



# STAFF REPORT

## Historic Preservation Commission

February 22, 2021

HPCA-20-00181

---

**Agenda Item:** VI.D.10.

**Case Number:** HPCA-20-00181

**Property Address:** 104 NW 20th Street

**District:** Heritage Hills East Historic District

**Owner:** Trillium Holdings  
Tim Morton  
3200 Wakefield Rd  
Edmond, OK 73034

### A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Construct addition (elective);
6. Replace missing window (elective).

### B. BACKGROUND

#### 1. Project Description

This proposal includes repair of the existing structure in kind at all locations including siding, soffits, eaves, windows, mortar joints, porch floor, sidewalks and driveway. These items are administratively approvable. Items for commission review include replacement of a missing window in kind and construction of a rear addition.

#### 2. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 20<sup>th</sup> Street, between Broadway and Robinson Avenues.

#### 3. Site History

*Date of Construction:* 1920

*Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark:* 1999

*National Register Listing:* 2020

#### *Additional Information:*

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates three frame dwellings on a plot that included lots 1, 2, and 3. Lot 3 illustrates the frame autohouses associated with those dwellings. A 20-foot wide alley, marked "not open," is indicated west of the site with the autohouse for 108 NW 20<sup>th</sup> partially located there. The dwellings west of the alley are approximately 500 square feet larger. The dwellings located on this plot are indicated with shingle roofs, typically wood. The garages are indicated with composition roofs, typically flat. 104 NW 20<sup>th</sup> is the center house on the plot and utilized a garage that shared

a wall with the garage of 100 NW 20<sup>th</sup>. The driveway was likely shared. By 1955 all structures are indicated with composition shingles. No other changes are illustrated on available editions of the maps.

#### 4. Existing Conditions

The dwelling is in poor condition. Water damage, termite infiltration, rot and mold are reported to have overcome all components of the structure. The dwelling has been open to the elements for at least 8 years. Photographs indicate that the structure is uninhabitable due to water infiltration and missing portions of walls, ceilings and floors. No garage is associated with the property, and the driveway does not appear to be included in the boundaries of the property. The applicant has indicated that the sewer line is collapsed. Lots 1, 2 and 3 are historically and currently oriented to Broadway. Thus, this property, oriented to 20<sup>th</sup> Street, occupies 50 feet of lots 1, 2, and 3 for a total length of 150 feet between 2 other dwellings with similar circumstances. Acquisition to access for new plumbing will be challenging.

#### 5. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-19-00002	07/03/2019	Redbud Restoration	Denied
Demolish dwelling.			

Other actions, such as variances, other approvals, citations could also be described here.

### C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.\**

#### 1. Item 6, Replace one window in kind (elective).

- Description: One window of the dwelling is deteriorated beyond repair and is proposed for replacement in kind.
- References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

#### 3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

- 3.6.5: Original or historic windows more than 50% DETERIORATED BEYOND REPAIR may be replaced in kind.
- 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
- 3.6.9: If original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated

beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile.

c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That replacement in kind of historic windows deteriorated beyond repair is appropriate.

**D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS**

*This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020\* as referenced below:*

**1. Item 1, Construct addition (elective).**

- a. Description: The applicant proposed an addition at the rear of the structure that is 29 by 30 feet or 870 square feet. The existing structure is 969 square feet. Total, combined square footage is 1,839 square feet, which would make it the largest single-family structure on the block face. An architectural grade roof, SmartSiding, and wood windows are proposed.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

**4.3 Building Additions**

**Policy:** Additions should complement and not detract from the overall historic character of the historic district.

**Design Justification:** The way in which a historic building and an addition to it relate is important in protecting the integrity of the historic property and district. An addition directly affects the integrity of the building as a whole. Building additions should not detract from the historic character of the historic building or district.

**Sustainability Justification:** New construction should adhere to principles of sustainability in their materials, design and energy efficiency. If construction of additions results in the removal of original fabric, consideration should be given to maximizing the retention or re-use of existing historic features, details and materials.

- 4.3.1: Additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes, and should be appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building. The incorporation of existing architectural features with new design elements can contribute added interest and compatibility.
- 4.3.2: New additions must be planned so that they are constructed to the back of the property or on a non-character-defining elevation preferably not visible from the public right-of-way. Character-defining features of buildings should not be radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed by an addition. The existing historic building fabric should not be damaged by the installation of a new addition.

