



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

February 22, 2021

HPCA-20-00165

Agenda Item: VI.D.6.

Case Number: HPCA-20-00165

Property Address: 2225 NW 28th Street

District: Shepherd Historic District

Applicant: Cornerstone C. C. LLC.
Foster Davis
6301 NW 41st Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73008

Owner: Chad Kincer
2225 NW 28th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73107

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Construct addition (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant proposes to construct an addition at the rear of the primary dwelling.

2. Location

Project site is located on the north side of NW 28th Street, mid-block between Barnes and Youngs Blvd.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1939

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1998

National Register Listing: 1997

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:

2225 Northwest 28th, C. 1939. This two-story Colonial Revival house has a side gabled composition roof with an arched attached garage on the left side. The first floor is brick; second floor and garage, siding. The entrance and porch are located on the left front and sheltered with a shed roof. The top of a brick chimney is visible on the left gable side toward the rear of the main house. Porch columns are grouped and the beam between their supports is arched.

Additional Information:

The two-story dwelling with attached garage and rear porch appears to remain unchanged.

4. Existing Conditions

The dwelling has 899 square feet at the first floor, and an additional 352 square feet of attached garage on the west side is set back slightly from the front wall of the dwelling. The upper story is 638 square feet located atop the front wall of the dwelling, leaving the rear 1/3 of the structure at 1-story. The garage and upper story are wood siding, while the first story is brick. The front porch spans just over half of the front façade and includes wood arches and posts.

5. Previous Actions

None.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 1, Construct addition (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes the construction of a 20 by 30 foot addition at the rear of the dwelling. The proposal includes a low sloped gable end facing north, a brick veneer and chimney, 6-inch, cementitious siding in the gable end, cementitious fascia, an architectural grade shingle, wood windows and French doors with **true divided lite meeting the criteria**, and a half round, concrete landing. A vertical brick detail is proposed at the connection between the existing, historic wall and the addition.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

4.3 Building Additions

Policy: Additions should complement and not detract from the overall historic character of the historic district.

Design Justification: The way in which a historic building and an addition to it relate is important in protecting the integrity of the historic property and district. An addition directly affects the integrity of the building as a whole. Building additions should not detract from the historic character of the historic building or district.

- 4.3.1: Additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes, and should be appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building. The incorporation of existing architectural features with new design elements can contribute added interest

and compatibility.

- 4.3.2: New additions must be planned so that they are constructed to the back of the property or on a non-character-defining elevation preferably not visible from the public right-of-way. Character-defining features of buildings should not be radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed by an addition. The existing historic building fabric should not be damaged by the installation of a new addition.
- 4.3.3: It is not appropriate to alter the overall character of historic districts by substantially reducing the ratio of open space to built space on any site through new construction, additions or introduction of surface paving or other hardscape feature.
- 4.3.4: New additions shall not exceed 50% of the square footage of the footprint of the existing historic structure (enclosed space only), or 750 square feet, whichever is larger, and shall be no taller, no wider, and no deeper than the existing historic structure.
- 4.3.5: Additions to historic or non-historic buildings should relate to and complement the style of the main building, and may relate to the general style of the streetscape.
- 4.3.6: An addition to a historic building must be designed to be visibly distinguishable from the original historic building.
- 4.3.7: Additions to historic buildings should be designed so that connections between new construction and historic structures are clearly discernible. A clear definition of the transition between the new addition and the historic structure should be established and maintained.
- 4.3.8: An addition may be differentiated from the historic building by connecting the two with a modest connector, designed to be as transparent and unobtrusive as possible.
- 4.3.9: Historic details in the coping, eaves and parapet of the historic building may be continued at the point where the historic structure connects to the addition.
- 4.3.10: Additions should be clearly secondary to and distinct from the original building. This can be accomplished by providing a clear visual break between the historic building and the addition, by setting the façade of the addition back from that of the historic building, or by constructing a recessed area at the point at which the addition and the historic building join together.
- 4.3.11: Use of different but compatible materials or different (simplified) detailing is also appropriate to differentiate a new addition from the historic building.
- 4.3.12: The design of a new addition must consider and respect the massing, roof shape, bay spacing, cornice lines and materials of the building to which

it is being added.

- 4.3.15: Facades of additions facing an alley or rear property line may be simplified and secondary in design to that of facades that are more visible from adjacent properties or the streetscape public right-of-way. The same materials should be used for alley-facing facades as that of the other facades unless this varies from the typical historic condition within the district.

