



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

February 22, 2021

HPCA-21-00002

Agenda Item: VI.D.14.

Case Number: HPCA-21-00002

Property Address: 2140 NW 26th Street

District: Shepherd Historic District

Applicant: Spartan Roofing and Construction
Randy Wilson
PO Box 1746
Edmond, OK 73083

Owner: Shannon Richie
2140 NW 26th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73107

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

4. Replace 3-tab roofing material with 3-tab roofing material (elective); and
5. Install a chimney barrel or cricket and metal W-valleys (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant proposes to replace the existing 3-tab roof with new 3-tab roofing material. A barrel or cricket is proposed at the front, west chimney to divert water around the chimney. W-valleys of painted or coated metal are proposed throughout the roof.

2. Location

Project site is located on the southeast corner of the intersection of Barnes and NW 26th Street.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1934

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1998

National Register Listing: 1997

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:

2141 Northwest 26th, C. 1935. This one-story, brick Tudor Revival house has a cross gabled composition roof and has two front facing gables with a hipped roof projection between them. The hipped roof covers the porch and entryway; it has an arched opening and a corbeled wing wall to the right. The left gable has an elongated arched attic vent and

basket-weave brick in an arch above the windows. The lower right gable has a compound slope and stone above its windows. Stone is also applied along the foundation. A split flue gable end chimney is on the left side of the house. There is a detached weatherboard garage in the rear.

Additional Information:

The 1950 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 1-story brick-veneered frame dwelling with 1-story, off center, projection on the front (north) façade. A 1-story side porch is illustrated on the east. A 1-story porch projects at the southeast (rear) corner. A 1-story frame “autohouse” with brick veneer is indicated in the southeast corner of the property line with the front face back more than $\frac{3}{4}$ of the property depth from the front property line. All structures have shingle roofs, typically wood. No noticeable changes are indicated on the 1955 edition.

4. Existing Conditions

The existing roof is one layer of 3-tab shingles. The historic form of the roof appears to remain intact with no alteration to the roof form at the visible locations. No exposed metal valleys are present, and appropriate flashing at the chimney appears to have been maintained.

5. Previous Actions

None relevant.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

Item 4) Replace 3-tab roofing material with 3-tab roofing material (elective); and **5)** Install a chimney barrel or cricket and metal W-valleys (elective).

1. Item 4, Replace 3-tab roofing material with 3-tab roofing material (elective); and Item 5, Install a chimney barrel or cricket and metal W-valleys (elective).

a. Description: The applicant proposes to replace the existing 3-tab roof with new 3-tab roofing material. A “barrel” or “cricket” is proposed at the front, west chimney to divert water around the chimney. “W-valleys” of painted or coated metal are proposed throughout the roof.

b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.1 Maintenance, Preservation and Rehabilitation of Exterior Building

Materials

Design Justification: The form, materials and details of exterior walls, roofs, door and window openings, and decorative details, as well as scale, texture and variety, contribute to a building's historic character. The texture, patterns and finishes of historic materials such as clay tile, slate, brick, stone, stucco and wood siding are important character-defining features; obscuring or removing these features diminishes the significance of historic buildings and structures.

- 3.1.5: If repairs or replacement affect more than one-half (50%) of an inappropriate component or material located on any individual building face or roof, then it is strongly encouraged that all of the inappropriate components or materials be replaced with appropriate materials. A Certificate of Appropriateness is required when all of the inappropriate materials are proposed for replacement. See "Administrative Review" below.
- 3.1.10: Oklahoma City's historic districts contain structures from a wide range of eras with varying degrees of historic significance and integrity. Changes to the exterior of any structure or site, regardless of its age, have the ability to contribute to, or to detract from, the overall character of the district and are subject to review. Changes to structures or additions built within the last 25 years or determined by the Commission to be non-historic shall be reviewed under the guidelines for New Construction.
- 3.1.12: If repairs or replacement affect more than two-thirds (66%) of an inappropriate component or material located on any individual building face, then all inappropriate components or materials shall be replaced with an appropriate component or material. Removal of more than 50% of an inappropriate material no longer meets the definition of ordinary maintenance and repair, and a Certificate of Appropriateness is required.
- 3.1.13: For example, on a building with vinyl siding, if over two-thirds (66%) of this siding is to be removed from the front building face and replaced due to deterioration or damage, then all of this inappropriate siding on that building face shall be replaced with an appropriate material such as wood siding or the historic material (which is likely to be historic wood siding) shall be uncovered and restored.
- 3.1.14: Remove an inappropriate component or material and restore the original or historic component or material that is revealed by such removal.
- 3.1.15: New material should match the historic in material type, dimensions, design, configuration, texture, surface coatings and visual appearance.
- 3.1.16: When a missing or severely deteriorated feature, element, or component is replaced, it shall be replaced in-kind, that is, matching the original in dimensions, detail, size, form, material and finish.
- 3.1.17: Incompatible non-historic alterations to a historic building are encouraged to be removed, and the building restored to its original appearance

