



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

February 22, 2021

HPCA-20-00185

Agenda Item: VI.D.11.

Case Number: HPCA-20-00185

Property Address: 427 NW 21st Street

District: Heritage Hills Historic District

Applicant: R+J & Associates, LLC
Julie Ann
8921 SW 46th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73179

Owner: Ryan Miller
427 NW 21st Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73108

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

3. Remove back door and window and replace with pair of French doors (elective);
4. Remove basement door and install window (elective); and
5. Remove shutters (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Location

Project site is located on the north side of NW 21st Street, mid-block between Walker and Hudson.

2. Site History

Date of Construction: 1920

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1969

National Register Listing: 1979

Additional Information:

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 2-story frame dwelling with 1- story front porch extending nearly the entire length of the front (south) façade and a porte-cochere on the east with upper story enclosed. A wide, 1-story frame “autohouse” is indicated along the east property line with the front face back nearly $\frac{3}{4}$ of the property depth from the front property line. All structures have shingle roofs, presumably wood. No changes are evident on the subsequent editions.

3. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-773	08/03/1994	Nichols	Approved
Construct a garage and greenhouse.			
HPCA-08-150	11/07/2008	Ehrhardt	Approved
Replace layers of roof, including wood, with new shingles			

Other actions, such as variances, other approvals, citations could also be described here.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

1. Item 3, Remove back door and window and replace with pair of French doors (elective).

- a. **Description:** The proposal is to remove a single pedestrian door, concrete steps, and a window just to the right of the door at a previously altered location on the back of the dwelling. The location is not visible from the public right of way. A new opening and French doors with a new concrete landing are proposed. The proposed doors are wood with beveled, insulated glass, and true divided lites. Existing openings will be treated with wood siding to match existing wood siding, closing those openings as necessary. The new opening will be trimmed to match existing windows and doors with a wider top piece.
- b. **References:** *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.5 Doors and Entries

Policy: Doors and entrances are important aspects of the architectural character of a building. Historic doors and entries should be retained and preserved.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, pattern and size of doors contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the style and period of the building.

Sustainability Justification: Preserving original or historic doors is part of the overall sustainability of the building and they should be made air-tight with proper weather-stripping. Storm doors help to enhance energy conservation. Blower-door tests, performed as part of an energy audit, can document air leaks that should be sealed.

- 3.5.4: The design of replacement doors shall be based on historic documentation, if available, and shall reflect the style and period of the building. Replacement doors shall be compatible with historic doors in

proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.

- 3.5.5: Preserve existing historic door openings, do not enlarge or diminish to fit stock door sizes.
- 3.5.6: Unless documentation is provided to demonstrate other materials were historically used on a building, primary (usually the front door) entrance doors shall be wood.
- 3.5.7: New door openings at back elevations are permitted and shall minimize damage to the original design of the building and character-defining features.
- 3.5.10: If new openings are necessary due to code requirements or other reasons, they may be considered under unique circumstances and must be compatible with existing door openings in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size and material.
- 3.5.11: Alternative materials for doors and door frames such as composite wood and aluminum clad wood, may be considered for side and back door locations except for the Heritage Hills Historic and Architectural District for which only wood doors are permitted.

3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

Policy: Windows and shutters are important character-defining features of a building and originals should be retained and kept in good repair. Awnings may be an intended permanent character defining feature such as wood framed and finished with roof shingles to match the rest of the building or temporary such as contemporary fabric awnings with aluminum frames.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, positioning, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the architectural style and period of the building. Their design, details and craftsmanship make them worthy of preservation. The presence or absence of shutters and awnings are significant to the visual character of a building.

Sustainability Justification: Many buildings in historic districts retain old-growth wood windows which can last indefinitely if they are properly maintained, unlike new-growth wood or vinyl windows. In most cases, windows account for less than one-fourth of a home's heat loss. Insulating the attic, walls and basement is a more economical approach to reducing energy costs than replacing historic windows. Proper maintenance and sealing of windows, along with adding storm windows, keeps windows out of landfills and enhances a building's energy efficiency year round.

- 3.6.5: Original or historic windows more than 50% DETERIORATED BEYOND REPAIR may be replaced in kind.
- 3.6.6: New window openings may be allowed on the back facade or the back 30% of the side elevations. New windows must be compatible with historic or existing windows in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials and details.

