



# STAFF REPORT

## Historic Preservation Commission

February 22, 2021

HPCA-21-00008

---

**Agenda Item:** VI.D.17.

**Case Number:** HPCA-21-00008

**Property Address:** 311 NW 18th Street

**District:** Heritage Hills Historic District

**Owner:** Richard Parma  
311 NW 18th Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73103

### A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Widen pedestrian door opening at accessory structure (elective); and
2. Replace existing pedestrian doors of the accessory structure (elective).

### B. BACKGROUND

#### 1. Project Description

The applicant proposes to alter the pedestrian door opening of the historic dwelling attached to the garage and install three door panels rather than two.

#### 2. Location

Project site is located on the north side of NW 18<sup>th</sup> Street between N Harvey Avenue and Hudson.

#### 3. Site History

*Date of Construction:* 1921

*Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark:* HH 1969

*National Register Listing:* HH 1979

#### *Additional Information:*

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 2-story, fire-retardant dwelling with hollow tile and brick veneer. The roof is fire retardant, often tile, including that of the front porch that spans the full width of the front, south wall. There is a 2-story attachment at the southeast corner, open at 1<sup>st</sup> floor, and 1-story attachment at the rear, north wall. The garage includes a small dwelling on the east end with a separate address. The garage and attached dwelling are approximately the same width as the dwelling, though only half the length. The garage and attached dwelling are of material to match that of the house including brick veneer and fire-retardant roof.

#### 4. Existing Conditions

The pedestrian doors of the garage are a pair of modern patio doors. It is presumed that neither the opening nor the doors are historic, but likely contained a typical pedestrian door historically.

## 5. Previous Actions

None relevant to the garage.

## C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.\**

None.

## D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

*This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020\* as referenced below:*

None.

### 1. Item 1, Widen pedestrian door opening at accessory structure (elective); and 2, Replace existing pedestrian doors of the accessory structure (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes to remove a pair of pedestrian doors and increase the opening from 73 inches wide to 108 inches wide, providing a new opening sufficient for 3 doors. The brick opening will be finished to match existing. The proposed doors are Prairie Style in divisions to match a pair of French doors installed in place of a single opening on the house in 1993.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

### 3.5 Doors and Entries

**Policy:** Doors and entrances are important aspects of the architectural character of a building. Historic doors and entries should be retained and preserved.

**Design Justification:** The proportion, shape, location, pattern and size of doors contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the style and period of the building.

**Sustainability Justification:** Preserving original or historic doors is part of the overall sustainability of the building and they should be made air-tight with proper weather-stripping. Storm doors help to enhance energy conservation. Blower-door tests, performed as part of an energy audit, can document air leaks that should be sealed.

- 3.5.4: The design of replacement doors shall be based on historic documentation, if available, and shall reflect the style and period of the building. Replacement doors shall be compatible with historic doors in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials, and details.

- 3.5.5: Preserve existing historic door openings, do not enlarge or diminish to fit stock door sizes.
- 3.5.7: New door openings at back elevations are permitted and shall minimize damage to the original design of the building and character-defining features.
- 3.5.9: New door openings on side elevations may be permitted only in the back 30% of the length of the side elevation and are not permitted on the street-facing side elevation of corner properties.
- 3.5.11: Alternative materials for doors and door frames such as composite wood and aluminum clad wood, may be considered for side and back door locations except for the Heritage Hills Historic and Architectural District for which only wood doors are permitted.

### 3.9 Accessory Buildings Including Garages

**Policy:** Accessory buildings in historic districts may include a wide variety of building types, such as secondary dwellings, carriage houses, garages, and sheds. Accessory buildings original to a property or added prior to the past forty years may have gained historic significance and should be preserved and maintained.

**Design Justification:** The primary materials used at historic garages structures were most often wood siding (either horizontal or vertical) or brick that matched the main house, with metal or wood shingle roofs. Some structures were higher style and matched stonework of the primary building. Accessory structures may have had gabled, hip, low sloping shed roofs or other roof styles. Traditionally, accessory buildings, especially garages, were important elements of a property and were often designed to be simpler, match and compliment the associated buildings.

