



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

February 22, 2021

HPCA-20-00051

Agenda Item: VI.D.1.

Case Number: HPCA-20-00051

Property Address: 436 NW 30th Street

District: Jefferson Park Historic District

Applicant: Jorge Mendros
5800 N Porter Ave
Norman, OK 73071

Owner: Mumtaz Khan
17109 Wales Green Ave
Edmond, OK 73012

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Install window and entry door at north elevation (elective);
2. Remove stair, ramp, and door on east side of structure (elective);
4. Reconfigure entry at rear of structure (elective); and
6. Install drive and parking lot (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant proposes various alteration to a structure, including doors, windows, ramps, and parking. No new materials have been received for this application. This application has one continuance remaining.

2. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 30th between Walker and Hudson.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: circa 1917

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1998

National Register Listing: 1995

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:

436 NW 30th. 1917. This is a one-story converted house of no distinctive style, built as a bungalow with exposed rafter tails. The false aluminum front was added to indicate a commercial establishment (non-original). The two entrances are on the front. The false

front has a concrete block foundation. This building is noncontributing due to alterations. *Note: While the National Register of Historic Places identifies contributing and non-contributing properties, the City of Oklahoma City's HP zoning does not make this distinction.*

Additional Information:

The 1922 Sanborn map indicates a one-story, frame dwelling with a front porch spanning the western 2/3s of the front (north) elevation and a small rear porch. A one-story, frame "autohouse" (garage) is indicated near the southeast corner of the property. No changes are shown on subsequent maps. By the time of the 1995 National Register nomination, a false commercial front had been constructed on the building. This was removed some time after 2015. There do not appear to have been any approvals for the removal of the storefront.

4. Existing Conditions

The commercial front has been removed, revealing a gable roof and what may be an enclosed porch with commercial style door and windows. Concrete steps and a ramp access a door on the east side of the structure.

5. Previous Actions

None recorded.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 1, Install window and entry door at north elevation (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to replace a single door with a pair of doors at the front elevation, and to add a second picture window at the front elevation. Details of the door and window to be installed have not been provided but they appear to be comparable to the existing window and door. Proposed signage is listed in the application but is not illustrated in the submitted materials.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.1 Maintenance, Preservation and Rehabilitation of Exterior Building Materials

Policy: Maintain and preserve original or historic exterior finishes and materials such as wood, brick, stone and stucco. When repair or replacement of materials is needed, consideration should be given to sustainable methods and materials that also maintain the historical visual character of a building or property.

Design Justification: The form, materials and details of exterior walls, roofs, door and window openings, and decorative details, as well as scale, texture and variety, contribute to a building's historic character. The texture, patterns and finishes of historic materials such as clay tile, slate, brick, stone, stucco and wood siding are important character-defining features; obscuring or removing these features diminishes the significance of historic buildings and structures.

Sustainability Justification: The exterior materials of a building represent embodied energy and preserving them helps maintain a building's architectural integrity and its embodied energy. When maintained properly, these materials can last indefinitely, eliminating the need to use new resources for their replacement. When new materials are necessary, consideration should be given to sustainability, which includes the availability of raw resources, the method and energy used to extract, transport, and process the raw resources, the energy to manufacture and transport a commercial product, and longevity of installed materials.

- 3.1.1: Retain and preserve original and historic materials to sustain the historic character of a property and the embodied energy of the materials. Historic architectural features and materials that define the historic character of a building, property, or district shall be maintained in good repair.
- 3.1.2: Original or historic wood finishes must be maintained and painted (if painted historically).
- 3.1.3: Ordinary maintenance and repair typically addresses one half (50%) or less of an original or appropriate building feature, component or material on any one building face or roof, and may involve replacement of areas or parts of the building due to damage or failure of a component or material. A Certificate of Appropriateness is not required for work that meets the requirements of "Ordinary Maintenance and Repair" (See the Municipal Code, Chapter 59, Article 2).
- 3.1.4: Repairs shall be done with like materials.
- 3.1.5: If repairs or replacement affect more than one-half (50%) of an inappropriate component or material located on any individual building face or roof, then it is strongly encouraged that all of the inappropriate components or materials be replaced with appropriate materials. A Certificate of Appropriateness is required when all of the inappropriate materials are proposed for replacement. See "Administrative Review" below.
- 3.1.10: Oklahoma City's historic districts contain structures from a wide range of eras with varying degrees of historic significance and integrity. Changes to the exterior of any structure or site, regardless of its age, have the ability to contribute to, or to detract from, the overall character of the district and are subject to review. Changes to structures or additions built within the last 25 years or determined by the Commission to be non-historic shall be reviewed under the guidelines for New Construction.

