



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

June 5, 2024

HPCA-23-00117

Case Number: HPCA-23-00117

Property Address: 700 NW 40th Street

District: Crown Heights Historic District

Applicant: HJH Design
Hollie Hunt
5913 NW 82nd Circle
Oklahoma City, OK 73132

Owner: Corinne Greenfield
700 NW 40th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73118

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

2. Revise Item 1) Construct addition (elective) to relocate the west window south (required).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant was approved to construct a second-floor rear addition including a window on the west. A revision to the west window location was administratively approved to move the window south by 18 inches. The decision to approve relocation of the window was appealed to the Board of Adjustment (BOA) by the neighboring property owner of 704 NW 40th Street. The BOA has remanded the case to the approving body for reconsideration.

2. Location

Project site is located on the south side of NW 40th Street, between Shartel Avenue and North Walker Avenue.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1934

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1977

National Register Listing: 1995

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:

700 Northwest 40th, C. 1937. This two-story, brick and weatherboard (second story) Colonial Revival residence has a moderately pitched, side-gabled roof with composition shingles. A single-story addition on the east end has a flat roof with a balustrade. The symmetrical façade features double-hung 10/10 windows and a paneled wood door with

glazing. A flared metal awning with decorative wrought-iron supports shelters the entrance. There is a brick chimney with a chimney pot on the east elevation and the garage is detached.

Additional Information:

The 1950 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 2-story frame dwelling with brick veneer on the first floor and 1-story enclosed projection along the east elevation. A 1-story frame “autohouse” is indicated along the west property line with the front face back nearly 2/3 of the property depth from the front property line. The primary portion of the dwelling is indicated with a wood shingle roof, while the east projection is indicated with composition. The garage is indicated with shingle as well. The 1950 edition of the maps indicates all roofs as composition material. No other changes to the site are indicated.

1. Existing Conditions

The subject dwelling had an existing one-story structure attached to the rear of the two-story dwelling in good condition, though inconsistent with the historic character of the dwelling. The approved second story addition has been constructed, introducing fenestration that is more compatible with the historic character of the dwelling. The west window in question has been constructed south of the originally approved location but remains consistent with the overall intent of the previous approval.

2. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-23-00117	10/04/2023	Corinne Greenfield	Approved
1) Construct a second story addition at the rear (elective).			
HPCA-23-00117	03/04/2024	Corinne Greenfield	Approved
2) Revise Item to construct a second story addition to include the relocation of the west windows south (required).			
HPCA-15-00094	09/02/2015	Laci Ravina	Approved
1) Replace roof of entry in kind (elective); 2) Remove metal and underlying deteriorated wood siding and replace with matching wood siding (elective); 3) Remove metal fascia and soffit covers at entry and reconstruct wood fascia and soffit (elective); 4) Replace columns of front entry (elective); and 5) Install light fixtures (elective).			

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 2, Relocate the west window of the approved rear addition (required).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes the relocation of the previously approved west side window in the approved second story addition. The proposed location of the west window is 20 inches south of the previously approved location to accommodate the existing chimney.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

4.3 Building Additions

Policy: Additions should complement and not detract from the overall historic character of the historic district.

Design Justification: The way in which a historic building and an addition to it relate is important in protecting the integrity of the historic property and district. An addition directly affects the integrity of the building as a whole. Building additions should not detract from the historic character of the historic building or district.

- 4.3.1: Additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes, and should be appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building. The incorporation of existing architectural features with new design elements can contribute added interest and compatibility.
- 4.3.5: Additions to historic or non-historic buildings should relate to and complement the style of the main building and may relate to the general style of the streetscape.
- 4.3.11: Use of different but compatible materials or different (simplified) detailing is also appropriate to differentiate a new addition from the historic building.
- 4.3.12: The design of a new addition must consider and respect the massing, roof shape, bay spacing, cornice lines and materials of the building to which it is being added.

4.6 Exterior Materials at New Construction

Policy: Materials used in the construction of new buildings, additions, garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible in appearance and design with common building materials in the district, or typical of structures of the proposed style, type, age and location.

