



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

February 22, 2021

HPCA-20-00180

Agenda Item: VI.C.4.

Case Number: HPCA-20-00180

Property Address: 2224 NW 29th Street

District: Shepherd Historic District

Owner: Spinnaker Construction
Ryan Sexton
2224 NW 29th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73107

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Construct addition (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 29th Street, mid-block between Youngs and Barnes.

2. Site History

Date of Construction: 1938

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1998

National Register Listing: 1997

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:

2224 Northwest 29th, C. 1938. This two-story, brick Minimal Tradition house has a side gabled composition roof with a full width shed dormer across its front façade. The projected gable porch roof is near center and supported with decorative metal posts. A gable end chimney is on the left side. The upper floor is sheathed in siding. Two garages are on the right front, one incorporated and one attached.

Additional Information:

The 195 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 2-frame, dwelling with brick veneer at the 1st story. A 1-story autohouse is illustrated at the northwest corner of the dwelling. The roof is shingle, typically wood.

3. Existing Conditions

This is a 2-story structure with attached garage. The dwelling is 1,502 square feet.

4. Previous Actions

None relevant to an addition. The previously approved shed is located in the far corner of the back yard.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 1, Construct addition (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes a 2-story addition at the southeast corner of the dwelling that measures 18 by 14 by 25 feet tall. The footprint is 252 square feet, with a total of 504 square feet. The peak of the roof is approximately 6 inches lower than that of the existing dwelling. The addition is well differentiated though the offset on the east is slight at the 2nd story.

Materials include an architectural grade shingle, smooth plywood fascia and soffit, and smooth finish cementitious siding. The pedestrian door is wood with simulated divided lite that includes spacers between thermal panes and permanently attached interior and exterior grills. Aluminum clad window with simulated divided lite are proposed. The method of simulation is not described.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

4.3 Building Additions

Policy: Additions should complement and not detract from the overall historic character of the historic district.

Design Justification: The way in which a historic building and an addition to it relate is important in protecting the integrity of the historic property and district. An addition directly affects the integrity of the building as a whole. Building additions should not detract from the historic character of the historic building or district.

Sustainability Justification: New construction should adhere to principles of sustainability in their materials, design and energy efficiency. If construction of additions results in the removal of original fabric, consideration should be given to maximizing the retention or re-use of existing historic features, details and materials.

- 4.3.1: Additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes, and should be appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building. The incorporation of existing

architectural features with new design elements can contribute added interest and compatibility.

- 4.3.2: New additions must be planned so that they are constructed to the back of the property or on a non-character-defining elevation preferably not visible from the public right-of-way. Character-defining features of buildings should not be radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed by an addition. The existing historic building fabric should not be damaged by the installation of a new addition.
- 4.3.3: It is not appropriate to alter the overall character of historic districts by substantially reducing the ratio of open space to built space on any site through new construction, additions or introduction of surface paving or other hardscape feature.
- 4.3.4: New additions shall not exceed 50% of the square footage of the footprint of the existing historic structure (enclosed space only), or 750 square feet, whichever is larger, and shall be no taller, no wider, and no deeper than the existing historic structure.
- 4.3.5: Additions to historic or non-historic buildings should relate to and complement the style of the main building, and may relate to the general style of the streetscape.
- 4.3.6: An addition to a historic building must be designed to be visibly distinguishable from the original historic building.
- 4.3.7: Additions to historic buildings should be designed so that connections between new construction and historic structures are clearly discernible. A clear definition of the transition between the new addition and the historic structure should be established and maintained.
- 4.3.8: An addition may be differentiated from the historic building by connecting the two with a modest connector, designed to be as transparent and unobtrusive as possible.
- 4.3.9: Historic details in the coping, eaves and parapet of the historic building may be continued at the point where the historic structure connects to the addition.
- 4.3.10: Additions should be clearly secondary to and distinct from the original building. This can be accomplished by providing a clear visual break between the historic building and the addition, by setting the façade of the addition back from that of the historic building, or by constructing a recessed area at the point at which the addition and the historic building join together.
- 4.3.11: Use of different but compatible materials or different (simplified) detailing is also appropriate to differentiate a new addition from the historic building.
- 4.3.12: The design of a new addition must consider and respect the massing,

roof shape, bay spacing, cornice lines and materials of the building to which it is being added.