- 3.9.8: Windows at accessory buildings, including those in pedestrian and vehicle doors, shall meet the requirements and recommendations of the section of this chapter for “Windows, Shutters, and Awnings.”
- 3.9.9: If it is necessary to replace the existing doors or other deteriorated or missing elements or details at a garage or other accessory structure, replace with a design based on accurate historical documentation. A new design that is compatible in style, form, scale, size, placement and finish with the primary structure or other historic garages and accessory buildings in the district may be used when no physical or photographic documentation exists otherwise.
- 3.9.11: In Heritage Hills Architectural and Historic District only solid wood garage pedestrian doors with wood frames that match historical designs used in the district or compatible paneled designs are permitted.

### 3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

- 3.6.6: New window openings may be allowed on the back facade or the back 30% of the side elevations. New windows must be compatible with historic or existing windows in proportion, shape, location, pattern, size, materials and details.

- 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
  - 3.6.12: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glazing) windows are acceptable as replacement windows when the historic windows in a building have been previously removed. When used, thermal pane windows must have true divided lites.
  - 3.6.15: Muntins sandwiched between layers of glass, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins are not appropriate and shall not be used.
  - 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.
  - 3.6.17: Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass are not permitted in windows, except that special glass, for example, patterned, leaded or colored glass, can be used in transoms and sidelights when appropriate as established by the architectural style and the specific history of the building for which the special glass is proposed.
  - 3.6.18: A new window may have a low emissivity coating applied to clear glass provided that the visible light transmittance is not less than .74 and the overall reflectance is not more than 17%.
- c. Considerations: The Standards for Accessory Buildings Including Garages refers us to the subchapter for Windows, Shutters and Awnings for additional assistance where necessary but indicates that doors in Heritage Hills must be solid wood and should be based on historical documentation. As the historic door is no longer extant, a door consistent with the style, form, scale, size, placement and finish with the primary structure or other historic garages may be appropriate.

The Standards and Guidelines indicate that all glass must be clear and thermal pane is allowed contingent upon true divided lite. New door and window openings are permitted in the rear 30% of the side wall of a building. Though not visible from the public right of way, increasing the number of openings on this historic structure does further disrupt historic fabric and wall to window ratios.

The proposal includes clad, thermal pane doors with simulated divided lite. The cladding is not described. Vinyl and vinyl clad are prohibited.

- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That increasing the width of the opening disrupts existing historic fabric and further disrupts historic wall to window ratios;
  2. That replacement of doors within the existing opening will have no further adverse effect on the accessory structure;
  3. That doors in Heritage Hills must be wood and only clear glass is allowed in windows in doors;
  4. That thermal glazing may be appropriate contingent upon appropriate true divided lites;

5. That solid wood, true divided lite is not the proposed material for the new opening;
6. That the proposed door expansion is not visible from the street.

**E. HPCA-21-00008 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

1. **Approve Item 1, to widen pedestrian door opening, and 2, replace pedestrian doors, with the following conditions,** with the specific findings that the proposed work, with the **agreed-upon conditions**, will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; the items comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020\*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

**Specific Findings:**

- 1) That increasing the width of the opening disrupts existing historic fabric and further disrupts historic wall to window ratios;
- 2) That replacement of doors within the existing opening will have no further adverse effect on the accessory structure;
- 3) That doors in Heritage Hills must be wood and only clear glass is allowed in windows in doors;
- 4) That thermal glazing may be appropriate contingent upon appropriate true divided lites;
- 5) That solid wood, true divided lite is not the proposed material for the new opening;
- 6) That the proposed door expansion is not visible from the street.

**Conditions:**

- 1) That the proposed doors be solid wood doors with true divided lite and clear glass;
- 2) That documentation that doors meet all conditions of the approval be provided to staff prior to release of the CA.

*Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.*

*\*Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

*Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Municipal Code, 2020 are available online at [www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html](http://www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html) ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9<sup>th</sup> floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.*

*ady*