- 3.1.11: If more than 50% of a an original feature or material on any one surface of any one face of a building, including the roof, requires repair by replacement in kind, then the scope of the work exceeds the definition of ordinary maintenance and repair and a Certificate of Appropriateness is required.
- 3.1.12: If repairs or replacement affect more than two-thirds (66%) of an inappropriate component or material located on any individual building face, then all inappropriate components or materials shall be replaced with an appropriate component or material. Removal of more than 50% of an inappropriate material no longer meets the definition of ordinary maintenance and repair, and a Certificate of Appropriateness is required.
- 3.1.13: For example, on a building with vinyl siding, if over two-thirds (66%) of this siding is to be removed from the front building face and replaced due to deterioration or damage, then all of this inappropriate siding on that building face shall be replaced with an appropriate material such as wood siding or the historic material (which is likely to be historic wood siding) shall be uncovered and restored.
- 3.1.14: Remove an inappropriate component or material and restore the original or historic component or material that is revealed by such removal.
- 3.1.15: New material should match the historic in material type, dimensions, design, configuration, texture, surface coatings and visual appearance.
- 3.1.16: When a missing or severely deteriorated feature, element, or component is replaced, it shall be replaced in-kind, that is, matching the original in dimensions, detail, size, form, material and finish.
- 3.1.17: Incompatible non-historic alterations to a historic building are encouraged to be removed, and the building restored to its original appearance during the period of significance.
- 3.1.18: Renovations previously undertaken may conceal original or historic building fabric. When altering a historic building, non-historic alterations in the area of the proposed alteration should be removed.
- 3.1.19: If original or historic materials do not remain, the original form may be reconstructed or restored based on physical, photographic, or documentary evidence.
- 3.1.25: Removal of existing synthetic materials is strongly encouraged to recover authentic historic finish and appearance of a building and its components.
- 3.1.26: Historic architectural features and materials should be retained and preserved when adapting the building to contemporary use.
- 3.1.27: If replication of original elements is not possible because of a lack of historical physical, photographic or documentary evidence, then a new design

that is compatible with the original form, style, and period of the building shall be used.

- 3.1.28: An appropriate option for a replacement feature is a new design that is compatible with the remaining character-defining features of the historic building.
- 3.1.29: The new design of a missing feature shall take into account the size, scale, and materials of the historic building; should be clearly differentiated to avoid a false historical appearance; and should maintain visual attention on the authentic and historic aspects of the building.
- 3.1.30: New compatible designs for missing features should be reversible so that they can be replaced with a more appropriate design in the event that better and more accurate historical evidence becomes available.
- 3.1.31: Synthetic siding materials such as vinyl and aluminum bear little resemblance to historic siding materials and are not sustainable. The application of such materials is not appropriate and will not be approved in historic districts.
- 3.1.32: Exterior insulation finish systems, curtain wall, concrete block, imitative brick or stone or gravel aggregate materials shall not be used as replacement exterior wall materials.
- 3.1.33: The removal of metal or vinyl siding may allow the recovery of original or historic decorative elements such as cornices, brackets, and window and door trim that have been damaged or removed when the synthetic materials were installed. Recovery of such details should be based on physical or photographic evidence first, and based on similar details for buildings in the block or district second.

3.5 Doors and Entries

Policy: Doors and entrances are important aspects of the architectural character of a building. Historic doors and entries should be retained and preserved.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, pattern and size of doors contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the style and period of the building.

Sustainability Justification: Preserving original or historic doors is part of the overall sustainability of the building and they should be made air-tight with proper weather-stripping. Storm doors help to enhance energy conservation. Blower-door tests, performed as part of an energy audit, can document air leaks that should be sealed.

- 3.5.4: The design of replacement doors shall be based on historic documentation, if available, and shall reflect the style and period of the building. Replacement doors shall be compatible with historic doors in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.

- 3.5.5: Preserve existing historic door openings, do not enlarge or diminish to fit stock door sizes.
- 3.5.6: Unless documentation is provided to demonstrate other materials were historically used on a building, primary (usually the front door) entrance doors shall be wood.
- 3.5.7: New door openings at back elevations are permitted and shall minimize damage to the original design of the building and character-defining features.
- 3.5.8: New door openings in the front facade of a primary building are not permitted.
- 3.5.9: New door openings on side elevations may be permitted only in the back 30% of the length of the side elevation and are not permitted on the street-facing side elevation of corner properties.
- 3.5.10: If new openings are necessary due to code requirements or other reasons, they may be considered under unique circumstances and must be compatible with existing door openings in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size and material.
- 3.5.11: Alternative materials for doors and door frames such as composite wood and aluminum clad wood, may be considered for side and back door locations except for the Heritage Hills Historic and Architectural District for which only wood doors are permitted.

