



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

June 5, 2024

HPCA-24-00044

Case Number: HPCA-24-00044

Property Address: 225 NW 27th Street

District: Jefferson Park Historic District

Applicant: Epren Lorea
16164 N Western, Unit 1
Edmond, OK 73013

Owner: Maria Claravall
225 NW 27th Street
Oklahoma City, OK 73103

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Construct addition to porte-cochere (required).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant proposes to expand the porte-cochere along the west side of the dwelling north of the existing porte-cochere. This proposal was reviewed by the Historic Preservation Commission May 1, 2024. No representative was available to discuss the proposal at the meeting. Staff requested from the owner and applicant additional documentation to address the Staff Report. Additional documentation has not been presented, and no response was received.

2. Location

Project site is located on the north side of NW 27th Street, across from Goodholm Park, between Robinson and Harvey Avenues.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: 1918

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1998

National Register Listing: 1995

Description from National Register Nomination Intensive Level Survey:

225 Northwest 27th, 1919. This is a one-story Bungalow/Craftsman frame house with a moderate pitched roof, exposed rafter tails, a center gablet, and an open porch gable. Porch beams are supported by three square wood columns on stone slabs on brick piers, connected by a decorative low brick wall. A porte-cochere has two massive square brick columns

with low brick walls between them. The porte-cochere roof is non-original. There is an overhead door at the north end, underneath the porte-cochere. The exterior is sheathed with weatherboard.

Additional Information:

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 1-story frame dwelling, with a 1-story front porch extending nearly the entire length of the front (south) façade. A 1-story frame “autohouse” is indicated toward the easternmost property line, with the front face back nearly $\frac{3}{4}$ of the property depth from the front property line. Subsequent editions of the maps illustrate no substantial changes.

Oklahoma County Assessor records do not reflect an accessory structure at this time. Aerial photographs do illustrate an accessory structure in the approximate location of the historic autohouse.

4. Existing Conditions

The porte-cochere is approximately 16 feet deep from pier to pier and 11 feet wide. Clearance between pier or column and dwelling appears to eight to nine feet.

Beyond the porte-cochere there is an accessory building that occupies the historic garage location.

5. Previous Actions

Case Number	Date	Owner	Decision
HPCA-23-00157	03/06/2024	Maria Claravall	Approved
Install solar panels and equipment.			
HPCA-13-00168	10/09/2013	Maria Claravall	Approved
Replace wood shingles and top layers of comp shingles with architectural grade shingles and install roof vents.			

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

None.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 1, Construct addition to porte-cochere (required).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes construction of an additional 21 feet to the rear of the existing porte-cochere on the west side of the dwelling. The proposal will utilize the existing column and extend the existing roof. One additional column will be added

to the north end of the extension.

- b. *References: Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

3.3 Porches, Canopies, Porte-Cocheres & Balconies

Policy: Historic porches, canopies, porte-cocheres and balconies are important features and are often the dominant characteristic of a building. These features that are visible from the public right-of-way should not be altered.

Design Justification: Front porches and canopies connect a building to its context by orientating the primary entrance to the street. The various components of porches, canopies, porte-cocheres, and balconies, including steps, railings and columns, provide scale and detail to historic buildings.

Sustainability Justification: Porches, canopies, and porte-cocheres protect entrances, provide shade, and enhance a building's energy efficiency.

- 3.3.1: Maintaining porches, canopies, porte-cocheres and balconies, preserves and sustains their embodied energy and eliminates the need for replacement with new resources.
- 3.3.2: Preserve existing historic front porches, canopies, porte-cocheres, balconies, and their components because they are character-defining features of a building.
- 3.3.8: Reconstruction of a missing porch, canopy, porte-cochere or balcony is encouraged and must be based on accurate physical evidence of the original or historic configuration, placement and detail of the feature and supplemented with historic photographs that show the original feature.