- 3.6.7: If an original opening is presently blocked, consider reopening it. The replacement of non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are more historically appropriate is encouraged.
- 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
- 3.6.9: If original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile.
- 3.6.12: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glazing) windows are acceptable as replacement windows when the historic windows in a building have been previously removed. When used, thermal pane windows must have true divided lites.
- 3.6.13: A thermal pane window may be appropriate for replacement of a historic wood or metal window when the existing window frame and sash parts are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair. To replace a historic window with a new unit a window survey including a photograph of the interior and exterior of the unit must be provided to substantiate the condition of the window. Historic windows visible from the public-right-of-way must be retained and repaired or replaced in kind, including replication of muntins pattern and profile.
- 3.6.15: Muntins sandwiched between layers of glass, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins are not appropriate and shall not be used.
- 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.
- 3.6.17: Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass are not permitted in windows, except that special glass, for example, patterned, leaded or colored glass, can be used in transoms and sidelights when appropriate as established by the architectural style and the specific history of the building for which the special glass is proposed.
- 3.6.18: A new window may have a low emissivity coating applied to clear glass provided that the visible light transmittance is not less than .74 and the overall reflectance is not more than 17%.

c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That new openings are allowed on the rear wall of the dwelling;
2. That the existing orientation is not original to the structure as illustrated at an interior wall;
3. That the proposed method of closing the wall with wood siding as the exterior veneer is compatible with the primary dwelling;
4. That trimming the new opening with wood trim to match the existing windows and doors is consistent with the criteria and compatible with the dwelling;

5. That the proposed wood doors are consistent with the criteria, compatible with the dwelling, and discernible as non-historic.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 4, Remove basement door and install window (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to remove an altered door opening just forward of the 50% mark on the side of the dwelling. The opening serves as an entrance to the basement and is largely below grade. The proposed window opening will match adjacent basement window openings, and the proposed window will match the basement windows. The door opening will be finished with wood siding to match existing, and concrete to match the existing stem wall. A wider trim piece will top the window to match adjacent basement windows.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.5 Doors and Entries

Policy: Doors and entrances are important aspects of the architectural character of a building. Historic doors and entries should be retained and preserved.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, pattern and size of doors contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the style and period of the building.

Sustainability Justification: Preserving original or historic doors is part of the overall sustainability of the building and they should be made air-tight with proper weather-stripping. Storm doors help to enhance energy conservation. Blower-door tests, performed as part of an energy audit, can document air leaks that should be sealed.

- 3.5.5: Preserve existing historic door openings, do not enlarge or diminish to fit stock door sizes.
- 3.5.9: New door openings on side elevations may be permitted only in the back 30% of the length of the side elevation and are not permitted on the street-facing side elevation of corner properties.
- 3.5.10: If new openings are necessary due to code requirements or other reasons, they may be considered under unique circumstances and must be compatible with existing door openings in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size and material.

3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

Policy: Windows and shutters are important character-defining features of a building and originals should be retained and kept in good repair. Awnings may be an intended permanent character defining feature such as wood framed and

finished with roof shingles to match the rest of the building or temporary such as contemporary fabric awnings with aluminum frames.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, positioning, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the architectural style and period of the building. Their design, details and craftsmanship make them worthy of preservation. The presence or absence of shutters and awnings are significant to the visual character of a building.

- 3.6.6: New window openings may be allowed on the back facade or the back 30% of the side elevations. New windows must be compatible with historic or existing windows in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials and details.
- 3.6.7: If an original opening is presently blocked, consider reopening it. The replacement of non-historic incompatible windows with windows that are more historically appropriate is encouraged.
- 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
- 3.6.10: New windows made of aluminum clad wood with enameled finish may be appropriate as replacements for historic wood windows since these may have acceptable sustainable qualities and closely resemble a painted finish.
- 3.6.11: Vinyl is not an environmentally sustainable material, and the installation of vinyl-clad wood windows or entirely vinyl framed windows is not appropriate and will not be approved for the historic districts.
- 3.6.12: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glazing) windows are acceptable as replacement windows when the historic windows in a building have been previously removed. When used, thermal pane windows must have true divided lites.
- 3.6.13: A thermal pane window may be appropriate for replacement of a historic wood or metal window when the existing window frame and sash parts are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair. To replace a historic window with a new unit a window survey including a photograph of the interior and exterior of the unit must be provided to substantiate the condition of the window. Historic windows visible from the public-right-of-way must be retained and repaired or replaced in kind, including replication of muntins pattern and profile.
- 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.
- 3.6.17: Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass are not permitted in windows, except that special glass, for example, patterned, leaded or colored glass, can be used in transoms and sidelights when appropriate as established by the architectural style and the specific history of the building for which the

special glass is proposed.

- 3.6.18: A new window may have a low emissivity coating applied to clear glass provided that the visible light transmittance is not less than .74 and the overall reflectance is not more than 17%.

- c. Considerations: The Standards and Guidelines indicate that doors contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and convey the style and period of the building. Doors and entries should be preserved and not altered to fit stock sizes. New door openings are permitted only in the back 30% of the side of the building.

