



STAFF REPORT

Historic Preservation Commission

December 4, 2024

HPCA-24-00125

Case Number: HPCA-24-00125

Property Address: 408 NW 30th Street

District: Jefferson Park Historic District

Applicant: Adam Lanman
718 W Sheridan Ave
Oklahoma City, OK 73102

Owner: Matthew McLaughlin
6824 N Robinson
Oklahoma City, OK 73116

A. CASE ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

1. Construct two multi-family residential structures (elective);
2. Install surface parking lot (elective);
3. Install parking covers at portion of surface parking lot (elective);
4. Construct dumpster enclosure in closed alley (revocable permit required – elective);
5. Install wood fencing at west and south side of property (elective);
6. Install wrought-iron style fencing at east side of property (elective);
7. Install fence and gate at east side of property, parking lot (elective);
8. Replace and widen curb cut at east side of property (elective);
9. Install concrete pads with gravel between in parking lot (elective);
10. Install concrete walkways (elective);
11. Install artificial turf (elective);
12. Install landscaping (elective).

B. BACKGROUND

1. Project Description

The applicant proposes to construct two multi-family residential buildings connected by a colonnade across the front elevation, with a courtyard between the structures. Associated site improves include a surface parking lot with some covered parking, walkways, fencing, and landscaping. This site was formerly the location of a church, demolished as a dilapidated structure after a fire, and has previously been rezoned to SPUD-01581 to accommodate this development.

Note: The applicant indicates a possible future fence installation at the proposed courtyard.

This was not called out in the public notice for this hearing but may be reviewed at a later date.

2. Location

Project site is located at the southwest corner of NW 30th Street and N Hudson.

3. Site History

Date of Construction: N/A (vacant lot – previous structure demolished in 2022 via dilapidated process)

Zoned Historic Preservation/Historical Landmark: 1998

National Register Listing: 1995

National Register Description:

408 NW 30th, Hudson Avenue Baptist Church, 1929, later additions. This is a multilevel Modern Movement church. The original porch on the west end is now the educational wing. It has two stories and is of a red and black brick. The hung windows have cast sills. An orange brick façade has been added to the north and east elevations and matches the one-story section of the newer wing to the east. The two-story section of the newer building is of regular coursed elongated limestone. This building is noncontributing due to the addition of the new sanctuary.

Additional Information:

The 1922 edition of the Sanborn Fire Insurance maps illustrates a 1-story frame dwelling with 1-story front porch on each of lots 2 and 3. Neither of these two dwellings (and their associated autohouses) remains, although both lots remained largely unaltered through 1955. A 2-story brick veneered church building is illustrated on the west portion of lots 1 and 2 in the 1949 edition of the maps. It has a composition roof and remains unchanged in subsequent editions of the maps. This information is consistent with the Oklahoma County assessor's information relating to the 1925 date of construction for the 2-story brick church and the 1960 date of construction for the current church building that occupies most of Lot 2 and some of Lot 1. Lot 3 is now a surface parking lot.

1. Existing Conditions

This property is currently vacant. The previous historic structure was demolished in 2022, having been declared dilapidated previously.

2. Previous Actions

Previous applications for Historic Preservation Certificate of Appropriateness (HPCA) filed for this property include requests to construct a rear addition, replace windows, and install light fixtures, and mitigation of painted masonry.

C. ITEMS IN COMPLIANCE

*Unless noted below in Section D., Issues and Considerations, all other case items of this proposal comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020.**

1. Item 6, Install wrought-iron style fencing at east side of property (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes the installation of 4-foot-tall wrought-iron style fencing at the east side of the property, set back 8 feet from the front of the proposed building. The fence will enclose a small side yard area between the entrance to front and rear first-floor units of the proposed building.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.8 Fences and Walls

Policy: Preserve original or historic fences and fence walls. New fences should be of renewable materials such as wood, woven wire or brick. Vinyl fences are not appropriate.

Design Justification: Fence walls and fences historically marked property boundaries and may have shielded private areas from public view. Historic materials such as wire, wood and brick are compatible materials; vinyl materials introduce an incompatible artificial appearance.

Sustainability Justification: Preserving existing fences and fence walls saves resources. New wood fences constructed of lumber from managed forests represents use of a renewable resource. Petroleum-based vinyl fencing is not a sustainable material.

- 2.8.4: Fences and fence walls in back yards have more flexible requirements than those in side yards or those that are front yard facing because they are less visible from the public right-of-way.
- 2.8.5: Fences and fence walls are generally permitted in side, corner side, and back yards. Interior side and corner side yard fences and fence walls must be set back from the historic front building line by a distance not less than six feet. Depending on the materials and details of a fence and fence wall, additional requirements of this section may apply.
- 2.8.6: A fence or fence wall located on the street facing side yard of a corner property must be set back from the inner edge of a public sidewalk by a minimum distance of two feet, or six feet from the curb where there is no sidewalk.
- 2.8.7: If an adjacent corner property side yard has an existing fence or fence wall, then consideration shall be given to align a fence or fence wall to the same setback as that existing fence or fence wall of the adjacent corner property side yard.
- 2.8.9: Fences and fence walls shall be located at or behind the front 40% of the side yard of the main building unless the fence or fence wall is 75% transparent not including posts or columns spaced a minimum of eight feet apart. Depending on the design and architecture of the main building, additional requirements of this section may apply.

- 2.8.13: Fences and fence walls shall not exceed six feet in height on side or front facing locations.
- 2.8.16: Acceptable materials for fences and fence walls are wood, brick, stone, cast iron, iron, chain link, twisted wire, painted aluminum that mimics the appearance of cast iron or iron fences, or a combination of these materials. Materials for fences and fence walls should be consistent with materials historically used at each individual property or within the historic district during the period of significance.
- 2.8.18: Decorative painting and murals shall not be applied to fence or fence wall surfaces visible from the public right-of-way.
- 2.8.19: Tops of new fences or fence walls may be horizontal, stepped, scooped, arched or parallel with the grade, as appropriate to the style and period of the main building or the historic district.
- 2.8.22: The corners of corner properties should have partially “transparent” or open fences or fence walls to avoid complete visual enclosure along side streets.

c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. The proposed fence appears to meet all applicable Standards and Guidelines and is compatible with the proposed development and the surrounding historic district.