- 4.3.3: It is not appropriate to alter the overall character of historic districts by substantially reducing the ratio of open space to built space on any site through new construction, additions or introduction of surface paving or other hardscape feature.
- 4.3.4: New additions shall not exceed 50% of the square footage of the footprint of the existing historic structure (enclosed space only), or 750 square feet, whichever is larger, and shall be no taller, no wider, and no deeper than the existing historic structure.
- 4.3.5: Additions to historic or non-historic buildings should relate to and complement the style of the main building, and may relate to the general style of the streetscape.
- 4.3.6: An addition to a historic building must be designed to be visibly distinguishable from the original historic building.
- 4.3.7: Additions to historic buildings should be designed so that connections between new construction and historic structures are clearly discernible. A clear definition of the transition between the new addition and the historic structure should be established and maintained.
- 4.3.8: An addition may be differentiated from the historic building by connecting the two with a modest connector, designed to be as transparent and unobtrusive as possible.
- 4.3.9: Historic details in the coping, eaves and parapet of the historic building may be continued at the point where the historic structure connects to the addition.
- 4.3.10: Additions should be clearly secondary to and distinct from the original building. This can be accomplished by providing a clear visual break between the historic building and the addition, by setting the façade of the addition back from that of the historic building, or by constructing a recessed area at the point at which the addition and the historic building join together.
- 4.3.11: Use of different but compatible materials or different (simplified) detailing is also appropriate to differentiate a new addition from the historic building.
- 4.3.12: The design of a new addition must consider and respect the massing, roof shape, bay spacing, cornice lines and materials of the building to which it is being added.
- 4.3.13: An addition may be horizontal (added to a side or back elevation) or vertical (a second story added to an existing one-story). However, vertical additions are not permitted at corner lots, nor in the Mesa Park Historic District. While vertical additions are not prohibited in other districts and internal lots, it is rare that the other requirements and recommendations of this section can be met.

- 4.3.14: Vertical additions to buildings must be located so that they are not visible to a person standing at ground level on the opposite side of an adjacent right-of-way. A vertical addition is not permitted at a corner lot because such an addition would be visible from the side street.
- 4.3.15: Facades of additions facing an alley or rear property line may be simplified and secondary in design to that of facades that are more visible from adjacent properties or the streetscape public right-of-way. The same materials should be used for alley-facing facades as that of the other facades unless this varies from the typical historic condition within the district.

#### 4.6 Exterior Materials at New Construction

**Policy:** Materials used in the construction of new buildings, additions, garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible in appearance and design with common building materials in the district, or typical of structures of the proposed style, type, age and location.

**Design Justification:** The form, materials and details of exterior walls and embellishments, as well as their scale, texture and variety, contribute to the overall character of the historic district.

**Sustainability Justification:** Materials for new exterior wall construction should be as sustainable as possible. Appropriate siding materials may include stucco, wood, brick, or cementitious siding. Vinyl and metal siding materials are not sustainable and should not be used.

##### Wall Materials

- 4.6.2: Materials for new construction should be consistent with those at other buildings within the property, block and historic district. Consideration should be given to the pattern of development of the specific property and lot.
- 4.6.3: Wood siding may be tongue and groove, shiplap, novelty or other compatible type. Board and batten may also be appropriate for use on accessory buildings; it is rarely used on primary buildings.
- 4.6.4: Brick is a common material in Oklahoma City historic districts and is appropriate for use on new construction.
- 4.6.6: Cementitious siding (smooth finish) of an appropriate profile may be used at new construction of stand-alone primary buildings, garages and other accessory buildings. It may also be used for additions to historic structures.
- 4.6.9: Masonry bonding patterns, sizes and color should be similar to those found at the property or used for historic buildings in the historic district and typical of structures of the same style, type, age and location.

##### Windows

- 4.6.10: Windows in additions to existing buildings must match or complement the proportion, shape, pattern, size, details and profile of the windows in the historic building. If the historic or existing windows are wood,

the windows of the addition may be wood, vinyl-clad wood or aluminum-clad wood. If the historic windows or existing are steel, the windows of the addition should be steel or other compatible metal. All windows in new additions should be of a profile similar to the windows in the historic building.