during the period of significance.

- 3.1.19: If original or historic materials do not remain, the original form may be reconstructed or restored based on physical, photographic, or documentary evidence.
- 3.1.27: If replication of original elements is not possible because of a lack of historical physical, photographic or documentary evidence, then a new design that is compatible with the original form, style, and period of the building shall be used.
- 3.1.28: An appropriate option for a replacement feature is a new design that is compatible with the remaining character-defining features of the historic building.
- 3.1.29: The new design of a missing feature shall take into account the size, scale, and materials of the historic building; should be clearly differentiated to avoid a false historical appearance; and should maintain visual attention on the authentic and historic aspects of the building.
- 3.1.30: New compatible designs for missing features should be reversible so that they can be replaced with a more appropriate design in the event that better and more accurate historical evidence becomes available.

3.7 Roofs

Policy: Retain original roof shape, details, and materials when possible. When replacing roofing materials, consider the energy used in their manufacture and transportation, the reflectivity of the material and whether the material derives from a renewable or recyclable resource.

Design Justification: By their shape, features, materials and details, roofs contribute significantly to the historic character of residential and multi-family buildings. Historic roof materials are usually related to the architectural age and style of the main building. Through variations in line, pitch and overhang, a historic roof can also reveal changes and additions to historic buildings over time. Chimneys, dormers and other roof features add to the diversity and character of historic buildings.

Sustainability Justification: Many aspects of sustainability should be considered when choosing a roof material, such as initial cost, lifetime cost, longevity or service life, reflectivity, energy savings, environmental impact of replacement, cost of manufacture and transportation, recycled content, ventilation, and thermal emittance of materials. Local weather extremes have resulted in the loss of most original roofing materials. Replacement materials should be appropriate to the style of the building and as long lasting as possible. Asphalt shingles are the most common choice for roofing across the country because of low initial cost.; however, they are petroleum based, not durable, require frequent replacement, and because they are not recyclable, they contribute significantly to landfill volume. As communities explore the potential of recycling asphalt shingles land fill impact may change.

Concrete and clay tiles require the most energy to manufacture. The weight of these products and natural slate, results in higher transportation costs. However, all three materials have very long life cycles, reducing their overall environmental impact. Fiber-cement composites include some amount of wood scrap or waste materials, reducing the amount of cement and concrete used. They are lighter weight than concrete tiles, reducing transportation energy requirements.

- 3.7.1: Preventative maintenance is the key to prevent roof damage. Inspect roofs regularly for normal wear and damage from storms or wind. Inspect flashing at roofing, gutters, and chimneys yearly. Repair leaks promptly in roofs to prevent wall and interior damage. Clean and repair gutters and downspouts to prevent water damage to fascia, soffits and walls.
- 3.7.2: Maintain roof and roof elements, thereby preserving the historic building.
- 3.7.3: Preserve the original shape, line, pitch and overhang of historic roofs, as well as architectural features such as dormers, chimneys and turrets.
- 3.7.4: Retain, preserve and keep in good repair distinctive features such as open eaves with exposed rafters and angled, decorative or plain rafter tails, flared eaves or decorative purlins, ridge cresting and brackets. Preserve flat roofs and parapets.
- 3.7.5: Integral gutters (those built-in to the edge of the roof, usually metal lined wood) should be maintained. Doing so will alleviate the need for new hanging gutters that may obscure roof edge details.
- 3.7.6: Flat roofs with parapets shall be preserved. Flat roofs not visible from the public right-of-way or concealed by parapets, may be replaced with membrane materials recommended for such applications.
- 3.7.7: Repairs to flashing must be copper or other metal with a finish to match the roof color. Unfinished, galvanized metal flashing shall not be used.
- 3.7.8: Retain eave features such as exposed rafters and brackets.
- 3.7.9: Replacement of non-historic composition roofing material with architectural grade composition shingles, regardless of color or pattern, is not subject to review and does not require a Certificate of Appropriateness (for repair, replacement, or installation of historic roofing materials, see Administrative Review).
- 3.7.10: Replacement in kind of existing, non-historic roof features such as gutters, downspouts, and turbines that meet the Guidelines for materials and location is not subject to review and does not require a Certificate of Appropriateness (for repair, replacement or installation of historic roof features, see Administrative Review).
- 3.7.11: Historic roof materials shall be retained and preserved. If historic materials are deteriorated beyond repair, then replacement materials shall