Design Justification: The form, materials and details of exterior walls and embellishments, as well as their scale, texture and variety, contribute to the overall character of the historic district.

Windows

- 4.6.10: Windows in additions to existing buildings must match or complement the proportion, shape, pattern, size, details and profile of the windows in the historic building. If the historic or existing windows are wood, the windows of the addition may be wood, vinyl-clad wood or aluminum-clad wood. If the historic windows or existing are steel, the windows of the addition should be steel or other compatible metal. All windows in new additions should be of a profile similar to the windows in the historic building.
 - 4.6.12: New windows may have a simpler window pane pattern than their historic counterparts; for example, if the historic windows are 6/1 (read “six over one”), then 1/1 windows of the same overall size may be used.
 - 4.6.14: Clear glass must be used in all windows. Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass in windows is generally not appropriate. Patterned, leaded or colored glass can be used in transoms and sidelights when established by the architectural style of the building or when supported by historical documentation for a specific property or structure.
- **Fenestration** means the proportion and size of window and door openings and the rhythm, order and arrangement on a building facade.
- c. Considerations: Additions at dwellings are generally permitted when consistent with applicable Guidelines and regulations and must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes, and should be appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building. In instances where two-story dwellings are present, two-story additions are typically permitted, but must provide design compatibility with the historic structure.

Fenestration, massing, scale, proportion, and wall to window ratios are character defining components of various styles of architecture and of this Colonial Revival style dwelling. Previous additions to the existing historic structure did not complement the historic character of the dwelling, and the introduction of windows at yet another addition to the structure provided compatibility of style not previously illustrated at the rear. The combined additions to this structure at 688 square feet do not fully take advantage of the size allowance for additions provided in the Guidelines and Standards.

The proposed revision to relocate the west window south by 18-20 inches appears to have no adverse effect on the compatibility of the previously approved addition. Massing, proportions, and spacing of windows appear to remain compatible with the historic structure.

The proposed relocation of the west window was administratively approved by staff March 4, 2024. The approval was appealed to the Board of Adjustment (BOA) by the neighboring property owner, citing privacy concerns. On May 2, 2024, the BOA

remanded the item to the approving body for reconsideration. Alternative glass options, such as frosted glass, were discussed, as was an alternative window size and shape.

At the BOA hearing, alternatives to the revision, and to the window as previously approved, were discussed, including removing or closing off the window from the interior, modification to the size of the window, and the installation of frosted or otherwise non-transparent glass.

The proposed window location, shape, size, pattern, and glass is consistent and compatible with the historic character of the dwelling and contributes to the compatibility of the addition with the primary, historic dwelling, although a window of an alternative size or location would like also have been deemed compatible as part of the original approval. Closing windows off from the interior technically does not require a Certificate of Appropriateness as it is an interior modification but is not recommended due to increased maintenance issues with windows that have been blocked in such a manner. Frosted or other non-transparent glass is generally not supported by the Guidelines: 4.6.14 states that clear glass must be used, and alternative glass is “generally not appropriate.”

The applicant of the previously approved application for 700 NW 40th Street is supportive of blinds or curtains at this bathroom in order to provide privacy for the neighbors as well as the residents of the subject property. The neighboring property owner to the west maintains opposition to the proposed window location.

Staff has provided a recommendation of approval consistent with the previous administrative approval. Alternatively, the Commission may consider unique circumstances and conditions to address concerns regarding privacy based upon the window’s location.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That alternative glass is generally not supported by the Guidelines;
2. That the proposed window is not visible from the public rights of way;
3. That the proposed fenestration is compatible and contributes to the compatibility of the addition to the historic character.

E. HPCA-23-00117 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve Revision to Item 1 via Item 2, to relocate the west window**, with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That alternative glass is generally not supported by the Guidelines;
2. That the proposed window is not visible from the public rights of way;
3. That the proposed fenestration is compatible and contributes to the compatibility of

the addition to the historic character.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of Chapter 59 the Oklahoma City Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

ADY