



# STAFF REPORT

## Historic Preservation Commission

December 4, 2024

HPCA-24-00008

**Case Number:** HPCA-24-00008

**Property Address:** 101 NW 19<sup>th</sup> Street

**District:** Heritage Hills East Historic District

**Applicant:** Ten Key Remodels  
Jessica Herndon  
1524 W Edmond Rd  
Edmond, OK 73003

**Owner:** Candace Arnold  
101 NW 19th Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73103

### A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

3. Revise item 2 to include Replace all wood window sashes in kind (required); and
4. Replace aluminum windows with wood windows to match existing (required).

### B. BACKGROUND

#### 1. Project Description

The proposal is to replace in kind all window sashes of the building except basement windows, and to replace existing metal windows with wood windows.

#### 2. Location

Project site is located on the north side of NW 19<sup>th</sup> Street, northwest corner at the intersection of NW 19<sup>th</sup> and N Broadway.

#### 3. Site History

*Date of Construction:* 1932

*Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark:* 1999

*National Register Listing* 2020

*Additional Information:*

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a one-story dwelling with one-story front porch extending the entire length of the front (north) façade. A one-story frame “autohouse” is indicated on the westernmost property line with the front face back nearly 50 percent of the property depth from the front property line. The bungalow form of the dwelling and its porch are illustrated with shingles, typically wood shingles. The Garage and attachment are illustrated with composition roofing, typically indicative of a flat roof at the time. The 1949 edition of the maps indicates the dwelling and porch roofs

to be composition material. The 1949 edition also illustrates the introduction of a two-story frame structure with brick veneer indicated as flats in the rear (north) third of the property. The structure is illustrated with a one-story closed space on the east and a one-story porch on the south. All roofs are indicated as composition. The structure was addressed as 2009 N Broadway. The 1955 edition indicates the flats roof to be shingles except that the south porch remains composition.

#### 4. Existing Conditions

The front bungalow remains and is in fair condition with some evidence of delayed maintenance.

Those original sashes that remain are stored in the dwelling. Not all sashes are extant.

#### 5. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include:

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-24-00008	03/06/2024	Candace Arnold	Approved
Replace pair of windows and reconstruct components.			
HPCA-24-00102	10/02/2024	Candace Arnold	Approved
Demolish duplex.			
HPCA-14-00096	07/02/2014	Ester Arnold	Approved
Fence			
HPCA-14-00096	09/03/2014	Ester Arnold	Denied
Fence			

6. Other actions, such as variances, other approvals, citations could also be described here.

#### C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.\**

None.

#### D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

*This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020\* as referenced below:*

##### 1. Item 3, Replace all wood window sashes in kind other than basement windows (required).

- Description: The applicant proposes the removal all remaining historic wood sashes of the dwelling except those that are located at basement level. All components of the

windows will remain in place except sashes.

The historic windows vary in number of divided lites. All historic windows are multi-pane over one. A pair of fixed windows flank the chimney with five vertical divisions. Hung windows vary in number of divisions including nine over one, twelve over one and fifteen over one. Windows appear as individual openings and pairs or sets of three. Sets all include mullions.

The applicant was previously approved for the installation of a pair of 26 by 26 inch windows within the northwest opening illustrated as L106 and L107. The replacement was approved with a pair insulated, simulated divided lite, wood windows. No change is proposed at these windows though the windows are included in photographs of the existing windows for complete window survey.

This proposal is indicated as replication of the existing, historic wood sashes while leaving all remaining components in place. Three upper sashes are proposed as nine over one where twelve over one occurred.

- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

### **Section 3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings**

**Policy:** Windows and shutters are important character-defining features of a building and originals should be retained and kept in good repair. Awnings may be an intended permanent character defining feature such as wood framed and finished with roof shingles to match the rest of the building or temporary such as contemporary fabric awnings with aluminum frames.

**Design Justification:** The proportion, shape, location, positioning, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the architectural style and period of the building. Their design, details and craftsmanship make them worthy of preservation. The presence or absence of shutters and awnings are significant to the visual character of a building.