2. **Item 10, Install concrete walkways (elective).**

- a. Description: The applicant proposes the installation of various sidewalks throughout the property, connecting apartment entrances, the courtyard, and parking area to the existing public sidewalks.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.3 **Sidewalks, Driveways, Parking Lots, Curbs and Vacant Sites**

Policy: *Sidewalks, driveways and off-street parking should not interrupt the historic continuity of landscaped front or corner side yards. Historic concrete sidewalks and walkways should be preserved and repaired with concrete that is consistent in pattern, size, texture and color. Historic concrete driveways should be preserved and new driveways should be of concrete rather than asphalt.*

Design Justification: Historically, the consistency and repetition of sidewalk and driveway spacing, placement, dimension and materials create a rhythm to the street. Retaining the specific rhythm of a street is important to preserve historic character. Oklahoma City’s historic districts and properties have strong visual elements of grey colored concrete for sidewalks, walkways, some streets and curbs.

Sustainability Justification: Existing historic concrete sidewalks, steps and driveways represent embodied energy and should be preserved. Concrete is a long-lasting sustainable material, reflects solar heat and light and should be

repaired or replaced as needed with new concrete to match. New driveways should be of similar design, pattern, texture, dimensions and color as the historic driveway. The use of permeable paving for non-historic and new driveways, sidewalks and parking areas is encouraged because it helps to reduce water run-off.

- 2.3.6: New concrete for sidewalks, driveways, curbs, and parking lots shall match the aged appearance in design details, color and texture of the existing concrete it replaces or adjacent concrete that will remain. If new concrete is not replacing existing concrete and is not adjacent to any existing concrete it should have an aged appearance in color and finish. New concrete visible from the public right-of-way shall not be bright white in color.
- 2.3.7: All sidewalks, driveways, and curbs visible from the public right-of-way shall be constructed to maintain the continuity of materials and character present in the district.
- 2.3.8: Private sidewalks and driveways must be constructed of concrete except where historical precedent demonstrates the previous existence of brick, stone or other materials, which may be considered appropriate for replacement.

c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed sidewalks appear to be consistent with applicable Standards and Guidelines and will have no adverse effect on the character of the property or historic district.

D. ISSUES AND CONSIDERATIONS

This proposal may not comply with the Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts, and with all relevant sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020 as referenced below:*

1. Item 1, Construct two multi-family residential structures (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes the construction of two multi-family residential structures. The proposed structures mirror each other, divided down the center by an open courtyard. The proposed buildings have flat roofs and are two stories, measuring 23'7" tall. Each building is 48'10" wide at the front elevation, bumping out an additional 10 feet beyond the courtyard for a width of 58'10" at the rear elevations.

The front elevation of each building is brick and consists of single and grouped 1/1 windows and with one offset entrance under an arched brick porch cover. Also visible from the front elevation is the courtyard space, with two sets of exterior stairs accessing the second floor of the buildings. A brick entablature spans the courtyard in the center, and a low brick patio screen wall projects out at the east corner.

Outward-facing side elevations are brick, and include two entrances with awnings and single, 1/1 windows. Brick patio screen walls extend out at each entrance on the east elevation.

Elevations facing into the courtyard are composed of brick and fiber cement siding in a smooth finish, with entrances at the first and second floor, single and paired windows, and recessed mailboxes at the rear corners.

The rear elevations, facing the proposed parking lot, are composed entirely of fiber cement siding and include entrances to units at the first floor and single and grouped 1/1 windows. Brick from the east and west facades wraps around the corner of each building.

The proposed building materials include a buff brick, laid in varied patterns to create vertical and horizontal lines and shadows; smooth finish fiber cement siding, and fiberglass windows. Proposed doors include wood doors with reeded glass at the first floor facing NW 30th and N Hudson, fiberglass doors with frosted glass on the west and south elevations, and flat-panel metal doors at the second story, where not visible from the street. The proposed stairs are metal in a painted finish. Proposed light fixtures include modest up-and-down sconces and gooseneck style fixtures.

- b. References: Master Design Statement for SPUD-01581

II. Other Development Regulations

1. **Architecture**: The architectural design will be based on and conform with styles found in Jefferson Park and Edgemere Park, and will not cause any harm to the general features that define this historic district. A significant amount of attention will be given to the frontage design of any new buildings and the relationship between the architecture and its visual context. The new construction will be compatible with the existing historic architecture and blend in with the surrounding structures. This compatibility may include taking into account the size, shape, massing, and materials used for the new construction. In the event that dormers are utilized, they must be located on the east and west elevations only. Any new building or exterior renovations beyond ordinary maintenance and repair, as defined in the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, as amended, and balconies, if installed, must meet the regulations outlined within the Municipal Code in reference to the Historic Landmark Overlay and will be subject to review and approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness by the Historic Preservation Commission, in accordance with the applicable guidelines and regulations.

References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

4.1 General Requirements for New Construction and Additions

Policy: New construction and additions should not destroy historic materials or general features that characterize a historic building, property or district. New work should be differentiated from existing, historic structures and protect the historic integrity of the property and the historic district. Additions to historic structures should be done so that the historic character of the structure is retained and, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original structure and site would be unimpaired.

Design Justification: New construction and its integration with an existing building, property or district should be compatible with surrounding existing historic architecture. Compatibility may include the size, shape, massing and materials of new construction. The relationship of new construction form to the historic context in which it is located is critical for maintaining visual character of a historic building, property or district.

Sustainability Justification: Effective resource conservation includes consideration of the renewability of resources, the manufacturing processes used to create the materials and the recycled construction materials, energy costs associated in the manufacture and shipping of construction materials, and the ways selected materials can help make the new building, as a whole, energy efficient.

