



# STAFF REPORT

## Historic Preservation Commission

February 22, 2021

HPCA-20-00157

---

**Agenda Item:** VI.C.2.

**Case Number:** HPCA-20-00157

**Property Address:** 1013 NW 41st Street

**District:** Crown Heights Historic District

**Owner:** Hannah Rush  
1013 NW 41st Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73118

### A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

2. Construct accessory structure (elective).

### 3. BACKGROUND

#### 1. Project Description

The proposal is for an accessory structure at a rear deck.

#### 2. Location

Project site is located on the north side of NW 41<sup>st</sup> Street just east of N Western Avenue.

#### 3. Site History

*Date of Construction:* 1936

*Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark:* 1977

*National Register Listing:* 1995

*Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:*

1013 Northwest 41st, C. 1936. This one-and-a-half-story, brick and stone Tudor Revival residence has a steeply pitched, cross-gabled roof with composition shingles. The asymmetrical façade features double-hung windows in a 3-2-3 pattern, cast stone sills, and a wood plank door. A centered porch is incorporated under a front gable and has arched openings. There is a stone chimney on the west elevation and a detached garage.

*Additional Information:*

The 1950 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 1-story brick-veneered frame dwelling with 1-story, centrally located, front porch extending nearly 1/3 the width of the front (south) façade. A square, 1-story frame “autohouse” is indicated toward the NE corner of the property and is illustrated at approximately half the width of the dwelling. All structures have shingle roofs, typically wood.

#### 4. Existing Conditions

The deck was approved at the November meeting.

## 5. Previous Actions

None other than fencing or gate.

## 4. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2010.\**

1. None.

## 5. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

*This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2010\* as referenced below:*

### 1. Item 2) Construct accessory structure (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes construction of an accessory structure at the rear deck approximately 18 inches from the wall of the dwelling at the rear. The structure is 16 by 16 feet and 15 feet tall at the peak of the roof. The proposed materials include cedar beams, cedar posts, and an architectural grade shingle. The gable end runs north to south and the roof is even with the edge of the roof of the dwelling. The slope is 7/12.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

### 2.5 Landscape & Landscape Elements

**Policy:** The term “landscape” comprises the exterior environment of a historic property. Landscape elements can be natural or constructed features, including decks, patios, landforms, site furniture, pools, fountains, terraces, sculptures, planters, trellises, pergolas, outdoor lighting and other features, which generally should be located out of public view. Landscape features should be restrained on the fronts of buildings to allow viewing of the “public face” of the property and maintain historic streetscapes.

**Design Justification:** Just as the site, context and environment are critical to the character of a historic building, property and district, the landscape is also an important character-defining feature of a historic property. Original or historic landscape elements may be important character-defining features of a historic property and should be preserved. Added landscape features are more appropriate in back or side yards.

- 2.5.19: Adding a pergola (see also 3.4, Pergola or Freestanding Trellis) to a back elevation can help shade an outdoor space and can offer some degree of shade to the interior, which means added energy efficiency. Do not add a pergola or trellis to a prominent elevation where none historically existed. Reconstruction of a missing pergola or trellis should be based on accurate evidence of the original design.

- 2.5.20: New pergolas, not visible from the public right of way, may be constructed in back yards, at rear elevations or at accessory structures.
- 2.5.21: New pergolas shall be compatible with the building to which they relate in proportion, size, scale and material.
- 2.5.22: New pergolas constructed as an attachment to a primary or accessory structure shall be reviewed as a building addition and shall not damage or obscure historic character defining features.
- 2.5.23: New pergolas shall not be constructed in such a manner that abutment or attachment to an existing structure will allow for the pooling of moisture against or the infiltration of moisture into an existing structure.
- 2.5.24: The bottom of the canopy of a new pergola shall not exceed eight (8) feet above the finished floor height of the structure to which it relates, and the overall height of a pergola should not exceed nine (9) feet and shall be compatible with the building to which it relates in proportion, size, scale and material.
- 2.5.25: Freestanding pergolas may have concrete floors; however, permeable flooring materials are recommended. Posts may be set in concrete.
- 2.5.26: Pergolas shall be constructed of wood or sustainable alternative materials that closely resemble wood and may have decorative functional metal elements such as wrought iron where appropriate. Synthetic materials that do not closely replicate historic fabric, such as plastic and vinyl, are prohibited.
- 2.5.27: Pergolas with columns or walls constructed of permanent building materials such as brick, stucco, or stone shall be reviewed as new construction.

#### 4.5 Accessory Buildings

**Policy:** Accessory buildings could have been very modest, simple rectangular buildings such as barns, garages or outbuildings with one large opening for an overhead or sliding garage door or more ornate children's playhouse, workshops or carriage houses with materials and details that matched the main building. Garages are addressed separately in the preceding section within this chapter.