4.6 Exterior Materials at New Construction

Wall Materials

- 4.6.2: Materials for new construction should be consistent with those at other buildings within the property, block and historic district. Consideration should be given to the pattern of development of the specific property and lot.
- 4.6.3: Wood siding may be tongue and groove, shiplap, novelty or other compatible type. Board and batten may also be appropriate for use on accessory buildings; it is rarely used on primary buildings.
- 4.6.4: Brick is a common material in Oklahoma City historic districts and is appropriate for use on new construction.
- 4.6.6: Cementitious siding (smooth finish) of an appropriate profile may be used at new construction of stand-alone primary buildings, garages and other accessory buildings. It may also be used for additions to historic structures.
- 4.6.9: Masonry bonding patterns, sizes and color should be similar to those found at the property or used for historic buildings in the historic district and typical of structures of the same style, type, age and location.

Windows

- 4.6.10: Windows in additions to existing buildings must match or complement the proportion, shape, pattern, size, details and profile of the windows in the historic building. If the historic or existing windows are wood, the windows of the addition may be wood, vinyl-clad wood or aluminum-clad wood. If the historic windows or existing are steel, the windows of the addition should be steel or other compatible metal. All windows in new additions should be of a profile similar to the windows in the historic building.
- 4.6.11: Windows in new stand-alone construction must be similar to their counterparts within the property, block or historic district. These windows may be wood, vinyl clad wood, metal clad wood, or metal with a profile similar to the windows of other buildings on the property. For new infill construction the profile must be similar to the windows used on other properties in the block or historic district.
- 4.6.14: Clear glass must be used in all windows. Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass in windows is generally not appropriate. Patterned, leaded or colored glass can be used in transoms and sidelights when established by the architectural style of the building or when supported by

historical documentation for a specific property or structure.

- 4.6.15: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glass) windows are acceptable for additions or new construction. When muntins are proposed for a divided light appearance they should be “true divided lights” meaning that the thin wood framing (called ‘muntins’) completely frames and separates each piece of glass from the others.
- 4.6.16: Simulated muntins sandwiched between layers of glass in thermal windows, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins may not be used except when internal muntins are used in conjunction with permanently fixed surface-applied muntins on the interior and the exterior of the glass.

Doors

- 4.6.21: Swinging (French) or sliding patio doors used for new construction in the back of a new infill primary building, or new garages, accessory buildings, or new additions in the back yard and used in conjunction with sidelights may use the recommendations and requirements associated with the previous subsection of this section, “Windows,” provided that the patio doors and sidelights will match.
- 4.6.22: Pedestrian doors that are not visible from the public right-of-way may be made of alternate materials including aluminum clad wood, composite wood, and fiberglass. Doors in Heritage Hills must be of solid wood.

Roof and Roofing Materials

- 4.6.26: Composition roofs should be of higher quality and are often referred to as Architectural Grade or Dimensional Grade. These shingles are usually rated as 30-, 40-, or 50-year shingles and have a thicker profile.
- 4.6.28: Multi-colored asphalt shingles and synthetic wood shingles should not be used on sloped roofs.
- 4.6.29: Historic eaves, copings, cornices, dormers and roof trim should be retained and preserved.

- c. Considerations: The proposed addition calls for materials that are consistent with the Guidelines and are compatible with the historic structure. The applicant proposes cementitious siding in the eaves and a brick veneer. As the house has an overlay of metal siding, the underlying siding has not been determined, and the proposed siding profile is proposed to match that of the aluminum siding. Should the aluminum siding be disturbed during construction, and the wood siding become visible, an alternate profile could be administratively approved should the owner desire.

The proposed dimensions of the addition are consistent with the criteria at 600 square feet. Fenestration is proposed on each wall. The change in the roof may contribute sufficient articulation to the length of the wall.

The use of only a vertical brick detail to differentiate between the historic dwelling and the proposed addition provides minimal, visible differentiation between the existing

structure and the addition. The criteria states that “Additions should be clearly secondary to and distinct from the original building. This can be accomplished by providing a clear visual break between the historic building and the addition, by setting the façade of the addition back from that of the historic building, or by constructing a recessed area at the point at which the addition and the historic building join together”. Though vertical lines are occasionally approved where setbacks or off sets are not conducive to the use of space, typically on very small additions, a more obvious form of differentiation is usually required.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed addition is consistent with size restraints as detailed in the Guidelines;
2. That the materials of the proposed addition are consistent with the Guidelines and compatible with the existing structure;
3. That the change in roof and vertical brick detail contribute to minimal differentiation between the historic structure and the new addition;
4. That additions must be clearly secondary to and distinct from the original building and can be accomplished by providing a clear visual break between the historic building and the addition; and
5. That additional differentiation may be necessary at the east and west walls.

E. HPCA-20-00165 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Continue Item 1, construct addition**, with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed addition is consistent with size restraints as detailed in the Guidelines;
2. That the materials of the proposed addition are consistent with the Guidelines and compatible with the existing structure;
3. That the change in roof and vertical brick detail contribute to minimal differentiation between the historic structure and the new addition;
4. That additions must be clearly secondary to and distinct from the original building and can be accomplished by providing a clear visual break between the historic building and the addition; and
5. That additional differentiation may be necessary at the east and west walls.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

ady