- 4.1.1: Over the next decade it is expected that 25% of new commercial and institutional buildings and 20% of new residences will qualify as "green." Green buildings may be certified under the Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design (LEED) program, a trademarked system under which buildings are awarded points in five categories: 1) sustainable sites, 2) water efficiency, 3) energy and atmosphere, 4) indoor environmental quality, and 5) innovation and design process.
- 4.1.2: New construction, which may include a new, stand-alone primary or accessory building, a new garage, an addition to an existing building or a substantial renovation to an existing building, should be designed to take the five LEED categories into consideration.
- 4.1.3: Significant alteration of the topography of a property through extensive grading, removal or alteration of rolled terraces and similar character-defining features, filling or excavating, is not permitted.
- 4.1.4: Refer to Chapter 3, "Alterations to Building Fabric and Components of Historic Building," for items, components, features or materials planned for new construction or additions that may not be addressed by this Chapter.

4.2 Stand-Alone New Construction

Policy: New stand-alone construction should complement and not detract from the overall historic character of the historic property or district.

Design Justification: The way in which existing and new buildings relate is important in maintaining the overall historic character of a historic property and district. Architectural design directly affects the integrity of the property and district as a whole. For this reason, new, stand-alone buildings should maintain the continuity of the character of a historic property and district.

Sustainability Justification: New construction should adhere to principles of sustainability in design, materials, and energy efficiency.

- 4.2.1: New buildings must follow historic setback patterns of the street.
- 4.2.2: New stand-alone and infill buildings should be consistent with

historical patterns of development for the property, block and district.

- 4.2.3: Construction of stand-alone and infill buildings should be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to adjacent or nearby buildings and streetscapes.
- 4.2.4: New buildings must fill the same proportion of lot area as other buildings on the streetscape. The pattern created by spaces between buildings should be continued.
- 4.2.5: New construction must respect the architectural integrity and context of surrounding buildings. Existing adjacent historic structures and streetscapes should be taken into consideration before designing new construction. Incorporating existing architectural features with new design elements can add interest and enhance the compatibility of the new building in the district or other new infill buildings on a property.
- 4.2.6: The height of new buildings should relate to the heights, roof-forms and cornice lines of adjacent structures and to those of other buildings on the streetscape. The height of new buildings should conform to the following unless historical development patterns are documented otherwise:
 - 4.2.6.1: In streetscapes with uniform building heights, new buildings should match this height. For example, on a streetscape of all one-story residential structures, any new building should also be one story in height.
 - 4.2.6.2: In streetscapes with varied building heights, the height of new buildings should align with the existing buildings on the streetscape, with particular attention paid to the predominant height of the adjacent structures and other structures on the streetscape.
 - 4.2.6.3: The floor-to-floor heights of new buildings should closely align with the floor-to-floor heights of the adjacent or nearby historic structures.
 - 4.2.6.4: The height of porches of new buildings should closely align with the porch heights of the historic buildings on the same streetscape, with particular attention paid to porch heights of adjacent structures.
- 4.2.7: The design of new construction should be compatible with historic styles within the district yet not imitate them so as to provide distinction between the historic buildings and new construction.
- 4.2.8: In new construction, the use of materials similar to those of the adjacent historic structures is encouraged. Actual replication of these materials is not encouraged. This approach ensures the design compatibility of the historic structures while clearly differentiating between old and new.
- 4.2.9: Similar shapes that are repeated in many buildings within a streetscape are encouraged to be incorporated in the design of a new residential building. Replication of historic detailing is discouraged; however, the repetition of similar shapes and elements can help provide continuity and enhance

compatibility between new and old structures.

- 4.2.10: Spacing and size of window and door openings must be similar to their historic counterparts within the streetscape or district, or be typical of structures of the same type, age and location. The proportion of window to wall space should also be similar to their historic counterparts, without duplicating them.
- 4.2.12: Only when a previously demolished historic building can be accurately replicated may a reproduction be considered at that site.
- 4.2.13: Facades of new construction facing an alley may be simplified and secondary in design to that of primary facades. The same materials should be used for alley facing building elevations as those of the primary facade, unless this varies from the typical historic condition within the district.

4.6 Exterior Materials at New Construction

Policy: Materials used in the construction of new buildings, additions, garages and other accessory buildings should be compatible in appearance and design with common building materials in the district, or typical of structures of the proposed style, type, age and location.

Design Justification: The form, materials and details of exterior walls and embellishments, as well as their scale, texture and variety, contribute to the overall character of the historic district.

Sustainability Justification: Materials for new exterior wall construction should be as sustainable as possible. Appropriate siding materials may include stucco, wood, brick, or cementitious siding. Vinyl and metal siding materials are not sustainable and should not be used.

Wall Materials

- 4.6.2: Materials for new construction should be consistent with those at other buildings within the property, block and historic district. Consideration should be given to the pattern of development of the specific property and lot.
- 4.6.4: Brick is a common material in Oklahoma City historic districts and is appropriate for use on new construction.
- 4.6.6: Cementitious siding (smooth finish) of an appropriate profile may be used at new construction of stand-alone primary buildings, garages and other accessory buildings. It may also be used for additions to historic structures.
- 4.6.9: Masonry bonding patterns, sizes and color should be similar to those found at the property or used for historic buildings in the historic district and typical of structures of the same style, type, age and location.

Windows

- 4.6.11: Windows in new stand-alone construction must be similar to their counterparts within the property, block or historic district. These windows

may be wood, vinyl clad wood, metal clad wood, or metal with a profile similar to the windows of other buildings on the property. For new infill construction the profile must be similar to the windows used on other properties in the block or historic district.

- 4.6.12: New windows may have a simpler window pane pattern than their historic counterparts; for example, if the historic windows are 6/1 (read “six over one”), then 1/1 windows of the same overall size may be used.
- 4.6.13: Windows constructed entirely of aluminum or vinyl are not permitted, and aluminum surfaces cannot have a clear, mill or anodized finish unless supported by historic documentation for a specific property or structure.
- 4.6.14: Clear glass must be used in all windows. Reflective, tinted, patterned or sandblasted glass in windows is generally not appropriate. Patterned, leaded or colored glass can be used in transoms and sidelights when established by the architectural style of the building or when supported by historical documentation for a specific property or structure.
- 4.6.15: Thermal pane (also known as insulated glass) windows are acceptable for additions or new construction. When muntins are proposed for a divided light appearance they should be “true divided lights” meaning that the thin wood framing (called ‘muntins’) completely frames and separates each piece of glass from the others.