match the historic materials in all visual and compositional aspects except that architectural grade composition shingles may be used to replace wood shakes or wood shingles.

- 3.7.12: Decorative cut wood shingles shall only be installed in areas of the roof or exterior walls when consistent with physical or photographic evidence of having been used at the proposed locations on the building.
- 3.7.13: For ventilation of attic heat, roof vents should be located out of view on back sloping roofs. Vents are encouraged to help improve the energy efficiency of the building and may be more appropriately accommodated using compatible attic wall louvered vents. If the building roof does not have a back sloping roof and attic walls for ventilation louvers are not available, then side roof ventilation may be considered on the least visible side locations from the public right-of-way. Low-profile ridge vents may be used.
- 3.7.14: New roof features such as roof ventilators, antennas, satellite dishes and skylights may be installed, but must be located on back slopes and not visible from the public right-of-way. Solar panels and solar shingles may also be installed on back roof slopes as long as they are not visible from the public right-of-way.
- 3.7.15: Metal roofs were not widely used in Oklahoma City historic districts and their installation is not appropriate unless it can be historically documented at a given building. New metal roofs shall match the details of the historic metal roof they replace.
- 3.7.16: When large-scale replacement of roof materials other than asphalt shingles is required, historic fabric (such as slate, tile, metal shingles) that retains its integrity must be salvaged, and installed on prominent areas of the roof that are visible from the public right-of-way. Use of new, appropriate materials should be used on roof areas that are unobtrusive, and are less visible from the public right-of-way, for example back elevation locations.
- 3.7.17: New dormers, if needed to make attic space usable, must be located only on non-primary facades. It is not appropriate to locate new features on front or street-facing elevations such as on corner lots.

Wood shingles

- 3.7.18: Faux wood shingles (for example composition shingles) of a weathered wood color may be used to replace real wood shingles, if consistent with the original wood shingles in texture, dimensions, design, pattern and color and relative light reflectance. Modern wood shake roofing products do not match historic wood shingles and therefore are not permitted as replacements for wood shingles.
- 3.7.19: Replacing historic wood shingles with #1 cedar shingles is appropriate. When used, the surface texture should be smooth, sawn-cut rather than the linear texture resulting from the hand-split process typical of

shakes.

- 3.7.20: Shingles should be laid in a horizontal row with the bottom edge either in alignment with the adjacent shingle or staggered to match the historic condition. Decorative cut wood shingles may be installed only in areas of the roof or walls where documentation indicates their historic presence.

Gutters, Downspouts and Flashings

- 3.7.21: Flashing shall be copper or other metal finished to match the roof color. Unfinished galvanized metal flashing shall not be used.
 - 3.7.22: Gutters and downspouts may be installed and shall be unfinished copper or painted or powder finished metal unless physical or photographic evidence demonstrates historical use of alternative materials or finish for the specific building.
 - 3.7.23: Exposed galvanized metal or non-painted gutters and downspouts are not permitted.
 - 3.7.24: New gutters shall be painted or powder finished to match the fascia color of the building unless copper is used. New downspouts shall be painted or powder finished to match the building or the building trim unless copper is used.
 - 3.7.25: Copper gutters and down spouts may be installed when appropriate for the style of the building. Historical gutter shapes shall only be used when consistent with historical physical or photographic evidence of their use at the specific building.
 - 3.7.26: The original shape, line, pitch and overhang of historic roofs are significant to the overall character of the building and must be retained.
- c. Considerations: The Standards and Guidelines indicate that original texture, patterns, and finishes of historic materials are important character defining features. Historically, the roof was wood, which is considered a high definition, character defining feature. More modern materials now provide for a high definition shingle in a composition material that is durable and has a profile more consistent with the texture and pattern of historic wood roofs.