- 4.3.13: An addition may be horizontal (added to a side or back elevation) or vertical (a second story added to an existing one-story). However, vertical additions are not permitted at corner lots, nor in the Mesa Park Historic District. While vertical additions are not prohibited in other districts and internal lots, it is rare that the other requirements and recommendations of this section can be met.
- 4.3.14: Vertical additions to buildings must be located so that they are not visible to a person standing at ground level on the opposite side of an adjacent right-of-way. A vertical addition is not permitted at a corner lot because such an addition would be visible from the side street.
- 4.3.15: Facades of additions facing an alley or rear property line may be simplified and secondary in design to that of facades that are more visible from adjacent properties or the streetscape public right-of-way. The same materials should be used for alley-facing facades as that of the other facades unless this varies from the typical historic condition within the district.
- 4.3.16: Ramps or other accessibility-related installations should be unobtrusive and located on the back or side elevations. If a ramp is required to be on the primary or highly visible façade of a building or addition, it should be designed to be as unobtrusive as possible.

4.6 Exterior Materials at New Construction

Policy: Materials used in the construction of new buildings, additions, garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible in appearance and design with common building materials in the district, or typical of structures of the proposed style, type, age and location.

Design Justification: The form, materials and details of exterior walls and embellishments, as well as their scale, texture and variety, contribute to the overall character of the historic district.

Sustainability Justification: Materials for new exterior wall construction should be as sustainable as possible. Appropriate siding materials may include stucco, wood, brick, or cementitious siding. Vinyl and metal siding materials are not sustainable and should not be used.

- 4.6.1: Alterations to existing, non-historic buildings (see “Alterations to Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings,” 3.1.10) that meet the criteria in this section may be administratively approved.

Wall Materials

- 4.6.2: Materials for new construction should be consistent with those at other buildings within the property, block and historic district. Consideration should be given to the pattern of development of the specific property and lot.

- 4.6.3: Wood siding may be tongue and groove, shiplap, novelty or other compatible type. Board and batten may also be appropriate for use on accessory buildings; it is rarely used on primary buildings.
- 4.6.4: Brick is a common material in Oklahoma City historic districts and is appropriate for use on new construction.
- 4.6.5: Stone, particularly the earth-colored sandstone found in many of the historic districts, in an appropriate material that can be incorporated into new construction.
- 4.6.6: Cementitious siding (smooth finish) of an appropriate profile may be used at new construction of stand-alone primary buildings, garages and other accessory buildings. It may also be used for additions to historic structures.
- 4.6.7: Exterior insulation finish systems (also known as EIFS or Dryvit), metal and vinyl siding, concrete block, imitative brick or stone or gravel aggregate materials are not permitted as wall materials. However, ornamental, rock-faced, mold-formed or rusticated concrete block may be used for foundation walls if previously used for other buildings on the property or in the district.
- 4.6.8: Stone patterns, sizes and color of individual stones should be similar to those found at the property or in historic buildings in the historic district and typical of structures of the same style, type, age and location.
- 4.6.9: Masonry bonding patterns, sizes and color should be similar to those found at the property or used for historic buildings in the historic district and typical of structures of the same style, type, age and location.

Windows

- 4.6.10: Windows in additions to existing buildings must match or complement the proportion, shape, pattern, size, details and profile of the windows in the historic building. If the historic or existing windows are wood, the windows of the addition may be wood, vinyl-clad wood or aluminum-clad wood. If the historic windows or existing are steel, the windows of the addition should be steel or other compatible metal. All windows in new additions should be of a profile similar to the windows in the historic building.
- 4.6.11: Windows in new stand-alone construction must be similar to their counterparts within the property, block or historic district. These windows may be wood, vinyl clad wood, metal clad wood, or metal with a profile similar to the windows of other buildings on the property. For new infill construction the profile must be similar to the windows used on other properties in the block or historic district.
- 4.6.12: New windows may have a simpler window pane pattern than their historic counterparts; for example, if the historic windows are 6/1 (read “six over one”), then 1/1 windows of the same overall size may be used.