Doors

- 4.6.20: Recommendations and requirements for primary entrance doors, screen doors and storm doors, and doors that are visible from the public right-of-way are the same as described for the “Alterations to the Building Fabric and Components of Historic Buildings” chapter.
- 4.6.22: Pedestrian doors that are not visible from the public right-of-way may be made of alternate materials including aluminum clad wood, composite wood, and fiberglass. Doors in Heritage Hills must be of solid wood.

3.5 Doors and Entries

- 3.5.6: Unless documentation is provided to demonstrate other materials were historically used on a building, primary (usually the front door) entrance doors shall be wood.

Considerations: **Development patterns of the property, block, and district:** the oldest documented structures at the site were single family homes facing N Hudson. Subsequently, a church was built at the west end of the property, with a larger church built to fill the bulk of the site in approximately 1960. The applicant has provided site analysis materials illustrating their efforts to reference the form and mass of the former church in the development of their project’s massing. Beyond the site, the development pattern of the districts includes single-family residences and duplexes interspersed with mid-sized multi-family residential structures, typically two stories in height. Buildings with as many as eight units occupy standard 50x140 foot lots, while those with as many

as 16 units occupy three lots. One of the larger multi-family structures is the Windemere, occupying 4 lots and containing 20 units, at three stories tall. By staff's assessment, the proposed development references the physical bulk and mass of previous development at this site and fits within the diverse range of development patterns for the surrounding district.

Massing and placement on lot: The applicant has provided an exhibit illustrating their analysis of the surrounding context, including spacing between and around the existing building. The proposed buildings are wider than other structures on the block, but generally follow the rhythm and spacing of the block. The buildings themselves fill a similar proportion of the lot compared to surrounding properties, though the parking lot increases the lot coverage more than most other structures on the blocks with unpaved rear yards.

The combination of the additional width of the structures with the two-story height creates a proportion that is more horizontal in orientation than vertical, which is not typical of the surrounding architecture. The horizontality of the development may be further emphasized by the placement of the entablature at the courtyard. The applicant has attempted to emphasize the verticality of the buildings through brickwork, through the arched porches at the entrances, and through the height and proportions of the windows, among other features.

Materials: Proposed cladding materials of brick and fiber cement siding are compatible with the materials of the surrounding district and are supported by the Guidelines. The light buff color of the brick is not typical of neighboring Tudor buildings but references the lighter shades of brick and other masonry at nearby properties on the block and across the street to the north.

Proposed windows are fiberglass, a product that is not identified in the list of allowed window materials for new construction. The applicant indicates that these windows are superior to some other window products and that the windows will approximate the appearance and profiles of traditional windows.

Proposed doors include wood and fiberglass, which are supported by the Guidelines for their respective locations, and metal doors which are not prohibited by the Guidelines, but are typically not deemed appropriate. The applicant indicates that these doors will not be visible from the public right-of-way.

Setback: The proposed buildings meet the setbacks established by the rezoning of the property in SPUD-01581. The HP Guidelines require new buildings to be constructed within the range of setbacks established along the block. The 400 block of NW 30th includes varied setbacks, generally decreasing as the block approaches Walker. The proposed building is indicated to match the setback of the abutting property to the west and to be within the range of setbacks along the block. To the south, the proposed building appears to align with or extend slightly forward of the porches of properties along N Hudson. This setback may be visually indiscernible given the distance between the building and the properties to the south; however, a fence proposed at the corner of this building will continue that setback and will also be forward of the front porch of the house directly to the south (also see Item 7).

In addition to the standard setbacks, this property is located on a corner and must observe sight distance triangle requirements. These prohibit the installation of any structure, fence, or other installation that obstructs vision at a height greater than two feet within the sight triangle. The site plan indicates that the brick screen wall at the northeast corner of the proposed building extends slightly into the site triangle. This should be relocated to the south or changed to a transparent fence.

Open Space: The SPUD requires 40% open space. The applicant has provided calculations of open space that include permeable and impermeable surfaces, including the parking lot, sidewalks, and other paved elements, as approximately 66%. This is the standard method of calculating “open space” per Subdivision and Zoning/Plan Review practices. HP Guidelines do not specifically address a percentage for open space but do state that new construction should not substantially alter the built-to-open space ratio. Prior to demolition of the previous church, the majority of the site was taken up by a single structure, and the remaining rear and west side yards were paved. As proposed, the applicant calculates the site will be 46% permeable surfaces, 54% impermeable surfaces, which appears to be an improvement from the previous condition.

Height: The proposed building is two stories with a flat roof and is within the height limitation established by the SPUD. HP Guidelines state that “the height of new buildings should align with the existing buildings on the streetscape, with particular attention paid to the predominant height of the adjacent structures and other structures on the streetscape” (4.2.6.2). The block predominantly consists of one-story structures, with a taller than average one-story commercial building at the east end of the block and a two-story residence with pitched roof in the center of the block. Across Hudson from the subject property is another two-story residence with pitched roof. The applicant has provided a height comparison illustrating the house directly south on Hudson and the entire block of NW 30th. While the proposed structure will be taller than neighboring properties, it is within the range of heights of the block and will visually “step down” from the two-story structure at the east side of Hudson to the shorter structures moving east.

Architectural compatibility: SPUD-01581 incorporates language specifically addressing the development’s architectural design and the requirement to be based upon, and “conform with,” styles in Jefferson Park and Edgemere Park. In addition to that language, the Historic Preservation Guidelines go into further detail about the relationship between new construction and surrounding historic contexts, stating that new construction should “be compatible with historic styles within the district yet not imitate them so as to provide distinction,” and should use similar materials, shapes, and detailing, while avoiding replication. The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation, used when reviewing historic tax credit projects, state that “new additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction...shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.”

Therefore, while incorporation of the architectural character of the surrounding districts is integral to the compatibility of new development, the clear differentiation of that

development, making a distinction between historic and new, is also critical. It is widely accepted in the field of historic preservation that infill construction should be of its own time and should not present itself as a replica of a historic structure.