3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

Policy: Windows and shutters are important character-defining features of a building and originals should be retained and kept in good repair. Awnings may be an intended permanent character defining feature such as wood framed and finished with roof shingles to match the rest of the building or temporary such as contemporary fabric awnings with aluminum frames.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, positioning, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the architectural style and period of the building. Their design, details and craftsmanship make them worthy of preservation. The presence or absence of shutters and awnings are significant to the visual character of a building.

Sustainability Justification: Many buildings in historic districts retain old-growth wood windows which can last indefinitely if they are properly maintained, unlike new-growth wood or vinyl windows. In most cases, windows account for less than one-fourth of a home's heat loss. Insulating the attic, walls and basement is a more economical approach to reducing energy costs than replacing historic windows. Proper maintenance and sealing of windows, along with adding storm windows, keeps windows out of landfills and enhances a building's energy efficiency year round.

- 3.6.2: Retain and preserve original or historic windows. Preserve and maintain historic window framing and number and configuration of glass

panes.

- 3.6.4: The application of ultraviolet (UV) film to window glazing is the least costly option for reducing heat gain from sunlight and may be an acceptable addition to window glass. UV filters can have a service life of ten or more years; when replacement of the film is required, great care must be taken not damage to historic glass and framing.
 - 3.6.6: New window openings may be allowed on the back facade or the back 30% of the side elevations. New windows must be compatible with historic or existing windows in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials and details.
 - 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
 - 3.6.9: If original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile.
 - 3.6.12: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glazing) windows are acceptable as replacement windows when the historic windows in a building have been previously removed. When used, thermal pane windows must have true divided lites.
 - 3.6.13: A thermal pane window may be appropriate for replacement of a historic wood or metal window when the existing window frame and sash parts are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair. To replace a historic window with a new unit a window survey including a photograph of the interior and exterior of the unit must be provided to substantiate the condition of the window. Historic windows visible from the public-right-of-way must be retained and repaired or replaced in kind, including replication of muntins pattern and profile.
 - 3.6.15: Muntins sandwiched between layers of glass, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins are not appropriate and shall not be used.
 - 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.
 - 3.6.18: A new window may have a low emissivity coating applied to clear glass provided that the visible light transmittance is not less than .74 and the overall reflectance is not more than 17%.
- c. Considerations: The subject property was once a house with a footprint similar to the house directly east. The front façade has been altered, likely widening and enclosing the historic front porch. All elements at the front façade are now of a commercial nature, including a storefront-style door and fixed picture windows.

The proposed alterations are consistent with the existing, non-historic features. The proposed alterations to the windows and doors, as well as the existing conditions for

which there does not appear to have been a Certificate of Appropriateness are not appropriate to a residential structure and do not move this structure closer to a historically appropriate appearance.

It may be more appropriate to provide changes to the front of the structure that are more in keeping with the architectural character of the original structure and surrounding historic properties.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed alterations do not meet relevant Guidelines for new windows and doors;
2. That window and door materials and configuration more in keeping with the architectural style of the property and surrounding properties may be more appropriate.

2. Item 2, Remove stair, ramp, and door on east side of structure (elective); and Item 4, Reconfigure entry at rear of structure (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to remove the stair and ramp on the east side of the structure and to enclose the east door and cover with siding to match the existing siding. The applicant proposes to install a ramp at the rear of the structure to access an existing back door.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.9 Accessory Structures

- 3.9.6: Locate ramps, railings or other accessibility-related installations on the back or side elevation of an accessory building and in an unobtrusive location. If locating a ramp on the primary facade of an accessory building is necessary, the ramp and railing must be installed in a way that does not damage the historic fabric and is as unobtrusive as possible.
- c. Considerations: The existing ramp and stair are non-historic, as is the door. It is unknown if the door opening is historic or was perhaps a window opening. The proposed ramp does not appear to be visible from the public right-of-way and meets relevant Guidelines for installing accessibility-related features.
 - d. Recommended Specific Findings:
 1. That the ramp proposed to be removed is non historic and its removal will not affect the historic character of the property or district;
 2. That the ramp proposed to be installed meets relevant Guidelines, is not visible from the public right-of-way, and will not affect the historic character of the property or district.

