relocation are not documented to be consistent with the Guidelines.

**Conditions:**

- 1) That the garage should not exceed the maximum supported size, which is 5% of the site;
- 2) That the existing doors and windows proposed for relocation must be documented;
- 3) That the material and finish of the stairs must be documented;
- 4) That the overhead door material and design components must be documented;
- 5) That all documented material must be consistent with the Standards and Guidelines.

*Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.*

*\*Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

*Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at [www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html](http://www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html) ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9<sup>th</sup> floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.*

*ady*