The applicant has included an exhibit detailing their analysis of the architectural characteristics of the surrounding district, including the overall block patterns in the surrounding area, the organic shapes and forms used on surrounding architectural styles, and the intricate brickwork incorporated into surrounding masonry buildings as a way of adding definition and texture. The applicant has incorporated elements of these characteristics into the proposed design. The applicant has also utilized window and door proportions and spacing and roof forms that are compatible with the district, although elements of the window forms and spacing are more distinctly modern.

The building's use of modern materials and simplified interpretation of historic architectural details differentiates it from its historic surroundings, while maintaining elements of compatibility. The building deviates from its immediate surroundings in its color palette, though buff brick is a common material throughout the historic districts and is utilized in many historic styles.

The building also deviates in its form, spanning multiple lots with each of the two buildings exceeding the typical width of surrounding structures. Courtyard apartment buildings, with two portions of the building flanking a courtyard, are a common building form for historic apartments, and typically occupy more than one lot. The proposed form and proportion of this development makes reference to that property type but still exceeds the typical width, contributing to building proportions that may be less compatible with the surrounding neighborhood character.

c. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed development utilizes materials that meet applicable Guidelines, except that fiberglass windows and metal doors are not supported by the Guidelines;
2. That the proposed development conforms with the regulations established in SPUD-01581, including height, setback, and lot coverage;
3. That the proposed development meets applicable Guidelines for height, setback, and spacing between buildings, except that the east side setback appears to extend beyond the setback of the neighboring property to the south;
4. That the proposed development incorporates architectural styles, features, and building forms that are present at surrounding properties in the districts, are appropriate to the use and scale of the property, and are compatible with the historic character of the surrounding properties and districts;
5. That the proposed development deviates from the character of the block and surrounding area in its width and horizontality;
6. That the proportions of the proposed development, though distinct from those of surrounding properties, make reference to the bulk and mass of the previous structure at the site and may also reference similarly configured historic residential

“courtyard” structures throughout Oklahoma City’s historic districts;

7. That the proposed development is compatible with, yet differentiated from, and not imitative of, the surrounding historic properties.
2. **Item 2, Install surface parking lot (elective), Item 3, Install parking covers at portion of surface parking lot (elective), Item 4, Construct dumpster enclosure in closed alley (revocable permit required- elective); Item 7, Install fence and gate at east side of property, parking lot (elective), Item 8, Replace and widen curb cut at east side of property (elective), and Item 9, Install concrete pads with gravel between in parking lot (elective).**
 - a. Description: The applicant proposes the installation of a surface parking lot at the rear of the proposed multi-family residential structures. The north side of the proposed parking lot includes parking covers (carports). A dumpster enclosure is proposed at the west end of the parking lot, located within a closed alley; this will require a revocable permit and may place certain limitations on construction methods for the enclosure. At the east end of the parking lot, a horizontal slatted fence is proposed to screen and enclose the parking lot, and the curb cut is proposed to be removed and widened. The center of the parking lot is proposed with detached concrete pads separated by gravel between.
 - b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.3 Sidewalks, Driveways, Parking Lots, Curbs and Vacant Sites

Policy: *Sidewalks, driveways and off-street parking should not interrupt the historic continuity of landscaped front or corner side yards. Historic concrete sidewalks and walkways should be preserved and repaired with concrete that is consistent in pattern, size, texture and color. Historic concrete driveways should be preserved and new driveways should be of concrete rather than asphalt.*

Design Justification: Historically, the consistency and repetition of sidewalk and driveway spacing, placement, dimension and materials create a rhythm to the street. Retaining the specific rhythm of a street is important to preserve historic character. Oklahoma City’s historic districts and properties have strong visual elements of grey colored concrete for sidewalks, walkways, some streets and curbs.

Sustainability Justification: Existing historic concrete sidewalks, steps and driveways represent embodied energy and should be preserved. Concrete is a long-lasting sustainable material, reflects solar heat and light and should be repaired or replaced as needed with new concrete to match. New driveways should be of similar design, pattern, texture, dimensions and color as the historic driveway. The use of permeable paving for non-historic and new driveways, sidewalks and parking areas is encouraged because it helps to reduce water run-off.

- 2.3.5: Maintain the continuity of existing original or historic sidewalks and the curb cut radius or curved approach when replacing an existing driveway

or introducing a new driveway.

- 2.3.6: New concrete for sidewalks, driveways, curbs, and parking lots shall match the aged appearance in design details, color and texture of the existing concrete it replaces or adjacent concrete that will remain. If new concrete is not replacing existing concrete and is not adjacent to any existing concrete it should have an aged appearance in color and finish. New concrete visible from the public right-of-way shall not be bright white in color.
- 2.3.7: All sidewalks, driveways, and curbs visible from the public right-of-way shall be constructed to maintain the continuity of materials and character present in the district.
- 2.3.8: Private sidewalks and driveways must be constructed of concrete except where historical precedent demonstrates the previous existence of brick, stone or other materials, which may be considered appropriate for replacement.
- 2.3.12: Driveways, eight feet or less in width, may be replaced by a driveway of up to ten feet in width; width may vary as the driveway approaches the garage to correspond to the width of the garage door openings. However, property owners are encouraged to limit the quantity of impervious concrete surfaces to assist in reducing storm water runoff.
- 2.3.15: New off-street parking for multi-family properties must be located so as to minimize the number and width of curb cuts on primary residential streets. Owners of adjacent apartment or commercial properties should consider shared driveways and shared parking agreements when appropriate to reduce the overall lot coverage of off-street parking.
- 2.3.16: New impermeable parking surfaces must be graded to drain toward the street and away from buildings.
- 2.3.17: Although the Municipal Code has specific requirements for surfaces to be used for driving and parking, consideration should be given to the use of permeable paving surfaces, such as unit pavers or recycled-plastic grid systems installed below grade, to reduce run-off and flooding. Crushed rock or pea gravel is not permitted by the Municipal Code as an individual parking surface. Parking directly on the ground (earth, dirt, or grass) is also not permitted. Various types of permeable paving may be appropriate in the back yard as long as the paving is not visible from the public right-of-way and the Municipal Code requirements are met.
- 2.3.20: Screen parking from streets and pedestrian areas by placing parking areas at the back of a property and behind primary structures. New parking areas for corner lots shall be located behind primary structures, set back as far as possible from side streets, and placed so as to be as inconspicuous as possible.
- 2.3.21: In addition to being located at the back of the lot, new parking areas

for commercial properties must be screened from adjacent residential property by sight-proof screening with fences, walls or dense vegetation at least six feet tall. Landscape screens are preferred, because they absorb carbon dioxide.

