



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

February 22, 2021

HPCA-20-00171

Agenda Item: VI.D.7.

Case Number: HPCA-20-00171

Property Address: 433 NW 28th Street

District: Jefferson Park Historic District

Applicant: Old Home Rescue
Ty McBride
401 S Blackwelder Ave
Oklahoma City, OK 73108

Owner: 945 Uptown LLC
Jack Chamberlain
5716 Oak Tree Road
Edmond, OK 73025

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Replace windows (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant proposes to replace all existing 1-over-1 replacement windows on the structure and 2 remaining historic pairs of windows.

2. Location

Project site is located on the north side of NW 28th Street, mid-block between Walker and Hudson.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1928

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1998

National Register Listing 1995

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:

433 Northwest 28th, Park Lane Apartments, 1930. This is a two-story, brick Tudor Revival apartment building with a steep roof with no overhang. The façade features a centered gabled with an arched attic vent. There is an arched center 2nd story window with a fanlight upper sash. A rectangular portal is below this window. The rectangular openings have cast casings. 'Park Lane' is inscribed in the block above the opening. The boarded over entrance

is flanked by sidelights.

Additional Information:

None relevant.

4. Existing Conditions

The building is a multi-plex, circa 1928, with brick veneer and historically 8/1 wood windows throughout. The windows are generally in poor condition, and specifically, most of the historic windows at the rear, north, ends of both the east and west and on the rear, north, wall have been replaced with 1/1 windows of an inappropriate design.

5. Previous Actions

None.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 1, Replace windows (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant indicates that all replacement windows will be replaced with new windows, and that 4 pairs of historic windows are deteriorated more than 50% beyond repair and require replacement. The proposed windows are illustrated as aluminum clad, wood windows, with insulated glass. There are two pairs of 8/1 historic windows that are proposed for replacement on the west and 2 pairs on the east.

All windows on the north façade are 1/1 replacement windows; the historic condition is not known. Aluminum clad, 1/1 windows are proposed at the north façade.

Windows 30 through 37 on the east facade at the north end of the structure are 1/1 replacement windows. The historic condition was 8/1, wood windows with true divided lite. Aluminum clad, 1/1 windows are proposed.

Windows 26 through 29 on the east beneath the small gable end are historic 8/1, wood, windows with true divide lite and are illustrated as deteriorated more than 50% beyond repair. Proposed replacement windows are 8/1, aluminum clad, simulated divided lite with insulated glass. Interior and exterior, permanently attached muntin bars are proposed.

Windows 53 through 58 on the west side of the building toward the rear, north, are 1/1 replacement windows. Proposed replacement windows are 1/1, aluminum clad, wood windows.

Windows 51 and 52 on the west side at the north end, first floor, are 8/1 historic wood

windows that are illustrated as deteriorated beyond repair. The proposed replacement windows are 1/1, aluminum clad wood windows to match the surrounding windows and the sets of matching windows in the same location on the east.

Windows 59 and 60 on the west side, first floor, beneath the small gable end are 8/1, historic wood windows illustrated as deteriorated beyond repair. Replacement windows are proposed as aluminum clad, wood windows, with simulated divided lite and insulated glass.

Windows 61 and 62 directly below the small gable on the second floor, west side, are 1/1 replacement windows. The proposed replacement is 8/1, aluminum clad, wood windows with simulated divided lite and insulated glass.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.1 Maintenance, Preservation and Rehabilitation of Exterior Building Materials

Policy: Maintain and preserve original or historic exterior finishes and materials such as wood, brick, stone and stucco. When repair or replacement of materials is needed, consideration should be given to sustainable methods and materials that also maintain the historical visual character of a building or property.

Design Justification: The form, materials and details of exterior walls, roofs, door and window openings, and decorative details, as well as scale, texture and variety, contribute to a building's historic character. The texture, patterns and finishes of historic materials such as clay tile, slate, brick, stone, stucco and wood siding are important character-defining features; obscuring or removing these features diminishes the significance of historic buildings and structures.

Sustainability Justification: The exterior materials of a building represent embodied energy and preserving them helps maintain a building's architectural integrity and its embodied energy. When maintained properly, these materials can last indefinitely, eliminating the need to use new resources for their replacement. When new materials are necessary, consideration should be given to sustainability, which includes the availability of raw resources, the method and energy used to extract, transport, and process the raw resources, the energy to manufacture and transport a commercial product, and longevity of installed materials.

- 3.1.12: If repairs or replacement affect more than two-thirds (66%) of an inappropriate component or material located on any individual building face, then all inappropriate components or materials shall be replaced with an appropriate component or material.
- 3.1.15: New material should match the historic in material type, dimensions, design, configuration, texture, surface coatings and visual appearance.
- 3.1.16: When a missing or severely deteriorated feature, element, or component is replaced, it shall be replaced in-kind, that is, matching the

original in dimensions, detail, size, form, material and finish.

- 3.1.17: Incompatible non-historic alterations to a historic building are encouraged to be removed, and the building restored to its original appearance during the period of significance.

3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, positioning, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the architectural style and period of the building. Their design, details and craftsmanship make them worthy of preservation. The presence or absence of shutters and awnings are significant to the visual character of a building.