**Sustainability Justification:** Many buildings in historic districts retain old-growth wood windows which can last indefinitely if they are properly maintained, unlike new-growth wood or vinyl windows. In most cases, windows account for less than one-fourth of a home's heat loss. Insulating the attic, walls and basement is a more economical approach to reducing energy costs than replacing historic windows. Proper maintenance and sealing of windows, along with adding storm windows, keeps windows out of landfills and enhances a building's energy efficiency year round.

- 3.6.1: Regular maintenance and weather-stripping of historic windows ensures their preservation and improves the energy efficiency of a building.
- 3.6.2: Retain and preserve original or historic windows. Preserve and maintain historic window framing and number and configuration of glass panes.
- 3.6.3: Make repairs to an existing window rather than replacing the entire window unit, including replacement in kind of parts that are deteriorated beyond repair. Ordinary maintenance and repair is limited to less than 50% replacement of the

window's components and parts including frames and sashes.

- 3.6.5: Original or historic windows more than 50% DETERIORATED BEYOND REPAIR may be replaced in kind.
- 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
- 3.6.9: If original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile.
- 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.
- 3.6.18: A new window may have a low emissivity coating applied to clear glass provided that the visible light transmittance is not less than .74 and the overall reflectance is not more than 17%.

- c. Considerations: This work has been done but must be considered as if it has not.

The Standards and Guidelines support the replacement in kind of a window determined to be 50% or more beyond repair. The applicant maintains that the windows are deteriorated beyond repair and photographs as available have been submitted for review.

The proposed replacement is largely replacement in kind of wood sashes to match the existing double hung wood windows. All proposed sashes are single glazed wood and custom made for each opening. The number of divisions is based on photographic evidence of the windows in place. However, three of the sashes were mistaken as twelve over one when they were nine over one. The applicant's desire is to include twelve over one wood windows at those three locations which are on the west (left) side of the dwelling beyond the chimney. Visibility from the public right of way may be limited.

- d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That if original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile;
2. That clear glass is required.

## **2. Item 4, Replace aluminum windows (required).**

- a. Description: The applicant proposes the removal of all existing aluminum replacement windows and the installation of wood windows to match the historic conditions as estimated by observation of similar sized windows existing on the dwelling. Proposed windows are hung wood windows, single glazed with true divided lite with clear glass.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

### **3.1 Maintenance, Preservation and Rehabilitation of Exterior Building**

### Materials

- 3.1.5: If repairs or replacement affect more than one-half (50%) of an inappropriate component or material located on any individual building face or roof, then it is strongly encouraged that all of the inappropriate components or materials be replaced with appropriate materials. A Certificate of Appropriateness is required when all of the inappropriate materials are proposed for replacement. See “Administrative Review” below.
- 3.1.12: If repairs or replacement affect more than two-thirds (66%) of an inappropriate component or material located on any individual building face, then all inappropriate components or materials shall be replaced with an appropriate component or material. Removal of more than 50% of an inappropriate material no longer meets the definition of ordinary maintenance and repair, and a Certificate of Appropriateness is required.
- 3.1.14: Remove an inappropriate component or material and restore the original or historic component or material that is revealed by such removal.
- 3.1.15: New material should match the historic in material type, dimensions, design, configuration, texture, surface coatings and visual appearance.
- 3.1.19: If original or historic materials do not remain, the original form may be reconstructed or restored based on physical, photographic, or documentary evidence.
- 3.1.27: If replication of original elements is not possible because of a lack of historical physical, photographic or documentary evidence, then a new design that is compatible with the original form, style, and period of the building shall be used.
- 3.1.28: An appropriate option for a replacement feature is a new design that is compatible with the remaining character-defining features of the historic building.
- 3.1.29: The new design of a missing feature shall take into account the size, scale, and materials of the historic building; should be clearly differentiated to avoid a false historical appearance; and should maintain visual attention on the authentic and historic aspects of the building.