2.8 Fences and Walls

Policy: Preserve original or historic fences and fence walls. New fences should be of renewable materials such as wood, woven wire or brick. Vinyl fences are not appropriate.

Design Justification: Fence walls and fences historically marked property boundaries and may have shielded private areas from public view. Historic materials such as wire, wood and brick are compatible materials; vinyl materials introduce an incompatible artificial appearance.

Sustainability Justification: Preserving existing fences and fence walls saves resources. New wood fences constructed of lumber from managed forests represents use of a renewable resource. Petroleum-based vinyl fencing is not a sustainable material.

- 2.8.4: Fences and fence walls in back yards have more flexible requirements than those in side yards or those that are front yard facing because they are less visible from the public right-of-way.
- 2.8.5: Fences and fence walls are generally permitted in side, corner side, and back yards. Interior side and corner side yard fences and fence walls must be set back from the historic front building line by a distance not less than six feet. Depending on the materials and details of a fence and fence wall, additional requirements of this section may apply.
- 2.8.6: A fence or fence wall located on the street facing side yard of a corner property must be set back from the inner edge of a public sidewalk by a minimum distance of two feet, or six feet from the curb where there is no sidewalk.
- 2.8.8: Fences shall be located behind any open front porch of the main building AND the open front porch of the main building of any adjacent property.
- 2.8.9: Fences and fence walls shall be located at or behind the front 40% of the side yard of the main building unless the fence or fence wall is 75% transparent not including posts or columns spaced a minimum of eight feet apart. Depending on the design and architecture of the main building, additional requirements of this section may apply.
- 2.8.10: Opaque fences and fence walls, those that are less than 75% transparent not including posts or columns space a minimum of eight feet apart, shall not obscure view of significant architectural features of the primary building on the property, such as a bay window, porte-cochere, or other significant character defining building projection or feature.

- 2.8.12: Fences and fence walls shall not exceed eight feet in height at the back property line or alley.
- 2.8.13: Fences and fence walls shall not exceed six feet in height on side or front facing locations.
- 2.8.16: Acceptable materials for fences and fence walls are wood, brick, stone, cast iron, iron, chain link, twisted wire, painted aluminum that mimics the appearance of cast iron or iron fences, or a combination of these materials. Materials for fences and fence walls should be consistent with materials historically used at each individual property or within the historic district during the period of significance.
- 2.8.17: Wood fences may be left unfinished or painted or stained in colors appropriate to the style and period of the property or the district. The exterior flat fence or fence wall surface, if painted, should be compatible with the color of the main building.
- 2.8.19: Tops of new fences or fence walls may be horizontal, stepped, scooped, arched or parallel with the grade, as appropriate to the style and period of the main building or the historic district.
- 2.8.21: The side of a fence or wall facing the street or alley shall be the “finished” side.

4.5 Accessory Buildings

Policy: Accessory buildings could have been very modest, simple rectangular buildings such as barns, garages or outbuildings with one large opening for an overhead or sliding garage door or more ornate children’s playhouse, workshops or carriage houses with materials and details that matched the main building. Garages are addressed separately in the preceding section within this chapter.

The retention of existing, accessory buildings is encouraged. Refurbishment and modifications to historic accessory buildings is preferred to demolition and replacement. New accessory buildings are permitted where necessary, and they should have their own form. However, they should appear as secondary structures and not visually overwhelm or compete with the property’s other historic buildings.

Design Justification: The way in which new accessory buildings relate to other historic buildings of a property is important in historic districts. A new accessory building directly affects the integrity of the property as a whole. Therefore, a new accessory building should not detract from the historic character of the property.

Sustainability Justification: New accessory building design and construction should adhere to principles of sustainability in materials, design, and energy efficiency.

- 4.5.5: The appearance and location of a new accessory building should be based on the appearance of the historic accessory building if such existed. Use historic photographs and other documentation such as Sanborn Fire Insurance

maps for guidance as to size and location of a previous accessory building on the property.

- 4.5.6: If documentation of a historical accessory building at the site is not available, the size, design and location of a new accessory building should be in keeping with other accessory buildings in the block and historic district.
- 4.5.7: Accessory buildings should be located in the back yard.
- 4.5.8: Design of new accessory buildings shall be secondary to that of the main historic building and should be secondary to the design of the property's historic garage.
- 4.5.9: Accessory buildings more than six feet tall should be compatible in size, scale, proportion, spacing, texture, setbacks, height, materials, color and detail to the main residential building. Additionally, new accessory buildings may relate to similar accessory buildings within the historic district.
- 4.5.10: Materials used at accessory buildings should reflect the use and function of the accessory building, and not necessarily that of the primary building. Materials used at exterior facades of accessory buildings were often different (simpler and less costly) than material used for the main building.
- 4.5.11: New accessory buildings shall follow the historic side and back yard setback patterns of other accessory buildings on the property, in the block or in the historic district.

- c. Considerations: The proposed parking lot meets applicable Guidelines for placement and screening and provides the amount of parking required in the SPUD. The applicant also proposes to widen the curb cut into the parking lot to 16 feet. Within the parking lot aisle, concrete pads with gravel between are proposed in order to allow for more permeability. Landscape screening is also required and is addressed under a separate item.

The Guidelines do not specifically address the installation of parking covers at multi-family residential or commercial parking lots, but state that accessory buildings should be located at the rear of a property, secondary to the primary structure, and should use materials that reflect their use and function, among other factors. As proposed, the parking covers are located at the rear of the buildings and are set in approximately 16 feet from the east edge of the building, making them less prominent as viewed from the street. The proposed parking covers are modest, metal structures that will be partially screened by the proposed fencing and the buildings themselves.

