



# STAFF REPORT

## Historic Preservation Commission

December 4, 2024

HPCA-24-00083

---

**Case Number:** HPCA-24-00083

**Property Address:** 1021 NW 37th Street

**District:** Crown Heights Historic District

**Applicant:** Crown Heights United Methodist Church  
Trina Bose North  
1021 NW 37th Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73118

**Owner:** Crown Heights United Methodist Church  
1021 NW 37th Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73118

### A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

2. Install light fixture at east windows of sanctuary (required).

### B. BACKGROUND

#### 1. Project Description

The case was continued on September 4, 2024 at the request of the applicant. The case was heard on October 2, 2024 and the Commission continued the item until December 4, 2024 to give the applicant more time to develop a new lighting plan proposal. As of the writing of this staff report, the applicant has not submitted any new plans.

#### 2. Location

Project site is located on the north side of NW 37<sup>th</sup> Street, on the northeast corner of NW 37<sup>th</sup> Street and North Western Avenue.

#### 3. Site History

*Date of Construction:* 1941

*Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark:* 1977

*National Register Listing:* 1995

*Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:*

3810 North Western Avenue. 1936, 1940, and later additions. Crown Heights Methodist Church. This red brick Late Gothic Revival building has two parallel front gables with red clay tiles connected by a flat roof. An arcaded walkway with cast stone gothic arches runs between the two gabled portions of the building. Behind the walkway is the façade of the original 1936 building. The south gabled section is the 1940 sanctuary; the north gabled section was added in 1950. There are cast stone gothic arches over the thin triplet windows

and over the doors. A large stained-glass window is accented by cast stone as well. The rear additions (1964, 1964) also include an arcaded walkway and a gabled roof.

#### 4. Existing Conditions

The property appears to be in good condition and well maintained. The proposed light fixture has already been installed but must be reviewed as if it had not.

#### 5. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-21-00050	04/20/2021	Crown Heights Methodist Church	Approved
1) Replace tile roof of carriage house with composition shingles (elective).			

### C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.\**

None.

### D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

*This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020\* as referenced below:*

#### 1. Item 2, Install light fixture at east windows of sanctuary (required).

- a. Description: The applicant is proposing to install an exterior lighting system on the same side of the building as the HVAC units. Although not a front facing elevation, the location is visible from the public right-of-way, along NW 37<sup>th</sup> Street. The proposed lighting fixture is constructed with an aluminum framing system, utilizing LED lights. It is 10 feet tall x 9.5 feet wide x 3 feet deep, and attached to the brick directly over the stained-glass windows on the upper level of the sanctuary. The aluminum framing supports three sets of two fixtures, one set per window.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

#### 3.11 Lighting

**Policy:** Retain original or historic light fixtures whenever possible. If replacement is required, select appropriate styles, based on the architectural style of the building.

**Design Justification:** Original and historic light fixtures help convey a building's style and add to overall historic character.

**Sustainability Justification:** Preserving existing light fixtures preserves

resources and will not require the use of new materials. Using long-lasting bulbs will make historic fixtures more energy efficient.

- 3.11.1: Incandescent light bulbs have been the traditional means of lighting throughout the twentieth century. They are inexpensively manufactured, a savings passed on to the consumer. However, as new lighting options have become available, the incandescent bulb now represents the most energy-inefficient choice. By comparison, compact florescent lamps (CFL), while more expensive to manufacture, operate using far less energy, saving money over time. LED light bulbs are another choice for increased energy efficiency. Compared to CFLs, LEDs can be turned on and off frequently without effecting life span and also contain no mercury. There are a handful of states that currently prohibit the disposal of florescent bulbs with universal waste sent to landfills. Broken florescent bulbs are health hazards due to the release of mercury. Further, some studies have shown that CFLs begin to fade noticeably by half their rated lifetime. While LED bulbs are still far more costly than CFLs, they are considered the most promising lighting option in the future for reliability, efficiency, and longevity. In the meantime, CFLs appear to be the transitional lighting option.
  - 3.11.2: The design and materials of lighting fixtures on buildings must be compatible with the historic character of the area and match the style and period of the building.
  - 3.11.8: Replace missing or severely damaged historic light fixtures with fixtures that replicate the original or other appropriate fixtures that closely match the appearance and materials of the original.
  - 3.11.9: If a compatible replacement fixture cannot be located, then a modern design with modest detailing that is compatible with the architecture of the building may be used.
  - 3.11.10: If new light fixtures are needed where they previously did not exist, the new fixtures should be unobtrusive, conceal the light source and direct light toward the building.
- c. Considerations: The previous lighting fixture that was removed before the proposed lighting fixture was installed did not appear to be historic to the building. The Standards and Guidelines state that the design and materials of light fixtures on buildings must be compatible with the historic character of the area, and match the style and period of the building. The style of building is described as Late Gothic Revival, which includes elements such as the gothic arches over the thin triplet windows and the use of stained-glass windows. The proposed light fixture appears to be industrial in appearance and, although not located on the front façade, it is visible from the street. A modest and compatible fixture may be appropriate if light is to be directed toward the stained-glass windows for an aesthetic affect. Consideration of alternative lighting could include ground lighting, which would illuminate the stained-glass from below. As an alternative, the applicant has stated that they would be willing to repaint the proposed lighting fixture to a color that would provide more of a camouflaging effect.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the previous lighting fixture that existed prior to the installation of the proposed lighting fixture, did not appear to be historic;
2. That, if new light fixtures are needed, the new fixtures should be unobtrusive, conceal the light source, and direct light toward the building; and
3. That the design and materials of lighting fixtures on buildings should be compatible with the historic character of the area and match the style and period of the building.

**E. HPCA-24-00083 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

1. **Continue Item 2) Install light fixture at east windows of sanctuary (required);** with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020\*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

**Specific Findings:**

1. That the previous lighting fixture that existed prior to the installation of the proposed lighting fixture, did not appear to be historic;
2. That, if new light fixtures are needed, the new fixtures should be unobtrusive, conceal the light source, and direct light toward the building; and
3. That the design and materials of lighting fixtures on buildings should be compatible with the historic character of the area and match the style and period of the building.

**Additional information required:** Revised proposal for a lighting fixture that is unobtrusive and compatible with the historic character of the area and match the style and period of the building.

*Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.*

*\*Relevant Sections of Chapter 59 the Oklahoma City Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

*Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, are available online at [www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html](http://www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html) ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9<sup>th</sup> floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.*

*RJ*