The retention of existing, accessory buildings is encouraged. Refurbishment and modifications to historic accessory buildings is preferred to demolition and replacement. New accessory buildings are permitted where necessary, and they should have their own form. However, they should appear as secondary structures and not visually overwhelm or compete with the property's other historic buildings.

**Design Justification:** The way in which new accessory buildings relate to other historic buildings of a property is important in historic districts. A new accessory building directly affects the integrity of the property as a whole. Therefore, a new accessory building should not detract from the historic character of the property.

**Sustainability Justification:** New accessory building design and construction should adhere to principles of sustainability in materials, design, and energy efficiency.

- 4.5.1: Pre-fabricated storage units, such as garden sheds, less than six feet in height may be located in back yards.
- 4.5.2: Pre-fabricated units must have a minimum three foot setback from side or back property lines.
- 4.5.3: Acceptable exterior materials for pre-fabricated units include those listed in the “Exterior Materials at New Construction” section of this chapter.
- 4.5.4: Plastic pre-fabricated storage units may be used. Metal sided units are not acceptable for such buildings.
- 4.5.5: The appearance and location of a new accessory building should be based on the appearance of the historic accessory building if such existed. Use historic photographs and other documentation such as Sanborn Fire Insurance maps for guidance as to size and location of a previous accessory building on the property.
- 4.5.6: If documentation of a historical accessory building at the site is not available, the size, design and location of a new accessory building should be in keeping with other accessory buildings in the block and historic district.
- 4.5.7: Accessory buildings should be located in the back yard.
- 4.5.8: Design of new accessory buildings shall be secondary to that of the main historic building and should be secondary to the design of the property’s historic garage.
- 4.5.9: Accessory buildings more than six feet tall should be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to the main residential building. Additionally, new accessory buildings may relate to similar accessory buildings within the historic district.
- 4.5.10: Materials used at accessory buildings should reflect the use and function of the accessory building, and not necessarily that of the primary building. Materials used at exterior facades of accessory buildings were often different (simpler and less costly) than material used for the main building.
- 4.5.11: New accessory buildings shall follow the historic side and back yard setback patterns of other accessory buildings on the property, in the block or in the historic district.

- c. Considerations: The proposed accessory structure provides a roof for part of the proposed deck at the back of the dwelling. The pitch of the roof is 7/12. As the gable end is open, it is a transparent feature. The roofing material is an architectural grade shingle.

Due to proximity, the accessory structure directly relates to the primary dwelling. It is

not designed with the level of transparency anticipated with a pergola as it has a solid and sloped roof. It also is not constructed in compliance with the criteria for a pergola due to the ceiling height and the overall height. However, the structure has been turned so that the sloped roof no longer directs water toward the rear of the dwelling. The beam of the structure has been lowered to match the ceiling height of the dwelling.

The way accessory structures relate to primary structures and existing historic structures is important to the historic character of the districts and effects the integrity of the property as a whole. Appropriately scaled and designed back porches and pergolas are typically found abutting the rear walls of the dwelling. Gazebos or other accessory structures are typically more remotely located. Roofs typically direct water away from the primary dwelling at porches, and pergolas are generally open with no slope toward the building.

New accessory buildings should follow historic setback patterns of other accessory buildings in the property, the block or district. Accessory buildings should be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to the main residential building. Additionally, new accessory buildings may relate to similar accessory buildings within the historic district. The size, design and location of a new accessory building should be in keeping with other accessory buildings in the block and historic district. It is not clear that the proposed accessory structure is in keeping with the size, design and location of other accessory structures in the block or district. However, the structure can easily be removed to return the site to its historic condition.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the form, massing, scale and roof of the accessory structure do not read as a pergola but provides some transparency with open end gables;
2. That accessory structures, their size, design, scale, proportion, spacing and location directly affect the historic integrity of a site;
3. That accessory buildings should relate to similar accessory buildings in the block and the district;
4. That the proposed accessory building may be transient in nature and easily removed to return the site to its historic condition;
5. That the proposed accessory structure is visible from abutting properties but not visible from the public rights of way.

**6. HPCA-20-00157 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

1. **Approve Item 2, construct accessory structure**, with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2010\*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

**Specific Findings:**

- 1) That the form, massing, scale and roof of the accessory structure do not read as a

- pergola but provides some transparency with open end gables;
- 2) That accessory structures, their size, design, scale, proportion, spacing and location directly affect the historic integrity of a site;
  - 3) That accessory buildings should relate to similar accessory buildings in the block and the district;
  - 4) That the spatial relationship between the proposed accessory structure and the dwelling is not typical of historic spatial relationships;
  - 5) That the proposed accessory building may be transient in nature and easily removed to return the site to its historic condition;
  - 6) That the proposed accessory structure is visible from abutting properties but not visible from the public rights of way.

*Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.*

*\*Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

*Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2010 are available online at [www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html](http://www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html) ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9<sup>th</sup> floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.*

*ady*