The criteria indicate that the proportion, shape, position, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and convey the architectural style and period of the building. New window openings may be allowed in the back 30% of the side elevation. When replacement is necessary, it should occur within the existing opening rather than alter the opening.

The criteria allow for new door and window openings in the rear 30% of the side walls of the dwelling. This is an alteration of an existing opening rather than creation of a new opening. The existing opening on the east is minimally visible from the street beyond the porte-cochere.

- d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That new openings for doors or windows are allowed in the rear 30% of the side elevation;
2. That basement door opening is located forward of the 50% mark on the side wall;
3. That alteration of existing openings to fit modern sized or windows is not supported by the criteria;
4. That the proposed location of opening alteration is minimally visible from the right of way beyond the porte-cochere;
5. That complete illustrations of the proposed window and opening are required;
6. That a wood window to match existing basement windows is proposed;
7. That infill will match surrounding historic fabric at siding and stem wall.

2. Item 5, Remove shutters (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes removal of the existing, non-historic shutters.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

Policy: Windows and shutters are important character-defining features of a building and originals should be retained and kept in good repair. Awnings may be an intended permanent character defining feature such as wood framed and finished with roof shingles to match the rest of the building or temporary such as contemporary fabric awnings with aluminum frames.

Design Justification: The proportion, shape, location, positioning, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the architectural style and period of the building. Their design, details and craftsmanship make them worthy of preservation. The presence or absence of shutters and awnings are significant to the visual character of a building.

Shutters

- 3.6.31: Historic shutters should be preserved and maintained.
 - 3.6.32: Shutters on historic building may have been functional and decorative in design. Operable shutters could be closed during summer days to reduce heat light and heat. New shutters may be functional, decorative, or both.
 - 3.6.33: Shutters are only permitted where they existed historically, and where they are appropriate to the style and character of the house. Inappropriate shutters are encouraged to be removed.
 - 3.6.34: Shutters must be half the width of the window and mounted to be or appear operational.
- c. Considerations: The applicant has indicated that the shutters are likely not original. However, no documentation has been provided to illustrate that shutters were not an original feature on the dwelling.

The Standards and Guidelines indicate that shutters are important character defining features and that originals should be retained and kept in good repair. Shutters are permitted where they existed historically, and where appropriate to the style and character of the house.

- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That shutters are character defining features;
 2. That the existing shutters may not be original;
 3. That shutters have been documented on the structure in the current locations for more than 50 years;
 4. That evidence of the historic condition prior to the previous 50 years has not been established;
 5. That the character of the dwelling has been influenced by shutters and appears to have significance.

E. HPCA-20-00185 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve Item 3, replace rear door and window with pair of French doors**, with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That new openings are allowed on the rear wall of the dwelling;
 2. That the existing orientation is not original to the structure as illustrated at an interior wall;
 3. That the proposed method of closing the wall with wood siding as the exterior veneer is compatible with the primary dwelling;
 4. That trimming the new opening with wood trim to match the existing windows and doors is consistent with the criteria and compatible with the dwelling;
 5. That the proposed wood doors are consistent with the criteria, compatible with the dwelling, and discernible as non-historic.
2. **Approve Item 4, replace basement door with basement window, with unique circumstances and conditions** with the specific findings that the proposed work, with the **agreed-upon conditions**, will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; that the following **unique circumstances** exist; that the items do not strictly comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines or are not addressed by them, but are nonetheless consistent with the spirit and intent of the Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

- 1) That new openings for doors or windows are allowed in the rear 30% of the side elevation;
- 2) That basement door opening is located forward of the 50% mark on the side wall;
- 3) That alteration of existing openings to fit modern sized or windows is not supported by the criteria;
- 4) That the proposed location of opening alteration is minimally visible from the right of way beyond the porte-cochere;
- 5) That complete illustrations of the proposed window and opening are required;
- 6) That a wood window to match existing basement windows is proposed;
- 7) That infill will match surrounding historic fabric at siding and stem wall.

Conditions:

- 1) That the complete documentation of the alteration of the opening and the proposed materials and dimensions be submitted to staff.

Unique Circumstance(s):

- 1) That the basement door is not functional;
- 2) That the basement door is below grade and minimally visible from the public right of way at the street;
- 3) That access to the door has been previously altered;
- 4) That maintenance of the opening is inhibited by previous alterations.

3. **Continue Item 5, remove shutters**, with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

- 1) That shutters are character defining features;
- 2) That the existing shutters may not be original;
- 3) That shutters have been documented on the structure in current locations for more than 50 years;
- 4) That evidence of the historic condition prior to the previous 50 years has not been established;
- 5) That the character of the dwelling has been influenced by shutters and appears to have significance.

Recommended Additional Documentation:

- 1) That evidence of the historic condition within the period of significance that illustrates no shutters present may support removal of this feature.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

ady