



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

June 5, 2024

HPCA-23-00138

Case Number: HPCA-23-00138
Property Address: 500 NW 17th Street
District: Mesta Park Historic District
Applicant: Jollybird Design
Fallon Brooks-Magnus
4312 Classen Blvd
Oklahoma City, OK 73118
Owner: Chad Rice
500 NW 17th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73101

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Add a porch roof at rear elevation (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant proposes to install a cover over the rear entry and basement entry.

2. Location

Project site is located on the southwest corner of NW 17th Street and N. Walker.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1918

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1994

National Register Listing: 1979

Additional Information:

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 1-story frame dwelling with 1-story front porch extending the length of the front (north) façade and wrapping the east corner. A small portion of the center of the structure is indicated as two stories, typical of bungalows. A one story "autohouse" is indicated near the rear (south) property line and is illustrated as approximately as deep as the house is wide, 34 feet. It is presumably the existing garage. No changes are indicated on subsequent editions of the maps.

4. Existing Conditions

The back door of the dwelling is located at the southwest corner of the house. The below grade entry to the basement and stairs are beneath the eave, but are exposed.

5. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA)

filed for this property include:

| Case Number | Date | Owner | Decision |
|--|-------------|--------------|-----------------|
| HPCA-21-00041 | 07/07/2021 | Chad Rice | Approved |
| 1) Remove historic sidelites at rear and install new sidelites and door. | | | |
| HPCA-21-00041 | 09/01/2024 | Chad Rice | Approved |
| 3) Install storm windows (elective); and 4) Install fence; 5) Replace existing concrete driveway and remove excess concrete and repair yard. | | | |
| HPCA-21-00041 | 10/06/2021 | Chad Rice | Approved |
| 6) Replace west set of non-historic windows. | | | |
| HPCA-20-00075 | 06/03/2020 | Chad Rice | Approved |
| 1) Remove non-historic vinyl/aluminum siding; and 2) Repair underlying wood siding.; 3) Replace front door; 4) Demolish existing non-historic garage. | | | |
| HPCA-20-00075 | 07/01/2020 | Chad Rice | Approved |
| 5) Construct 2-story garage. | | | |
| HPCA-20-00075 | 10/07/2020 | Chad Rice | Withdrawn |
| 7) Revision to item 2) Repair historic siding to include replacing historic siding at the second floor and installing an underlying water barrier. Replacement in kind at less than 50% per side requires no review. | | | |
| HPCA-17-00052 | 05/31/2017 | Lydia Polly | Approved |
| 1) Remove chain link fence; and 2) Install ornamental fence. | | | |
| HPCA-16-00147 | 11/02/2016 | Lydia Polly | Approved |
| 1) Demolish garage; 2) Construct garage (elective); and 3) Replace driveway.. | | | |

Other actions, such as variances, other approvals, citations could also be described here.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

1. Item 1, Add a porch roof at rear elevation (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes an addition at the rear, southwest, corner of the dwelling. Dimensions are approximately 5 feet deep, 20 feet wide, and ceiling height at 8'10". The roof has a modest slope with a logical termination point on the rear elevation.

The proposal includes architectural grade shingles at the shed roof, wood at the west

end, tongue and groove soffit, wood fascia, wood posts, and a concrete slab. The addition is a porch that covers the rear pedestrian door and the steps and door of the basement. This porch replaces a previously existing metal, flat roofed feature serving a similar purpose.

The Standards and Guidelines do not address new back porches specifically, but as an addition, the feature meets relevant criteria.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.3 Porches, Canopies, Porte-Cocheres & Balconies

Policy: Historic porches, canopies, porte-cocheres and balconies are important features and are often the dominant characteristic of a building. These features that are visible from the public right-of-way should not be altered.

- 3.3.8: Reconstruction of a missing porch, canopy, porte-cochere or balcony is encouraged and must be based on accurate physical evidence of the original or historic configuration, placement and detail of the feature and supplemented with historic photographs that show the original feature.
- 3.3.9: If no photographs or other documentation exist, the design of a replacement porch should be compatible with the historic building in height, proportion, style, roof shape, material, texture, detail and color. Buildings of a similar architectural style can provide examples of appropriate design.
- 3.3.12: New or replacement columns should be of materials appropriate to the style and design of the building including the porch. Replacement columns should match the original or historic columns in size, design, scale, massing, materials and details.
- 3.3.14: The use of alternative materials for porch columns on primary facades such as fiberglass may be approved by the Commission if the finished appearance will be indistinguishable from the appearance, design, and texture of the original or historic columns.

4.3 Building Additions

Policy: Additions should complement and not detract from the overall historic character of the historic district.

- 4.3.1: Additions must be compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes, and should be appropriate to the architectural style of the existing building. The incorporation of existing architectural features with new design elements can contribute added interest and compatibility.
- 4.3.2: New additions must be planned so that they are constructed to the back of the property or on a non-character-defining elevation preferably not visible from the public right-of-way. Character-defining features of buildings should not be radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed by an addition. The

existing historic building fabric should not be damaged by the installation of a new addition.

- 4.3.5: Additions to historic or non-historic buildings should relate to and complement the style of the main building, and may relate to the general style of the streetscape.
- 4.3.6: An addition to a historic building must be designed to be visibly distinguishable from the original historic building.
- 4.3.7: Additions to historic buildings should be designed so that connections between new construction and historic structures are clearly discernible. A clear definition of the transition between the new addition and the historic structure should be established and maintained.
- 4.3.9: Historic details in the coping, eaves and parapet of the historic building may be continued at the point where the historic structure connects to the addition.
- 4.3.10: Additions should be clearly secondary to and distinct from the original building. This can be accomplished by providing a clear visual break between the historic building and the addition, by setting the façade of the addition back from that of the historic building, or by constructing a recessed area at the point at which the addition and the historic building join together.
- 4.3.11: Use of different but compatible materials or different (simplified) detailing is also appropriate to differentiate a new addition from the historic building.
- 4.3.12: The design of a new addition must consider and respect the massing, roof shape, bay spacing, cornice lines and materials of the building to which it is being added.

4.6 Exterior Materials at New Construction

Policy: Materials used in the construction of new buildings, additions, garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible in appearance and design with common building materials in the district, or typical of structures of the proposed style, type, age and location.

Design Justification: The form, materials and details of exterior walls and embellishments, as well as their scale, texture and variety, contribute to the overall character of the historic district.

- 4.6.3: Wood siding may be tongue and groove, shiplap, novelty or other compatible type. Board and batten may also be appropriate for use on accessory buildings; it is rarely used on primary buildings.
- 4.6.26: Composition roofs should be of higher quality and are often referred to as Architectural Grade or Dimensional Grade. These shingles are usually rated as 30-, 40-, or 50-year shingles and have a thicker profile.

c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed porch is located to the rear of the structure, and not visible;
2. That the proposed porch addition is compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes, and to the architectural style of the existing building; and
3. That the proposed porch addition is differentiated from the historic dwelling in the roof form.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

None.

E. HPCA-23-00138 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve Item 1) Add a porch roof at rear elevation (elective).**with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed porch is located to the rear and where not visible;
2. That the proposed porch addition is compatible in design, proportion, size, texture, color, and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes, and to the architectural style of the existing building; and
3. That the proposed porch addition is differentiated from the historic dwelling in the roof form.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of Chapter 59 the Oklahoma City Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

ADY