The dumpster enclosure meets applicable requirements for building materials but is located in an alley at the east side of the parking lot. This will require a revocable permit, and will also trigger requirements pertaining to methods of construction, so that it could be easily removed if the City needed accessed to underground utilities that remain. In addition, the placement of the dumpster appears to require a truck to either back in or back out of the parking lot, which would entail maneuvering in the public right-of-way and require a variance. The applicant may wish to consider alternative locations for the dumpster.

The proposed fence appears to meet applicable Guidelines for fencing, except that the fence sits forward of the front porch of the neighboring property to the south, based on submitted drawings. The Guidelines state that fencing should be located behind the front porch of neighboring properties.

d. Recommended Specific Findings:

1. That the proposed parking lot meets the requirements of SPUD-01581 and applicable Historic Preservation Guidelines;
2. That the Guidelines do not address the installation of parking covers in multi-family or commercial lots;
3. That, if considered as accessory structures, the proposed parking covers are minimal in appearance and will have no adverse effect upon the surrounding properties or district;
4. That the proposed dumpster enclosure meets applicable Guidelines but requires a revocable permit and may require additional permissions or exceptions;
5. That the proposed fence meets applicable Guidelines for materials and height but is located forward of the location supported by the Guidelines and may adversely affect the property directly to the south.

3. Item 5, Install wood fencing at west and south side of property (elective); Item 11, Install artificial turf (elective); and Item 12, Install landscaping (elective).

- a. Description: The applicant proposes the installation of 4 foot tall wood fencing at the west side of the property and a 6 foot tall fence starting at the west side of the parking lot and extending down the south property line. The proposed fencing at the west side extends to the front wall of the proposed structure. Within the proposed fencing along both the east and west sides of the building, the applicant proposes the installation of artificial turf. In addition to the turf, extensive landscaping is proposed throughout the site. Landscaping also includes the installation of street trees along NW 30th and N Hudson.
- b. References: *Design and Sustainability Standards and Guidelines for Oklahoma City Historic Districts*

2.7 Plants and Planting Recommendations

Policy: Landscaping with trees and plants generally does not require Certificate of Appropriateness review. However, it is recommended that mature planting patterns and designs be respected for their historic character, and that new trees and plants be placed so as not to obscure or damage, presently or in future, significant character-defining features of the property, primary structure or overall site.

Design Justification: Landscaping in the city's historic districts may include traditional patterns using hedges along property lines, shade trees in yards and indigenous plants. As landscape features mature they become more important aspects of a district's character. New trees in visually prominent locations should be selected and placed so as to not obscure a building's architectural character.

Sustainability Justification: Shade trees on south and west facing elevations can assist in cooling buildings in summer. Native deciduous trees can provide shade; evergreens can provide wind breaks. Use native species that are acclimated to local weather conditions including hot summers and harsh winters. Use of drought-tolerant plant species minimizes watering requirements.

- 2.7.1 Consult the bibliography in Appendix C for resources including “Putting Down Roots: Landscape Guidelines for the Selection, Care and Maintenance of Trees in Central Oklahoma.”
- 2.7.2 Maintain plantings, especially native species that reflect patterns of historic use.
- 2.7.3 Shade trees can enhance a property’s setting and improve a building’s energy efficiency.
- 2.7.4: Selection of new trees and plantings should reflect the historic landscape design appropriate for the historic property and building.
- 2.7.5 Landscaping should be appropriate to the historic building and neighborhood and enhance the building and its surroundings.
- 2.7.6: Placement and species of street tree should be coordinated so as to not obscure or conflict with existing or proposed street lighting.
- 2.7.7: Existing mature trees should be protected and maintained including limbing up, removing volunteers (growth that springs up without being deliberately planted), and consulting a professional arborist to help ensure the continued tree health.
- 2.7.8: Selection of new landscape stock should take into consideration local seasonal extremes. Native plants better tolerate local conditions and usually require less supplemental watering.
- 2.7.9: Collect rainwater in cisterns and rain barrels via gutters and downspouts to use for irrigation and watering. Conceal cisterns with landscaping.
- 2.7.10: Install a drip irrigation system in landscape beds to conserve water better than hand or irrigation watering. Don’t use potable water to run irrigation systems.
- 2.7.11: A properly designed, installed, and maintained irrigation system conserves water usage better than hand watering. Set the irrigation controller to run the system during early morning hours to decrease evaporation and risk of biological growth on building materials.
- 2.7.12: Install an irrigation shut-off device that detects rain and freezing conditions. Prevent the irrigation system from watering when not needed. Adjust spray nozzles to deliver water only to planted areas that need it and restrict wasteful run-off on driveways and walkways.
- 2.7.13: Thoughtful maintenance of lawn areas will also help conserve water

usage. Do not mow grass too short. Close-cut grass dries out and wilts, therefore requiring more watering.

- 2.7.14: Select grass types that are drought-resistant. Some drought-tolerant grasses include native Buffalo grass, Tall Fescue and Bermuda.
- 2.7.15: An alternative to turf in yards is drought-tolerant landscaping. Alternatives for lawn areas can include any combination of hardy, low-growing ground-covers (clover, ivy, mondo grass, thyme, sedum), juniper shrubs, yucca, ornamental grasses, butterfly gardens, water-permeable paths of pea gravel, water gardens, wildflowers, and decorative rocks.

Also see 2.8, Fences and Walls, above.

- c. Considerations: The proposed fencing at the west side extends to the front wall of the proposed structure, which is not supported by the Guidelines. The Guidelines require even transparent fencing to be set back at least 6 feet from the front wall of the structure, and solid fencing to be set back 40% of the length of the side yard. Rendering suggest that this fencing may actually be a transparent wrought-iron style fence; confirmation of the material and justification for the placement may be required.

The Guidelines do not address artificial turf as a landscape material, but may raise concerns regarding permeability, depending on method of installation. The proposed locations are small and will be screened from public view by fencing and natural landscaping and may have minimal impact on the project.