- 4.6.13: Windows constructed entirely of aluminum or vinyl are not permitted, and aluminum surfaces cannot have a clear, mill or anodized finish unless supported by historic documentation for a specific property or structure.
- 4.6.14: Clear glass must be used in all windows. Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass in windows is generally not appropriate. Patterned, leaded or colored glass can be used in transoms and sidelights when established by the architectural style of the building or when supported by historical documentation for a specific property or structure.
- 4.6.15: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glass) windows are acceptable for additions or new construction. When muntins are proposed for a divided light appearance they should be “true divided lights” meaning that the thin wood framing (called ‘muntins’) completely frames and separates each piece of glass from the others.
- 4.6.16: Simulated muntins sandwiched between layers of glass in thermal windows, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins may not be used except when internal muntins are used in conjunction with permanently fixed surface-applied muntins on the interior and the exterior of the glass.
- 4.6.17: Security bars may be used only on the interior side of windows and not sandwiched in between the layers of insulated glass.
- 4.6.18: Storm windows and window screens are permitted and should meet the recommendations and requirements of the applicable sections in the “Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.

Doors

- 4.6.19: Recommendations and requirements for garage type doors are described in the “Garage” section of this chapter.
- 4.6.20: Recommendations and requirements for primary entrance doors, screen doors and storm doors, and doors that are visible from the public right-of-way are the same as described for the “Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.
- 4.6.21: Swinging (French) or sliding patio doors used for new construction in the back of a new infill primary building, or new garages, accessory buildings, or new additions in the back yard and used in conjunction with sidelights may use the recommendations and requirements associated with the previous subsection of this section, “Windows,” provided that the patio doors and sidelights will match.
- 4.6.22: Pedestrian doors that are not visible from the public right-of-way may be made of alternate materials including aluminum clad wood, composite wood, and fiberglass. Doors in Heritage Hills must be of solid wood.

Roof and Roofing Materials

- 4.6.23: Wood shingles, composition shingles, slate tiles, terra cotta or clay tiles are permitted for use on roofs. Recommendations and requirements for these materials are found in the “Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.
 - 4.6.26: Composition roofs should be of higher quality and are often referred to as Architectural Grade or Dimensional Grade. These shingles are usually rated as 30-, 40-, or 50-year shingles and have a thicker profile.
 - 4.6.29: Historic eaves, copings, cornices, dormers and roof trim should be retained and preserved.
- c. Considerations: The proposal appears to meet all criteria of the Standards and Guidelines. Materials appear to be consistent with criteria except that windows that are simulated divided lite must have grills between thermal glass and permanently attached interior and exterior grills. Documentation of the window may not fully describe compliance with the criteria.
- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That the proposed addition is not visible from the rights of way;
 2. That the proposed addition is easily discernible as an addition to the primary, historic dwelling;
 3. That the design of the proposed addition does not compete with historic structures or their design components;
 4. That the dimensions of the proposed addition are consistent with criteria and the addition is no deeper, no wider, and no taller than the historic dwelling;
 5. That the addition is planned to the back of the structure;
 6. That the design of the proposed addition is compatible with but subordinate to the historic dwelling.

E. HPCA-20-00180 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve Item 1, construct addition, with the following conditions,** with the specific findings that the proposed work, with the **agreed-upon conditions**, will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; the items comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

- 1) That the proposed addition is not visible from the rights of way;
- 2) That the proposed addition is easily discernible as an addition to the primary, historic dwelling;
- 3) That the design of the proposed addition does not compete with historic structures

or their design components;

- 4) That the dimensions of the proposed addition are consistent with criteria and the addition is no deeper, no wider, and no taller than the historic dwelling;
- 5) That the addition is planned to the back of the structure;
- 6) That the design of the proposed addition is compatible with but subordinate to the historic dwelling.

Conditions:

- 1) That the proposed windows must be illustrated to meet criteria for simulated divided lite as indicated in the Standards and Guidelines.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

ady