### 3.6 Windows, Shutters and Awnings

**Policy:** Windows and shutters are important character-defining features of a building and originals should be retained and kept in good repair. Awnings may be an intended permanent character defining feature such as wood framed and finished with roof shingles to match the rest of the building or temporary such as contemporary fabric awnings with aluminum frames.

**Design Justification:** The proportion, shape, location, positioning, pattern and size of windows contribute significantly to the historic character of a building and help convey the architectural style and period of the building. Their design, details and craftsmanship make them worthy of preservation. The presence or absence of shutters

and awnings are significant to the visual character of a building.

**Sustainability Justification:** Many buildings in historic districts retain old-growth wood windows which can last indefinitely if they are properly maintained, unlike new-growth wood or vinyl windows. In most cases, windows account for less than one-fourth of a home's heat loss. Insulating the attic, walls and basement is a more economical approach to reducing energy costs than replacing historic windows. Proper maintenance and sealing of windows, along with adding storm windows, keeps windows out of landfills and enhances a building's energy efficiency year round.

- 3.6.1: Regular maintenance and weather-stripping of historic windows ensures their preservation and improves the energy efficiency of a building.
- 3.6.2: Retain and preserve original or historic windows. Preserve and maintain historic window framing and number and configuration of glass panes.
- 3.6.3: Make repairs to an existing window rather than replacing the entire window unit, including replacement in kind of parts that are deteriorated beyond repair. Ordinary maintenance and repair is limited to less than 50% replacement of the window's components and parts including frames and sashes.
- 3.6.5: Original or historic windows more than 50% DETERIORATED BEYOND REPAIR may be replaced in kind.
- 3.6.8: When window replacement is necessary, do so within the existing historic opening. Use the same frame size to avoid filling in or enlarging the original opening.
- 3.6.9: If original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile.
- 3.6.16: Clear glass shall be used in all windows.
- 3.6.18: A new window may have a low emissivity coating applied to clear glass provided that the visible light transmittance is not less than .74 and the overall reflectance is not more than 17%.

- c. Considerations: This work has been done but must be considered as if it has not.

The Standards and Guidelines support the replacement of inappropriate alterations and a return to a more compatible design and material choice.

All proposed sashes are single glazed wood and custom made for each opening. The number of divisions is based on photographic evidence of the windows in place. However, three of the sashes were mistaken as twelve over one when they were nine over one. The desire is to include twelve over one wood windows at those three locations.

- d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That when original or historic materials do not remain, the original form may be reconstructed or restored based on physical, photographic, or documentary

evidence;

2. That an appropriate option for a replacement feature is a new design that is compatible with the remaining character-defining features of the historic building;
3. That the proposed hung, wood, single glazed windows with similar lite configuration and clear glass is an appropriate substitution for inappropriate replacement windows.

**E. HPCA-24-00008 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:**

1. **Approve Item 4, replace aluminum windows,** with the specific findings that the proposed work will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property and complies with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020\*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

**Specific Findings:**

1. That when original or historic materials do not remain, the original form may be reconstructed or restored based on physical, photographic, or documentary evidence;
  2. That an appropriate option for a replacement feature is a new design that is compatible with the remaining character-defining features of the historic building;
  3. That the proposed hung, wood, single glazed windows with similar lite configuration and clear glass is an appropriate substitution for inappropriate replacement windows.
2. **Approve Item 3, replace all wood sashes, with the following conditions,** with the specific findings that the proposed work, with the **agreed-upon conditions**, will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; the items comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and sections of the Municipal Code, 2020\*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

**Specific Findings:**

1. That if original or historic windows can be demonstrated to be deteriorated beyond repair and must be replaced, new windows shall match all of the characteristics of the historic window, including muntins pattern and profile;
2. That clear glass is required.

**Conditions:**

1. That the Commission has determined that adequate evidence of deterioration beyond repair has been provided for all wood sashes.
2. That nine over one wood windows shall be replaced with nine over one wood windows.

*Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.*

*\*Relevant Sections of Chapter 59 the Oklahoma City Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

*Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, are available online at [www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html](http://www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html) ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9<sup>th</sup> floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.*

*ADY*