- 3.6.2: Retain and preserve original or historic windows. Preserve and maintain historic window framing and number and configuration of glass panes.
- 3.6.3: Make repairs to an existing window rather than replacing the entire window unit, including replacement in kind of parts that are deteriorated beyond repair. Ordinary maintenance and repair is limited to less than 50% replacement of the window's components and parts including frames and sashes.
- 3.6.5: Original or historic windows more than 50% DETERIORATED BEYOND REPAIR may be replaced in kind.
- 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
- 3.6.9: If original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile.
- 3.6.10: New windows made of aluminum clad wood with enameled finish may be appropriate as replacements for historic wood windows since these may have acceptable sustainable qualities and closely resemble a painted finish.
- 3.6.12: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glazing) windows are acceptable as replacement windows when the historic windows in a building have been previously removed. When used, thermal pane windows must have true divided lites.
- 3.6.13: A thermal pane window may be appropriate for replacement of a historic wood or metal window when the existing window frame and sash parts are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair. To replace a historic window with a new unit a window survey including a photograph of the interior and exterior of the unit must be provided to substantiate the condition of the window. Historic windows visible from the public-right-of-way must

be retained and repaired or replaced in kind, including replication of muntins pattern and profile.

- 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.
- 3.6.17: Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass are not permitted in windows, except that special glass, for example, patterned, leaded or colored glass, can be used in transoms and sidelights when appropriate as established by the architectural style and the specific history of the building for which the special glass is proposed.
- 3.6.18: A new window may have a low emissivity coating applied to clear glass provided that the visible light transmittance is not less than .74 and the overall reflectance is not more than 17%.
- 3.6.19: Security bars must be installed only on the interior of windows.

- c. Considerations: The majority of windows proposed for replacement are non-historic and inappropriate windows. The existing replacement windows are aluminum, 1/1, with inappropriate installation that does not reflect the appearance of the historic windows. Four sets (eight windows) of the historic hung windows have been determined to be deteriorated beyond repair. All replacement takes place on the rear of the building or the rear half of the east and west sides. Salvageable portions of the deteriorated historic windows will be used for parts to repair less damaged windows at other locations on the building. One over one windows are proposed at the least visible locations on the rear and toward the rear on the sides. Eight over one windows are proposed at the more visible location at approximately the middle of the wall on the east and west, beneath the gable end.

The “Sun” window proposed was specifically chosen for its durability and close appearance to the visual components of the historic, true divided lite, wood window, though the window is not true divided lite.

Typically, when there are inappropriate, non-historic features in place, and the historic condition is known, the most appropriate treatment is removal of the deteriorated, non-historic, feature and replacement with a feature and material that is consistent with the historic condition. This is outlined in both subchapter 3.1 regarding repairs and maintenance and in subchapter 3.6 regarding windows. Where historic windows are visible from the public right of way, those should be replaced in kind, including replication of muntin patterns and profile. Removal of non-historic features is recommended; but when repairs exceed 66% of each feature, complete removal and replacement with an appropriate component is required.

Subchapter 3.6 indicates that windows visible from the public right of way must be retained or replaced in kind. Aluminum clad windows and thermal pane windows may be appropriate components should historic windows be demonstrated to be deteriorated more than 50% beyond repair. Thermal pane windows should be true divided lite and typically are allowed only where the historic windows have been previously removed.

The Guidelines indicate that the proportion, shape, location, position, pattern and size of the windows contribute to the historic character of a building and convey the

architectural style and period of the structure. Muntin patterns and profile are important characteristics. As the windows proposed for replacement are largely replacement windows and are minimally visible, the proposed replacement windows may be appropriate for the protection and continued viability of the historic structure.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the historic windows were 8/1, wood, true divided lite, single glazed windows;
2. That 8 windows within 4 openings in the rear half of the building are deteriorated historic, 8/1, wood windows with true divided lite and single glazed glass;
3. That the 8 historic windows proposed for replacement are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair;
4. That the majority of windows proposed for replacement are 1/1 replacement windows;
5. That removal of inappropriate, non-historic features, including windows, is supported in the criteria of 3.1;
6. That when inappropriate, non-historic materials are removed, all inappropriate components or materials shall be replaced with an appropriate component or material, 3.1;
7. That 3.6 indicates that aluminum clad windows and thermal windows may be appropriate components where historic windows have been previously removed;
8. That proposed 1/1, aluminum clad, thermal window locations are minimally visible or not visible from the street right of way;
9. That 8/1, aluminum clad, thermal windows are proposed in minimally visible locations;
10. That the proposed simulated divided lite is close in appearance and size of the existing muntins.

E. HPCA-20-00171 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve Item 1, replace windows;** with the specific findings that the proposed work, with the **agreed-upon conditions**, will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; the items comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

- 1) That the historic windows were 8/1, wood, true divided lite, single glazed windows;
- 2) That 8 windows within 4 openings in the rear half of the building are deteriorated historic, 8/1, wood windows with true divided lite and single glazed glass;
- 3) That the 8 historic windows proposed for replacement are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair;
- 4) That the majority of windows proposed for replacement are 1/1 replacement

windows;

- 5) That removal of inappropriate, non-historic features, including windows, is supported in the criteria of 3.1;
- 6) That when inappropriate, non-historic materials are removed, all inappropriate components or materials shall be replaced with an appropriate component or material, 3.1;
- 7) That 3.6 indicates that aluminum clad windows and thermal windows may be appropriate components where historic windows have been previously removed;
- 8) That proposed 1/1, aluminum clad, thermal window locations are minimally visible or not visible from the street right of way;
- 9) That 8/1, aluminum clad, thermal windows are proposed in minimally visible locations;
- 10) That the proposed simulated divided lite is close in appearance and size of the existing muntins.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

ady