- 4.6.12: New windows may have a simpler window pane pattern than their historic counterparts; for example, if the historic windows are 6/1 (read “six over one”), then 1/1 windows of the same overall size may be used.
- 4.6.14: Clear glass must be used in all windows. Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass in windows is generally not appropriate. Patterned, leaded or colored glass can be used in transoms and sidelights when established by the architectural style of the building or when supported by historical documentation for a specific property or structure.
- 4.6.15: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glass) windows are acceptable for additions or new construction. When muntins are proposed for a divided light appearance they should be “true divided lights” meaning that the thin wood framing (called ‘muntins’) completely frames and separates each piece of glass from the others.
- 4.6.16: Simulated muntins sandwiched between layers of glass in thermal windows, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins may not be used except when internal muntins are used in conjunction with permanently fixed surface-applied muntins on the interior and the exterior of the glass.
- 4.6.20: Recommendations and requirements for primary entrance doors, screen doors and storm doors, and doors that are visible from the public right-of-way are the same as described for the “Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.
- 4.6.21: Swinging (French) or sliding patio doors used for new construction in the back of a new infill primary building, or new garages, accessory buildings, or new additions in the back yard and used in conjunction with sidelights may use the recommendations and requirements associated with the previous subsection of this section, “Windows,” provided that the patio doors and sidelights will match.
- 4.6.22: Pedestrian doors that are not visible from the public right-of-way may be made of alternate materials including aluminum clad wood, composite wood, and fiberglass. Doors in Heritage Hills must be of solid wood.
- 4.6.23: Wood shingles, composition shingles, slate tiles, terra cotta or clay tiles are permitted for use on roofs. Recommendations and requirements for these materials are found in the “Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.
- 4.6.26: Composition roofs should be of higher quality and are often referred to as Architectural Grade or Dimensional Grade. These shingles are usually rated as 30-, 40-, or 50-year shingles and have a thicker profile.

- 4.6.28: Multi-colored asphalt shingles and synthetic wood shingles should not be used on sloped roofs.
  - 4.6.29: Historic eaves, copings, cornices, dormers and roof trim should be retained and preserved.
- c. Considerations: The proposed addition is in excess of 750 square feet and in excess of 50% of the square footage of the dwelling which is 485 square feet. The criteria limit the square footage of additions to 750 square feet or 50% of the footprint of the house. At only 969 square feet the dwelling is small but typical of the dwellings built in this area and time period. Exceeding the limitations of the criteria and the size of all other single-family dwellings on the block face may not be appropriate.

It is not appropriate to alter the overall character of the district by substantially reducing the ratio of open to built space. As this dwelling is currently the smallest on the block face, an appropriate addition would likely not adversely affect the ratio of open to built space.

The proposed addition is off set to the east and is continuous with the historic side wall on the west. Only a change in material differentiates the addition from the historic wall. Insets on both east and west may more compatibly articulate the transition from historic to new construction and may provide a more compatible roof form while providing a visual break. Though additions should preferably not be visible from the street, an inset at the west elevation would be somewhat hidden by the small projection at the primary historic dwelling.

Window placement is not consistent with historic window placement. Additions must be compatible in design, proportions, size and detail and should be appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building. Wall to window ratios should be consistent with the historic dwellings.

Materials include a wood window, an undescribed pedestrian door, and smooth, “SmartSide” siding to match existing wood. Windows are not fully described, and are similar, but not matching the historic windows in division pattern. The proportions may be sufficiently different that simplifying to one over one is appropriate. Both windows and door require additional documentation. “SmartSide” may be an appropriate material for new construction but should not be the only means of differentiation at the addition.

Both existing and proposed elevations should be included for comparison. Additionally, the existing drawings are not accurate. The owner has made changes to the elevation drawings, but floor plans are not accurate.

- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That additions must be located on the rear and preferably not visible from the public right of way;
  2. That additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, and detail to the adjacent buildings and streetscapes;
  3. That additions must be appropriate to the architecture and character of the historic

building;

4. That additions must be visibly distinguishable from the original historic building;
5. That additions shall not exceed 50% of the size of the footprint of the house, or 750 square feet, whichever is larger;
6. That complete and accurate drawings are required;
7. That complete descriptions and illustrations of proposed exterior materials are required.

**E. HPCA-20-00181 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

1. **Approve Item 6, replace 1 deteriorated window in kind**, with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020\*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

**Specific Findings:**

1. That replacement in kind of historic windows deteriorated beyond repair is appropriate.
2. **Continue Item 1, construct a rear addition** with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020\*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

**Specific Findings:**

- 1) That additions must be located on the rear and preferably not visible from the public right of way;
- 2) That additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, and detail to the adjacent buildings and streetscapes;
- 3) That additions must be appropriate to the architecture and character of the historic building;
- 4) That additions must be visibly distinguishable from the original historic building;
- 5) That additions shall not exceed 50% of the size of the footprint of the house, or 750 square feet, whichever is larger;
- 6) That complete and accurate drawings are required;
- 7) That complete descriptions and illustrations of proposed exterior materials are required.

*Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.*

*\*Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*



*Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at [www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html](http://www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html) ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9<sup>th</sup> floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.*  
*ady*