Porte-cocheres

- 3.3.35: A porte-cochere is a covered area over a driveway at a side entrance and physically attached to a building. Porte-cocheres are historically important features and are a dominant characteristic where they occur. The various components of porte-cocheres, including roof, columns, railings and steps, provide scale and detail to historic buildings. Porte-cocheres may be an extension of a porch roof or be an independent feature attached to the building.
- 3.3.36: Maintenance of porte-cocheres ensures their preservation, sustaining their embodied energy and negating the need for replacement with new resources.
- 3.3.37: Do not eliminate or enclose a porte-cochere because such actions would significantly alter the character of the building.
- 3.3.38: Do not create a false historical appearance through the application of new elements and details to a porte-cochere. Do not add a porte-cochere to a building where none historically existed.

- 3.3.39: Reconstruction of a missing porte-cochere must be based on accurate evidence of the original configuration, placement and detail and supplemented with historic photographs that show the original or historic porte-cochere.
- 3.3.40: If no photographs or other documentation is available, a new design that is compatible with the historic building in height, proportion, style, roof shape, material, texture, detail and color is appropriate. Buildings of a similar architectural style can provide examples of appropriate new porte-cochere design.

1.9 Overall Approach and Format

- **Significant (Characteristics of Historical or Architectural Resources):** Those characteristics that are important to, or expressive of, the historical, architectural or cultural quality and integrity of the resource and its setting; and includes, but is not limited to, building material, detail, height, mass, proportion, rhythm, scale, setback, setting, shape, street accessories and workmanship.

The design standards and guidelines also consider the potential importance of past remodeling work or additions that may have gained historic significance. Many properties built in the nineteenth century were later remodeled in the early twentieth century and these remodels may be significant in reflecting the evolution of the building over time. For example, Bungalow porches were often added to Folk Victorian and Queen Anne style homes in the 1910s and 1920s. Property owners should consider preserving and maintaining these types of features to illustrate the influence of later historical styles.

While rehabilitation projects are frequently appropriate, it is important that alterations and additions are compatible and do not radically change, obscure or destroy the features of the building that define its historic character.

4.1 General Requirements for New Construction and Additions

Policy: New construction and additions should not destroy historic materials or general features that characterize a historic building, property or district. New work should be differentiated from existing, historic structures and protect the historic integrity of the property and the historic district. Additions to historic structures should be done so that the historic character of the structure is retained and, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original structure and site would be unimpaired.

4.3 Building Additions

- 4.3.2: New additions must be planned so that they are constructed to the back of the property or on a non-character-defining elevation preferably not visible from the public right-of-way. Character-defining features of buildings should not be radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed by an addition. The existing historic building fabric should not be damaged by the installation of a new addition.

- 4.3.6: An addition to a historic building must be designed to be visibly distinguishable from the original historic building.
 - 4.3.7: Additions to historic buildings should be designed so that connections between new construction and historic structures are clearly discernible. A clear definition of the transition between the new addition and the historic structure should be established and maintained.
- c. Considerations: New additions should not obscure or alter character defining features of the structure. The proposed addition will obscure the historic form of the dwelling, which is a defining characteristic of the style of the building. The proposed method of introduction also obscures the original form of the porte-cochere. Utilizing the existing column and continuing the roof of the existing porte-cochere further disguises the original form of the feature, while prohibiting any form of differentiation.

The proposed scale of the addition alters massing, proportion and scale of the dwelling and the porte-cochere. The proposal is a permanent alteration to the west side of the dwelling.

Porte-cocheres historically are approximately the length of an automobile. A continuous, approximately 40-foot-long feature, along the side of the dwelling, is not consistent with the historic character of the dwelling or the District.

It is not appropriate to create a false historical appearance through the application of new elements and details to a porte-cochere, or to add a porte-cochere to a building where none historically existed.

- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That a porte-cochere must be based on accurate evidence of the original configuration, placement and detail and supplemented with historic photographs that show the original or historic porte-cochere;
 2. That porte-cocheres are important features and are a dominant characteristic where they occur;
 3. That character-defining features of buildings should not be radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed by an addition.

E. HPCA-24-00044 STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Continue Item 1, construct an addition to the porte-cochere**, with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and is in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

1. That a porte-cochere must be based on accurate evidence of the original configuration, placement and detail and supplemented with historic photographs that show the original or historic porte-cochere;

2. That porte-cocheres are important features and are a dominant characteristic where they occur;
3. That character-defining features of buildings should not be radically changed, obscured, damaged or destroyed by an addition.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of Chapter 59 the Oklahoma City Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

ADY