The HP Guidelines do not include detailed requirements for landscaping, but the landscaping must meet requirements in the Municipal Code, including provisions related to landscaping at parking lots, and provisions captured in the SPUD itself. The applicant has provided landscape plans and landscape point calculations that meet these requirements.

- d. Recommended Specific Findings:
1. That the proposed fencing appears to meet applicable Guidelines for material and height but does not meet requirements for fence placement;
 2. That the proposed artificial turf is not addressed in the Guidelines, but may have minimal impact due to the limited quantity and visibility;
 3. That proposed landscaping is supported by the Guidelines and will be an enhancement to the proposed project but may need to meet additional specifications per the Municipal Code;
 4. That the proposed street trees do not meet the requirements of SPUD-01581 and should be revised.

E. STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

1. **Approve HPCA-24-00125 with unique circumstances and conditions** with the specific findings that the proposed work, with the **agreed-upon conditions**, will not have an adverse effect on the historic character of the district or property; that the following **unique circumstances** exist; that the items do not strictly comply with all relevant Standards and Guidelines or are not addressed by them, but are nonetheless consistent with the spirit and

intent of the Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings:

Item 1, Construct two multi-family residential structures:

1. That the proposed development utilizes materials that meet applicable Guidelines, except that fiberglass windows and metal doors are not supported by the Guidelines;
2. That the proposed development conforms with the regulations established in SPUD-01581, including height, setback, and lot coverage;
3. That the proposed development meets applicable Guidelines for height, setback, and spacing between buildings, except that the east side setback appears to extend beyond the setback of the neighboring property to the south;
4. That the proposed development incorporates architectural styles, features, and building forms that are present at surrounding properties in the districts, are appropriate to the use and scale of the property, and are compatible with the historic character of the surrounding properties and districts;
5. That the proposed development deviates from the character of the block and surrounding area in its width and horizontality;
6. That the proportions of the proposed development, though distinct from those of surrounding properties, make reference to the bulk and mass of the previous structure at the site and may also reference similarly configured historic residential “courtyard” structures throughout Oklahoma City’s historic districts;
7. That the proposed development is compatible with, yet differentiated from, and not imitative of, the surrounding historic properties.

Item 2, Install surface parking lot, Item 3, Install parking covers at portion of surface parking lot, Item 4, Construct dumpster enclosure in closed alley (revocable permit required); Item 7, Install fence and gate at east side of property, parking lot, Item 8, Replace and widen curb cut at east side of property, and Item 9, Install concrete pads with gravel between in parking lot.

1. That the proposed parking lot meets the requirements of SPUD-01581 and applicable Historic Preservation Guidelines;
2. That the Guidelines do not address the installation of parking covers in multi-family or commercial lots;
3. That, if considered as accessory structures, the proposed parking covers are minimal in appearance and will have no adverse effect upon the surrounding properties or district;
4. That the proposed dumpster enclosure meets applicable Guidelines but requires a revocable permit and may require additional permissions or exceptions;
5. That the proposed fence meets applicable Guidelines for materials and height but is located forward of the location supported by the Guidelines and may adversely affect the property directly to the south.

Item 5, Install wood fencing at west and south side of property; Item 11, Install artificial turf; and Item 12, Install landscaping:

1. That the proposed fencing appears to meet applicable Guidelines for material and height but does not meet requirements for fence placement;
2. That the proposed artificial turf is not addressed in the Guidelines, but may have minimal impact due to the limited quantity and visibility;
3. That proposed landscaping is supported by the Guidelines and will be an enhancement to the proposed project but may need to meet additional specifications per the Municipal Code;
4. That the proposed street trees do not meet the requirements of SPUD-01581 and should be revised.

Item 6, Wrought-iron style fencing:

1. The proposed fence appears to meet all applicable Standards and Guidelines and is compatible with the proposed development and the surrounding historic district.

Item 10, Concrete walkways:

1. That the proposed sidewalks appear to be consistent with applicable Standards and Guidelines and will have no adverse effect on the character of the property or historic district.

Conditions:

1. That the applicant provide alternative window specifications that meet applicable Guidelines;
2. That the applicant revise the placement and/or material of the screen wall at the north east corner of the property so as to comply with sight distance triangle requirements;
3. That the applicant provide revised documentation showing modified placement of the east parking lot fence and gate so as not to protrude beyond the front porch of the neighboring property;
4. That the applicant obtain a revocable permit and any other necessary permissions for the placement, installation, and use of the dumpster enclosure;
5. That the applicant provide revised documentation clarifying the design and materials of all fencing specific to each fencing installation and incorporating transparency at the west side, front portion of the development;
6. That the applicant provide verification that all applicable landscaping requirements for the development of the site and parking lot have been met, including placement of street trees.

Unique Circumstances:

1. That the side setback at the east elevation extends beyond the front setback of the neighboring property to the south but is minimally impactful due to the distance between the subject building and neighboring property;
2. That four-foot-tall transparent fencing at the northwest corner of the property would

not meet the Guidelines for administrative approval of a fence, but will function as a patio enclosure and will have no adverse effect on the character of the property or district.

OR

2. **Continue HPCA-24-00125** with the specific finding that additional information is required from the applicant in order to determine whether the action requested is consistent with all relevant Standards and Guidelines and are in compliance with the relevant sections of the Municipal Code, 2020*, as referenced in the Staff Report.

Specific Findings: See above.

Additional information: Revised documentation to address revisions as noted in the staff report or as directed by the Historic Preservation Commission.

Note: Staff recommendation does not constitute Commission action.

**Relevant Sections of Chapter 59 the Oklahoma City Municipal Code governing HP/HL Districts are: §59.3300.1-5; §59.4150.4; §59.4250; §59.7250.1-4; §59.7300.1-7; §59.12200.1-4; §59.13300.1-6.*

Copies of the Standards/Guidelines and Relevant Sections of the Oklahoma City Municipal Code, 2020, are available online at www.okc.gov/planning/hp/index.html ; at Planning Department offices located at 420 W. Main, 9th floor, and each HP Commission Meeting.

KMF