3. Item 6, Install drive and parking lot (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to install a driveway and to create a parking lot at the rear of the structure. The drive appears to measure 16'6" spanning from the east wall of the structure to the east property line. The rear portion of the lot is illustrated to

be fully paved with angled parking spaces. No changes to the parking at the front of the property are proposed.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.3 Sidewalks, Driveways, Parking Lots, Curbs and Vacant Sites

Policy: *Sidewalks, driveways and off-street parking should not interrupt the historic continuity of landscaped front or corner side yards. Historic concrete sidewalks and walkways should be preserved and repaired with concrete that is consistent in pattern, size, texture and color. Historic concrete driveways should be preserved and new driveways should be of concrete rather than asphalt.*

Design Justification: Historically, the consistency and repetition of sidewalk and driveway spacing, placement, dimension and materials create a rhythm to the street. Retaining the specific rhythm of a street is important to preserve historic character. Oklahoma City's historic districts and properties have strong visual elements of grey colored concrete for sidewalks, walkways, some streets and curbs.

Sustainability Justification: Existing historic concrete sidewalks, steps and driveways represent embodied energy and should be preserved. Concrete is a long-lasting sustainable material, reflects solar heat and light and should be repaired or replaced as needed with new concrete to match. New driveways should be of similar design, pattern, texture, dimensions and color as the historic driveway. The use of permeable paving for non-historic and new driveways, sidewalks and parking areas is encouraged because it helps to reduce water run-off.

- 2.3.5: Maintain the continuity of existing original or historic sidewalks and the curb cut radius or curved approach when replacing an existing driveway or introducing a new driveway.
- 2.3.6: New concrete for sidewalks, driveways, curbs, and parking lots shall match the aged appearance in design details, color and texture of the existing concrete it replaces or adjacent concrete that will remain. If new concrete is not replacing existing concrete and is not adjacent to any existing concrete it should have an aged appearance in color and finish. New concrete visible from the public right-of-way shall not be bright white in color.
- 2.3.7: All sidewalks, driveways, and curbs visible from the public right-of-way shall be constructed to maintain the continuity of materials and character present in the district.
- 2.3.10: Locate new driveways and sidewalks so that the topography of the building site and significant landscape features, such as mature trees, are retained. Protect mature trees and other significant landscape features from direct construction damage and from delayed damage such as destruction of root area or soil compaction by not permitting construction equipment access

to the ground area under the tree canopy.

- 2.3.12: Driveways, eight feet or less in width, may be replaced by a driveway of up to ten feet in width; width may vary as the driveway approaches the garage to correspond to the width of the garage door openings. However, property owners are encouraged to limit the quantity of impervious concrete surfaces to assist in reducing storm water runoff.
 - 2.3.16: New impermeable parking surfaces must be graded to drain toward the street and away from buildings.
 - 2.3.18: Removal of non-historic existing parking lots adjacent to streets and driveways is encouraged to create an unbroken blockface.
 - 2.3.20: Screen parking from streets and pedestrian areas by placing parking areas at the back of a property and behind primary structures. New parking areas for corner lots shall be located behind primary structures, set back as far as possible from side streets, and placed so as to be as inconspicuous as possible.
 - 2.3.21: In addition to being located at the back of the lot, new parking areas for commercial properties must be screened from adjacent residential property by sight-proof screening with fences, walls or dense vegetation at least six feet tall. Landscape screens are preferred, because they absorb carbon dioxide.
- c. Considerations: The proposed parking area is located behind the building and at the back of the property. It will be visible up the driveway, which is 16'6" wide. Existing parking at the street is not proposed to be removed or altered, resulting in a site that is completely paved except for the structure itself. Additional information from the applicant may be necessary to verify how much parking is required and whether alternatives to reduce the amount of proposed paving are feasible.
- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That the increased paving, without the removal of existing paving at the front of the site, appears to be inappropriate and may exceed the required parking for the property.

E. HPCA-20-00051 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve Items 2, Remove stair, ramp, and door on east side of structure (elective); and Item 4, Reconfigure entry at rear of structure** with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the ramp proposed to be removed is non historic and its removal will not affect

- the historic character of the property or district;
2. That the ramp proposed to be installed meets relevant Guidelines, is not visible from the public right-of-way, and will not affect the historic character of the property or district.

- 2. Deny Item 1, Install window and entry door at north elevation and Item 6, Install drive and parking lot without Prejudice** with the specific finding that the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; is not consistent with the provisions of the Standards and Guidelines and is not in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the specific findings in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

Items 1:

1. That the proposed alterations do not meet relevant Guidelines for new windows and doors;
2. That window and door materials and configuration more in keeping with the architectural style of the property and surrounding properties may be more appropriate;

Item 6:

1. That the increased paving, without the removal of existing paving at the front of the site, appears to be inappropriate and may exceed the required parking for the property.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

ady