Three tab shingles were common replacements for wood roofs just as vinyl siding was a common replacement for wood siding previously. The criteria indicate that when more than 2/3 of an inappropriate material is proposed for replacement, the entire component should be removed, and appropriate materials should be installed. Returning to the historic condition is most appropriate or, when missing, a new design that is compatible with the original in form and style is appropriate. The criteria for roofs allows for replacement of wood roofs with a high definition, architectural grade shingle.

The Standards and Guidelines indicate that historic roof forms and features must be maintained. The criteria direct us to preserve the original shape, line, pitch and overall character of historic roofs and architectural features such as dormers, chimneys and

turrets.

The Guidelines allow administrative approval of the installation of “architectural grade” shingles when approximating a wood shingle roof. The Guidelines allow for installation of architectural grade shingles when replacing a non-historic roof, such as a 3-tab shingle, under the category of Ordinary Maintenance and Repair in most cases. The Guidelines neither support nor expressly prohibit 3-tab shingles; therefore, Commission review is required. An architectural grade shingle appears appropriate based on Sanborn maps which illustrate a wood shingle roof. An architectural grade shingle has a higher profile and more dimension than a 3-tab shingle provides.

No evidence of a previously existing roof that included W-valleys has been established. The applicant has indicated that such valleys are provided in limited colors and do not match the proposed shingle color. The proposed would be darker than the shingle but of a similar shade. The applicant has indicated that painting of these features typically does not hold up well. The criteria indicate that all exposed metal should be painted or coated to match the roof. However, the introduction of exposed, decorative valleys may have greater visual impact than typical metal valleys.

The installation of a barrel or chimney cricket alters the historic roof form and is visible from the street at the front. As the roof is very steep, the height of the barrel may be a visible change to the roof form. Appropriate flashing of the chimney should be an equally effective deterrent to water infiltration and appears to have been adequate since construction. The Standards and Guidelines indicate that historic roof forms should be maintained.

W-valleys and chimney crickets are becoming common features in modern roofing practice and can be seen in a variety of location. However, staff found no record of approved similar features at this or other properties in the historic districts.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the historic roof was wood shingles;
2. That the existing 3-tab shingles do not provide the texture and profile that is inherent to a wood shingle roof;
3. That an architectural shingle more accurately emulates the high definition texture and finish of a wood roof;
4. That the 3-tab shingles were installed within the past 25 years;
5. That the criteria support an architectural grade roof during replacement;
6. That an architectural grade shingle has a higher definition that may more accurately emulate a wood shingle;
7. That exposed metals must be painted or coated to match the roof;
8. That W-valleys are a decorative feature that alters the character of a roof;
9. That the original shape, line, and pitch of historic roofs are significant to the overall character of the building and must be maintained;

10. That the installation of a chimney barrel or cricket alters the line and pitch of the roof at the front façade.

E. HPCA-21-00002 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Deny Items 4) Replace 3-tab roofing material with 3-tab roofing material; and 5) Install a chimney barrel or cricket and metal W-valleys, with Prejudice** with the specific finding that the proposed work will have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; is not consistent with the provisions of the Standards and Guidelines and is not in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the specific findings in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

- 1) That the historic roof was wood shingles;
- 2) That the existing 3-tab shingles do not provide the texture and profile that is inherent to a wood shingle roof;
- 3) That an architectural shingle more accurately emulates the high definition texture and finish of a wood roof;
- 4) That the 3-tab shingles were installed within the past 25 years;
- 5) That the criteria support an architectural grade roof during replacement;
- 6) That an architectural grade shingle has a higher definition that may more accurately emulate a wood shingle;
- 7) That exposed metals must be painted or coated to match the roof;
- 8) That W-valleys are a decorative feature that alters the character of a roof;
- 9) That the original shape, line, and pitch of historic roofs are significant to the overall character of the building and must be maintained;
- 10) That the installation of a chimney barrel or cricket alters the line and pitch of the roof at the front façade.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

ady