



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

March 5, 2025

HPCA-25-00005

Case Number: **HPCA-25-00005**

Property Address: **131 NW 16th Street**

District: **Heritage Hills East Historic District**

Applicant: Keller Williams Elite Realty
Joey Keck
5629 N Classen Boulevard
Oklahoma City, OK 73118

Owner: Isaac Cornell
2528 NW 26th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73107

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Replace sash kits (required).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Location

Project site is located on the north side of NW 16th Street, mid-block between N Robinson Avenue and N Broadway Avenue.

2. Site History

Date of Construction: 1920

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1999

National Register Listing: 2020

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:

131-133 Northwest 16th Street. Circa 1920. Pueblo Revival. This contributing, one-story duplex is stucco. The building has a flat, membrane roof with a parapet and a narrow, flat overhang, with exposed rafters around the entire structure. The overhang projects at the south (front) to create a full-width front porch. The front porch is supported by three massive stucco piers, on a concrete porch. The south (front) elevation includes two paneled entry doors, one to either side of the center pier of the front porch, with pairs of vertical four-over-one, double hung windows at each outer corner. The east and west elevations have single, multi-light-over-one, hung windows. There is no accessory structure.

Additional Information:

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 1-story, stucco, frame duplex with 1-story front porch extending the entire width of the front (south) façade and a 1-story rear (north) façade, centrally located porch spanning one-third of the building facade. A 1-story, stucco, frame “autohouse” with four bays across the eastern property line is approximately two-thirds of the way back from the front property line. The structures are indicated with composition roofing, which is consistent with the flat roof of the duplex. No changes are illustrated on subsequent editions of the maps.

1. Existing Conditions

The structure appears to be in fair condition. The proposed window sashes have been installed, and photographs of each window were submitted as documentation.

2. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-23-00121	02/07/2024	Isaac Cornell	Denied w/ prejudice
Replace all windows.			
HPCA-16-00193	01/04/2017	Todd Riddle	Approved
Replace roof, soffit, and roof decking.			

Other actions, such as variances, other approvals, citations could also be described here.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

1. Item 1, Replace sash kits (required).

- Description:** The applicant is proposing to replace window sashes in all existing windows except one window in the laundry room. The applicant states that the sash kits are wood, and are the same dimensions of the previously installed sashes.
- References:** *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

- 3.6.1: Regular maintenance and weather-stripping of historic windows ensures their preservation and improves the energy efficiency of a building.
- 3.6.2: Retain and preserve original or historic windows. Preserve and maintain historic window framing and number and configuration of glass panes.
- 3.6.3: Make repairs to an existing window rather than replacing the entire

window unit, including replacement in kind of parts that are deteriorated beyond repair. Ordinary maintenance and repair is limited to less than 50% replacement of the window's components and parts including frames and sashes.

- 3.6.5: Original or historic windows more than 50% DETERIORATED BEYOND REPAIR may be replaced in kind.
- 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
- 3.6.9: If original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile.
- 3.6.13: A thermal pane window may be appropriate for replacement of a historic wood or metal window when the existing window frame and sash parts are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair. To replace a historic window with a new unit a window survey including a photograph of the interior and exterior of the unit must be provided to substantiate the condition of the window. Historic windows visible from the public-right-of-way must be retained and repaired or replaced in kind, including replication of muntins pattern and profile.
- 3.6.15: Muntins sandwiched between layers of glass, snap-on muntins, and surface-applied muntins are not appropriate and shall not be used.
- 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.

c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the Standards and Guidelines recommend that repairs be made to existing windows rather than replacing the entire window unit, including replacement in kind of parts that are deteriorated beyond repair;
2. That ordinary maintenance and repair is limited to less than 50% replacement of the window's components and parts including frames and sashes;
3. That recent photographic documentation of the historic windows was not submitted prior to the window sashes being replaced, but that the photographic documentation submitted in 2023 illustrates that many, if not all, of the window sashes appeared to be more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair;
4. That when original or historic windows are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair, they may be replaced in kind; and
5. That the window sashes illustrated in the photographs appear to be a replacement in kind.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced*

below:

None

E. HPCA-25-00005 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve Item 1, Replace sash kits (required)** with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the Standards and Guidelines recommend that repairs be made to existing windows rather than replacing the entire window unit, including replacement in kind of parts that are deteriorated beyond repair;
2. That ordinary maintenance and repair is limited to less than 50% replacement of the window's components and parts, including frames and sashes;
3. That recent photographic documentation of the historic windows was not submitted prior to the window sashes being replaced, but that the photographic documentation submitted in 2023 illustrates that many, if not all, of the window sashes appeared to be more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair;
4. That when original or historic windows are more than 50% deteriorated beyond repair, they may be replaced in kind; and
5. That the window sashes illustrated in the photographs appear to be a replacement in kind.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of Chapter 59 the Oklahoma City Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

RJ